Stanford University Library
APR
10
1903

The University of Chicago
FOUNDED BY JOHN D. ROCKEFELLER

THE KINGDOM OF GOD IN THE WRITINGS OF THE FATHERS

A DISSERTATION

SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF THE GRADUATE DIVINITY SCHOOL IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

(DEPARTMENT OF THEOLOGY)

BY
HENRY MARTYN HERRICK

CHICAGO
1903

STANFORD UNIVERSITY LIBRARIES

3781
C53H
UNCLASSED

The University of Chicago
FOUNDED BY JOHN D. ROCKEFELLER

THE KINGDOM OF GOD IN THE WRITINGS OF THE FATHERS

A DISSERTATION

SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF THE GRADUATE DIVINITY SCHOOL IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

(DEPARTMENT OF THEOLOGY)

BY
HENRY MARTYN HERRICK

CHICAGO
1903

PRINTED AT THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO PRESS

Regnum fulgebit in regno, cum regno venerit regnum, quod nunc oramus, et dicimus: Veniat regnum tuum. Haec ergo domus Dei, hoc templum Dei, hoc regnum Dei, regnumque coelorum adhuc aedificatur, adhuc fabricatur, adhuc paratur, adhuc congregatur.

—AUGUSTINE, *Tractate on John*, 68, 2.

PREFACE.

This treatise upon the kingdom of God is based upon the Christian writings of the patristic age, from Clement of Rome to John of Damascus. These writings have been studied exegetically and historically in the standard English translations, with reference, when necessary, to the original text. The editions used are the following:

1. *The Ante-Nicene Fathers*, in twenty-four volumes, published by T. & T. Clark.

2. Lightfoot's *Apostolic Fathers, Greek and English*, one volume.

3. The *Supplementary Volume* (Vol. IX) of the reprint of the Clark edition, published by the Christian Literature Co. of New York.

4. *The Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers*, in twenty-eight volumes; also published by the Christian Literature Co. (now by the Scribners). Series 1 contains fourteen volumes, of which eight are of Augustine and six of Chrysostom.

These volumes, about fifty in number, contain the most important writings of the patristic age. Of many Fathers all the extant works are given, and of the others, with hardly an exception, sufficient of their writings to afford a reliable estimate of their views of the kingdom.

One supplemental work I have found to be of great value—the *Catena Aurea* of Thomas Aquinas, in the Oxford edition of eight volumes. Of this work the *Encyclopædia Britannica* says that "under the form of a commentary on the gospels, it was really an exhaustive summary of the theological teaching of the greatest Fathers of the church." It not only confirms many patristic references to the kingdom, but apparently gathers in addition all the important references (which are, of course, not numerous) not included in the volumes named above.

A list of the references to the kingdom in these volumes of the Fathers (3,974 in number, including 1,410 scriptural quotations) is given at the end.

CONTENTS.

PAGE

CHAPTER I—Introduction - - - - - - - - 9

PERIOD I.

CHAPTER II—The Apostolic Fathers - - - - - 15

PERIOD II. THE ANTE-NICENE FATHERS SUBSEQUENT TO THE APOSTOLIC.

A. GREEK.

CHAPTER III—Justin Martyr, Irenæus, and Hippolytus - - 21
CHAPTER IV—Clement of Alexandria, Origen, and Methodius - 25
CHAPTER V—The Apocryphal Writings, the Apostolic Constitutions, and the Clementines - - - - 30
CHAPTER VI—The Liturgies and Minor Greek Fathers - - 35

B. LATIN.

CHAPTER VII—Tertullian and Cyprian - - - - - 38
CHAPTER VIII—Lactantius and the Minor Latin Fathers - - 43

PERIOD III. THE NICENE AND POST-NICENE FATHERS.

A. GREEK.

CHAPTER IX—The Historians: Eusebius, Socrates, Sozomen, and Theodoret - - - - - - - 46
CHAPTER X—Athanasius - - - - - - - - - 49
CHAPTER XI—Ephraem Syrus, and Aphrahat - - - - 52
CHAPTER XII—Basil, Cyril of Jerusalem, Gregory Nazianzen, and Gregory of Nyssa - - - - - - 55
CHAPTER XIII—Chrysostom - - - - - - - - 61
CHAPTER XIV—John of Damascus - - - - - - 66

B. LATIN.

CHAPTER XV—Hilary - - - - - - - - - 68
CHAPTER XVI—Ambrose - - - - - - - - - 71
CHAPTER XVII—Jerome, Rufinus, Sulpitius, and Vincent - - 74
CHAPTER XVIII—Augustine - - - - - - - - - 78
CHAPTER XIX—Cassian - - - - - - - - - 92
CHAPTER XX—Leo the Great and Gregory the Great - - - 96
CHAPTER XXI—Additional References from the *Catena Aurea* - 98
CHAPTER XXII—Summary and Conclusion - - - - - 100
TABLES - - - - - - - - - - - - - 107
INDEX OF REFERENCES - - - - - - - - - 109

CHAPTER I.

INTRODUCTION.

WHAT was understood by the kingdom of God in the early Christian centuries? To what extent was the New Testament usage followed, and wherein was it departed from? Did the Fathers, on the whole, preserve the great idea and hand it down, or did they lose it?

It is a notable fact that in the patristic age there seems to be no separate treatise upon the kingdom of God. The nearest approach to such a treatise is Augustine's great work *De Civitate Dei*, in which he gives a Christian philosophy of history. To him the kingdom of God is the divine government as realized in the church — the church which is ideal and historical, in heaven and on earth, and consists of angels and of men, of Israel first and then of the gentiles. This idea is evidently at a wide remove from the primary views of the New Testament. The doctrine of the kingdom, like the kingdom itself, may be said to work like leaven, rather than to stand forth from the outset as a formal and definite article of the Christian faith. An indication of this appears in Jerome's *Illustrious Men*. In his list of 135 writers he mentions about 240 subjects upon which they have written (omitting many of those best known to his readers), besides many commentaries and letters. Gennadius adds 99 men to the list, and about 220 titles. Of these 460 treatises not one is upon the kingdom of God. But many of the best thoughts of the early centuries cluster around this theme, scattered throughout the whole range of the literature, and possibly no other theme is more suggestive as a key to patristic views of Christianity.

A brief statement of the teaching of Jesus and the apostles concerning the kingdom is a necessary starting-point. Although Jesus made the kingdom the predominant theme of the gospel, he did not define it. He adopted the word from the current Jewish teaching, and gave it a new meaning. "The bond that unites the Old Testament with the New, the religion of Israel

with the gospel, is the idea of the kingdom of God. It is to come, and yet it is a present reality. It is in the souls of men; it is a living force in the bosom of society."[1] The dream of the earlier prophets, that the nation, and then mankind, would become obedient to the will of Jehovah; the individualism of Jeremiah, Ezekiel, and the sages; the visions of Daniel the seer—are all combined into a splendid ideal in the teaching of Jesus concerning the kingdom. Speaking in parables whose meaning was often purposely veiled, he emphasized the inner, mysterious nature of the kingdom more than its obvious features. The word "kingdom" is abstract in the sense of reign or dominion—of power in the universe, of grace in the soul;[2] and concrete in the sense of realm, or the subjects reigned over. The word in the abstract sense occurs but rarely in the New Testament. The kingdom of God usually means the company of believers, the Christian society. Yet its domain is first of all in the individual soul. It is dynamic before it is static, spiritual rather than formal. Before the Christian society is possible, souls must be renewed.

Meyer, throughout his commentaries, maintains that the kingdom of God always signifies nothing else than the Messiah's kingdom, the erection of which begins with the parousia, belonging not to "this world," but to "the world to come" (on Rom. 14:17; *cf.* on 1 Cor. 4:20). On Luke 17:21 he defends the translation "the kingdom of God is among you," and claims that the kingdom of God as an ethical condition of the soul is a modern idea, not historico-biblical. But an idea is not modern which the Fathers uniformly find in Luke 17:21, translating it correctly "the kingdom of God is within you," and in several instances applying with exceptional force its teaching that the kingdom of God is in the soul.

The idea of the kingdom as involving eternal life seems traceable in Mark 9:45 and 47; probably, also, in Luke 18:18 and 24, and John 3:3 and 15. The kingdom of God (synonymous with the kingdom of heaven) and of Christ is one, Matt. 13:43; John

[1] See FISHER, *History of Christian Doctrine*, pp. 23–5; FREMANTLE, *The World as the Subject of Redemption*, p. 38.

[2] *Cf.* the Lutheran and Reformed Confessions.

18:36; Eph. 5:5. As to the relation of the kingdom to the church, the only passage in the New Testament bearing directly upon it (Matt. 16:17–19) is indeterminate. This passage is peculiar to Matthew, but is evidently an original utterance of Jesus. The idea of the kingdom is apparently here embodied by Jesus in the church as the form whereby or wherein the kingdom is to reach its goal. The institution which Jesus chooses as the distinctive, visible form of the kingdom, to consist of men of rock-like faith such as Peter's, is to continue unvanquished by the death of its members. The earthly decrees of Peter in regard to the kingdom, as represented by the church, shall be valid in heaven.

The disciples thought that they understood the mysteries of the kingdom (Matt. 13:51), but only after Pentecost did they begin really to grasp them. Answering their inquiries about the kingdom (Acts 1:6 f.) the Lord said: "Ye shall receive power, when the Holy Ghost is come upon you; and ye shall be my witnesses." Led by the Spirit, the disciples directed their energies to proclaiming the gospel of the kingdom, and the kingdom increased visibly in the growth of the churches. Still looking for the speedy return of Jesus, they anticipated with his appearing the consummation of the kingdom.

Besides the emergence of the church in the days of the apostles, which to some extent overshadowed the thought of the kingdom, there was a progress of doctrine which in part transferred the center of their thought and preaching from the kingdom to the king. This is in the Fathers frequently carried to the length of identifying Christ and the kingdom. The new point of view is manifest in comparing the discourses in Acts with the parables of Jesus. Three times in Acts "the things concerning the kingdom" are significantly combined with "the things concerning Jesus" (8:12; 28:23, 31). Only after Pentecost did a definite Christology arise; but from that time it began at once to reveal the dynamic which established the eternal life of the kingdom in men's souls, and thereby in their relations with one another promoted the fraternal life of the church.

But as time went on, and Jesus did not return, while members

of the new society were being removed by death, an adjustment in their thought of the kingdom became inevitable. Especially would the persecutions, as they increased, tend to make transcendental the views of the kingdom, as to the nature of its conquest of the world, and the time and place of its full realization. The general tone of the thirty-two references to the kingdom in the New Testament outside the gospels is eschatological, the thought of the kingdom as a present reality being merged in the form of the church. The expectation seemed to be that when Christ appeared in judgment on the earth the kingdom would be set up to continue, possibly, on a regenerated earth, though, at last, not under the control of the Christ, but of God the Father.

The Apocalypse, with its vivid portrayal of the times of persecution and of triumph, would give important testimony as to the changing idea of the kingdom, if we knew its author and its origin. The millennial ideas of the patristic age seem to have sifted through the Apocalypse from the Old Testament, especially Daniel, but met with strong opposition and proved evanescent. The idea of a millennium, however, whether as a transformation of earth into heaven, or as a representation of, or prelude to, the heavenly consummation, has vitality, and recurs at different epochs; one phase of it notably in our day in writings of which Fremantle's *The World as the Subject of Redemption* is typical.

The following plan exhibits the New Testament usage of the term "kingdom of God" or its equivalent, with the most important references, some of which might be otherwise grouped.

I. *God's reign—the abstract idea.*—Matt. 6:10, 33; Luke 1:33 (Luke 17:21; Rom. 14:17; 1 Cor. 4:20).

II. *God's realm—the concrete reality:* the community of saints, or the ideal society of men as brothers because sons of a common Father.

(1) *As an order of things already present or impending* (indefinite as to time, Acts 1:6f.; as to place, Luke 17:37): Matt. 3:2; 4:23; 5:3, 10; 12:28; 18:23; 19:12; 20:1; 21:43; 22:2; 25:1; Luke 19:11; Acts 1:6; Heb. 12:28.

(2) *With special reference to its personal constituency and social nature.* Matt. 5:19, 20; 8:12; 11:11, 12; chap. 13; 19:14, 23, 24; 21:31; 23:13; Acts 14:22; 1 Cor. 15:24. Its origin, growth, and process, John 18:36; Matt. 13; Mark 4:26f. Conditions of entering and remaining, John 3:3, 5; Matt. 18:1—4; Luke 9:62.

(3) *As having bounds or limits, and thus suggesting organized form.* Matt. 16:19 marks the point of attachment for the idea of the church as the kingdom. Possibly Matt. 13:41 is a point of connection with the millennial idea.

(4) *As future, but not definitely eschatological.* Matt. 16:28; Mark 9:1; Matt. 20:21; 26:29; Mark 9:47 (*cf.* 45); Luke 21:31; 22:16, 30; 23:51.

(5) *Eschatological, associated with the parousia and the last judgment.* Matt. 7:21; 8:11; 13:43; 25:34; Luke 23:42; 1 Cor. 6:9, 10; Gal. 5:21; Eph. 5:5; 1 Cor. 15:50; Col. 4:11; 1 Thess. 2:12; 2 Thess. 1:5; 2 Tim. 4:1, 18; Jas. 2:5; 2 Pet. 1:11; Rev. 12:10. In certain of these later references the kingdom is apparently anticipated as about to exist in heaven after the parousia. The thought of Christ's kingdom as now existing in the celestial world, into which the believer enters at death, does not appear in New Testament times.

Thus the kingdom of God in the New Testament is a complex idea, the emphasis falling now upon one, now upon another of its several phases. In general it may be said that the kingdom is personal and social, and, when the idea of time enters in, usually eschatological. The various connotations of the idea in the Fathers are usually traceable to Scriptural references as the points of departure.

In the present work the Fathers are considered in chronological order, arranged in groups of Greek and Latin in each of the three periods. There is in general no sharp line of demarcation between the second and third periods, in the current ideas of the kingdom, and the same may be said of the Greek and Latin churches. Of each writer the references he makes to the kingdom are characterized somewhat in detail and as a whole, with

quotation of those which seem most important. The number of references quoted (out of the whole number of nearly four thousand) is between five and six hundred, representing about fifty Fathers and over one hundred and seventy-five works. In the supplement several tables are given, showing the distribution of references to the kingdom among the Fathers, together with their use of Scripture.

PERIOD I.—THE APOSTOLIC FATHERS.

CHAPTER II.

CLEMENT OF ROME, in the first certain reference to the kingdom after the apostolic age, says that the apostles went forth with the glad tidings that the kingdom of God was about to come (*Epistle to the Corinthians*, 42). The righteous dead dwell in the abode of the pious; and they shall be manifest in the visitation[1] of the kingdom of God (50). These references regard the kingdom as eschatological. In chap. 54 citizenship in the kingdom is spoken of proleptically, in the sense given it by Paul in "our citizenship is in heaven": "This have they done and will do, who live as citizens of that kingdom of God which bringeth no regrets;"[2] but the kingdom itself is eschatological.

The ancient homily by an unknown author, the so-called *Second Epistle of Clement*, has several references to the kingdom as a place of future rest or blessedness. "And ye know, brethren, that the sojourn of this flesh in this world is mean and for a short time, but the promise of Christ is great and marvelous, even the rest of the kingdom that shall be and of life eternal" (5). Twice the word *βασίλειον*, royal palace or seat of empire, is used instead of *βασιλεία*. "With what confidence shall we, if we keep not our baptism pure and undefiled, enter into *τὸ βασίλειον* of God?" (6). "The unbelievers shall be amazed when they see the kingdom of the world given to Jesus" (17).[3] This does not necessarily involve the conversion of the world. In sec. 12 occurs the important passage: "Let us therefore await the kingdom of God betimes in love and righteousness, since we know not the day of God's appearing. For the Lord himself, being asked by a certain person when his kingdom would come, said: 'When the two shall be one, and the outside as the inside, etc. These things if ye do', saith he, 'the kingdom of my father shall come.'" Here the kingdom of

[1] ἐπισκοπῇ. [2] οἱ πολιτευόμενοι τὴν ἀμεταμέλητον πολιτείαν τοῦ θεοῦ.

[3] τὸ βασίλειον τοῦ κόσμου ἐν τῷ Ἰησοῦ.

Christ is identical with the kingdom of God, and the time of its coming, though future, may be imminent, and is to some extent conditioned on human conduct. "If therefore we shall have wrought righteousness in the sight of God, we shall enter into his kingdom and receive the promises which ear hath not heard nor eye seen," etc. (9). Whether it shall come in and with this doing of righteousness, or as a consequent reward, the ethical relation is important. These passages are clearly eschatological.

In sec. 14: "The Books and the Apostles plainly declare that the church exists, not now for the first time, but hath been from the beginning; for it was spiritual, ... and was manifested in the last days . . . . in the flesh of Christ." By these and other mystical expressions we are reminded of Hilary's view of the kingdom of Christ in his flesh, and of Augustine's *De Civitate Dei*, which is both kingdom and church.

In the so-called *Epistle of Barnabas*, which is variously dated from 70 to 182 A. D., and so may be earlier than Clement, it is said that he that doeth righteousness shall be glorified in the kingdom of God (21). "They that desire to see me, and to attain unto my kingdom, must lay hold on me through tribulation and affliction" (7). If we relax our efforts, and slumber over our sins, there is danger lest "the prince of evil receive power against us and thrust us out from the kingdom of the Lord," apparently from attaining unto it. It is mystically declared that "the kingdom of Jesus is on the cross, and they who set their hope on him shall live forever" (8). It is said in the same section that "in his kingdom there shall be evil days, in which we shall be saved," which seems to involve an earthly experience, perhaps millennial. There is a temple of God in renewed human hearts, a spiritual temple built up in his name in place of the Jewish temple (16). The church, rather than the kingdom, is probably here in mind.

In the *Didaché*, or *Teaching of the Apostles*, the following prayer, with slight variations, occurs twice: "May thy church be gathered together from the ends of the earth into thy kingdom, which thou hast prepared for it" (9 and 10).

Thus in the earliest patristic reference to the church and the kingdom together, they are clearly distinguished from each other. The kingdom is still future and eschatological with implied reference to Matt. 25 : 34 ; but nothing is indicated as to the place of its manifestation. The thought may be that the church as a whole is to have place in the kingdom ; as Cyprian speaks of the church as "that which shall reign there." Twice in quoting the Lord's Prayer the closing words read : "For thine is the power and the glory," omitting "kingdom."

In the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*, which may possibly be a Jewish, rather than Christian, writing, two or three general references occur : "The Lord sware to me with an oath that the kingdom should never fail from me" (*Judah*, 23). "His kingdom an everlasting kingdom" (*Joseph*, 19). "The kingdom of the Lord shall not be among you, for he will forthwith take it away" (*Benjamin*, 9).

The *Shepherd of Hermas* is written in a style so highly figurative and involved as to be often obscure. The *Visions* and *Similitudes* center around the building of a tower which is repeatedly declared to be the church (*Vis.* 3.3 ; *Sim.* 9. 13). But in the voluminous discussions centering about this idea, the kingdom of God seems frequently to be synonymous with the church.

The church was created before all things (*Vis.* 2.4). "But the tower in building is the church ; ye shall be purified, and shall be useful as stones for its building. The white portion is the coming age, in which the elect of God shall dwell" (4. 3). Life is for all that keep the commandments of the Lord : all the righteous and repentant have their dwelling within the tower. The penitent had their dwelling placed within the first walls, and some of them even ascended into the tower (*Sim.* 8. 7 ; 8. 10 ; 8. 6).

The tower is built upon the rock and upon the gate : it is made a single stone with the rock (9. 15, 13). This rock and gate is the Son of God ; the rock is ancient and the gate recent : being made recent in the manifestation of Christ, that they who are to be saved may enter through it into the kingdom of God.

Only the stones which come through the gate go to the building of the tower; thus no one shall enter into the kingdom of God, except he receive the name of his Son. The builders of the tower are angels, by whom the Lord is walled about. But the gate is the Son of God; there is this one entrance to the Lord, to the kingdom of God (9.12). Those who believe shall become one spirit and one body (9.13).

But some, having been placed in the tower, after a time were enticed, and were cast away from the house of God. There was therefore a cessation in the building, that, if these repent, they may go into the building of the tower; thus God "restored our life" (9.14). The evil shall be cast out and the church of God purified; there shall be one body of them that are purified, just as the tower when purified became made as it were of one stone. It is hard for such as go astray to enter into the kingdom of God; but, if they repent and do good, they shall live unto God. Let them do so speedily, before the tower is completed. The righteous dwell, without doubt, in the kingdom of God. But the other stones, which have remained round and have not been fitted into the building, have been put back into their place. For this world and its vanities must be cut from off them, and then they will fit into the kingdom of God (9.16, 18, 20, 26, 29, 31). The last statement is obviously a reference to the tower, or church, under the name of the kingdom.

There is thus in the *Shepherd* no distinct and consistent idea of the kingdom; but it is significant that this composition, which was long treated as a part of Scripture and had large influence upon later Fathers, so closely interweaves the idea of the church with that of the kingdom as to make them practically interchangeable. The most important note of time as connected with the kingdom is the urgent call to repent before the completion of the tower. To enter into the kingdom is parallel with living unto God. The figure of the building recalls Paul's temple of God, and Peter's living stones built upon the Rock.

Ignatius declares in his *Epistle to the Philippians*, 3: "If any

man followeth one that maketh a schism, he doth not inherit the kingdom of God." In the *Martyrdom of Ignatius* (perhaps genuine) he is reported as saying: "the only-begotten Son of God, whose kingdom may I enjoy" (2). POLYCARP, *Ep. to the Philippians*, in secs. 2 and 5, quotes 1 Cor. 6:10, and Matt. 5:3 and 10 in part both apparently with an eschatological reference. The Smyrnæans pray in *The Martyrdom of Polycarp*, 20: "May it be our lot to be found in the kingdom of Jesus Christ;" and in 22: "That the Lord Jesus Christ may gather me also with his elect into his heavenly kingdom." ARISTIDES says in the *Apology*, 16: "Verily this is the way of the truth which leads those who travel therein to the everlasting kingdom promised through Christ in the life to come." *The Epistle to Diognetus*, 9, very beautifully prays: "that . . . we might now be made deserving by the goodness of God, and having made clear our inability to enter into the kingdom of God by ourselves, might be enabled by the ability of God." This of itself might look like a reference to the kingdom as a present reality, but in the next section (10) the reference to the heavenly kingdom is plain: "For God loved men for whose sake he made the world, ... to whom he promised the kingdom which is in heaven, and will give it to those that have loved him." The references in this paragraph are to the kingdom as a place of future reward or bliss, either terrestrial (eschatological) or celestial. The second reference from the *Martyrdom of Polycarp* and the second from the *Epistle to Diognetus* are clearly celestial (*cf.* 2 Tim. 4:18): and the probability is somewhat strong that this is the prevailing reference of the group, it being regarded eschatologically and as even now existent in heaven.

The millennial notions of PAPIAS are found in fragments in other writers. Eusebius (*Ch. Hist.* 3.39) refers to the statements "of a somewhat mythical character, among which he says that there will be a period of some (ten) thousand years after the resurrection, and that the kingdom of Christ will be set up in material form on this earth. These ideas I suppose he got through a misunderstanding of the apostolic accounts," etc. Jerome, in his *Illustrious Men*, 18, speaks of Papias as

having promulgated the Jewish tradition of a millennium, teaching that after the resurrection the Lord will reign in the flesh with the saints. Irenæus also (*Heresies*, 5.33) quotes Papias as saying: "The days will come in which vines shall grow each having ten thousand shoots, and on each shoot ten thousand branches," etc. Maximus Confessor and Photius (Lightfoot, p. 534) refer to Papias as having mentioned material viands among the anticipated joys of the kingdom.

In the *Reliques of the Elders* preserved in Irenæus, 4. 27: "He said this (1 Cor. 6:9 f.), not to those who are without, but to us, lest we be cast out of the kingdom of God," etc. "Without" here seems to mean outside the Christian circle, and the kingdom to be the future state of reward on earth or in heaven. In 5. 36 gradations in the heavenly reward are indicated: "The Elders say that this is the distinction between the habitations of them that bring forth a hundred-fold, and of them that bring forth sixty and thirty: the first shall be taken up into the heavens, and the second shall dwell in Paradise, and the third shall inhabit the city; and that therefore our Lord said, 'In my Father's house are many mansions.'"

The apostolic Fathers contain fifty-two references to the kingdom, among which are ten quotations from the New Testament. The phrase "kingdom of God" occurs twenty-seven times, while "kingdom of heaven" is not used.[1] In this first period, extending to about 150 A. D., the view of the kingdom on the whole resembles that of the apostles, with notable development as to definiteness of place — on the one hand millennial on earth, on the other celestial. Indications of a possibly non-eschatological view of the kingdom linger apparently only in the *Shepherd*, in which there is that vague intermingling of the ideas of the kingdom and the church, which, as remarked above, was widely influential in later times.

[1] In the whole patristic period the phrase "kingdom of heaven" occurs three times where the phrase "kingdom of God" occurs twice; the relative usage in the Greek and Latin Fathers being much the same. See Schürer, *History of the Jewish People*, Div. 2, Vol. II, p. 171, and notes.

PERIOD II. THE ANTE-NICENE FATHERS SUBSEQUENT TO THE APOSTOLIC.

A.—GREEK.

CHAPTER III.

JUSTIN MARTYR, IRENÆUS, AND HIPPOLYTUS.

1. JUSTIN MARTYR, the great apologist of the second century, says in his *First Apology*, 11: "And when you hear that we look for a kingdom, you suppose, without making any inquiry, that we speak of a human kingdom; whereas we speak of that which is with God, as appears also from the confession.[1] For if we looked for a human kingdom, we should also deny our Christ, that we might not be slain . . . . But since our thoughts are not on the present, we are not concerned when men cut us off." Here the idea of the kingdom is eschatological. The kingdom is "with God," waiting to be manifested in the future. Only the regenerate shall see it (15. 61). In the *Dialogue with Trypho, the Jew*, the kingdom is treated as the millennium. "Christ is King, and is preached as having the everlasting kingdom; so I prove from all the Scriptures" (34). In chap. 39, Trypho says: "You have proved from the Scriptures that Christ must suffer, and come again with glory, and receive the eternal kingdom over all the nations, every kingdom being made subject to him; now show us that this man is He." In chap. 51, Justin says: "Christ preached also Himself, saying that the kingdom of heaven is at hand. . . . . Moreover, he referred to the fact that there would be no longer in your nation any prophet, and to the fact that men recognized that the new covenant, which God formerly (promised), was then present, *i. e.*, Christ himself; and in the following terms: 'The law and the prophets were until John; from that time the kingdom of heaven suffereth violence,'" etc. The main thought of this involved passage is that Christ is king: the kingdom is his. "There will be

[1] *Cf.* the confession in the Apos. Constitutions, p. 31.

a resurrection of the dead and a thousand years in Jerusalem; the everlasting and imperishable kingdom with Christ is to be enjoyed in this same land, a future possession for all the saints" (79. 117, 139).

Justin's idea of the kingdom is thus eschatological, in the millennial form.

2. In Irenæus, also, we find millennial views: Christ shall introduce an eternal kingdom, which is the resurrection of the just. In the times of the kingdom the righteous man on earth shall forget to die; there shall be an inheritance in the kingdom of the earth, foreseen by John (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, chaps. 26, 36). In the peaceful times of the kingdom the Spirit of God shall vivify and increase mankind (4. 20). And yet Christ's kingdom is now existent in heaven, for "he sent on before into his kingdom the infants slain at Bethlehem" (3. 16). It is also here on earth, for the "new treasure" of the kingdom in Matt. 13 : 52, is "the manner of life required by the gospel" (4. 9). Christ by the apostles announced that the kingdom of heaven had drawn nigh, and that he was dwelling within those that believe (3. 21). It is clear that those who disallow his salvation, and frame an idea of another God beside him who made the promise to Abraham, are outside the kingdom of God, blaspheming God, who introduces to the kingdom of heaven, through Jesus Christ, Abraham and his seed, the church (4. 8). The "violent" seize the kingdom by strong and earnest striving. The heavenly kingdom is honorable to those who have known the earthly one. The church, fashioned after the image of the Son, is designed to bring man to perfection (4. 37). By means of the earthly kingdom, which is the commencement of incorruptibleness, those who shall be worthy are accustomed gradually to receive God (*capere Deum*, 5. 22).

Irenæus thus recognized at least two kingdoms of Christ, the "heavenly" and the "earthly." It is not quite clear whether he thinks of the church as the earthly kingdom, or as one phase or portion of it. The earthly kingdom is either now existent in connection with the church; or, perhaps, to be first realized after the resurrection as the prelude to the eternal heavenly

kingdom. In the references cited from 4. 8 and 4. 9 Irenæus seems to regard the kingdom as in some sense the state of salvation.

3. Hippolytus, in the *Fragments on Daniel*, says: "There is nothing stable among men, but only that which is the appointed end of all things—the kingdom of God. In 500 years from the birth of Christ the end shall be." Commenting on 7: 17, he says: "After the fourth beast is removed, earthly things shall end, and heavenly things begin; that the indissoluble and everlasting kingdom of the saints may be brought to view, and the King coming from heaven as the world's judge;" and on 22: "He shall consume all with the eternal fire of punishment. But to his servants he will give an everlasting kingdom: *i. e.*, they shall possess the endless enjoyment of good." In his treatise *On Christ and Anti-Christ*, 5, he bids Christians: "Find out from the Scriptures what the conflagration of the whole world shall be, and what the glorious and heavenly kingdom of the saints is to be when they reign together with Christ." In the *Fragment on Daniel*, 7:27 f., he makes the Sabbath "the true type and emblem of the future kingdom of the saints, when Christ shall come from heaven and they shall reign with him, as John says in the Apocalypse," etc. In these references we observe that the kingdom is to ensue on the destruction of the earth. In the *Refutation of all Heresies*, Book 9, chap. 7, it is a future reward: "Thou shalt possess an immortal body, and receive the kingdom of heaven, thou who, while thou didst sojourn in life, didst know the Celestial King." It is significant that Hippolytus interprets the parable of the tares as referring to the church (Book 9, chap. 4).

In discussing and refuting the heretical notions of the Ophites (Book 5, chaps. 2–4), the following phrases, which indicate that the inner, subjective view of the kingdom was known among heretics, occur in obscure connection: "the kingdom of heaven to be sought for within a man," and "the kingdom of heaven that reposes within us as a treasure, as leaven hid in the meal." Perhaps the most curious definition of the kingdom to be found anywhere is in this quotation from the teaching of the sect just named: "That which is nothing, and which consists of nothing, inasmuch

as it is indivisible — a point — will become through its own reflective power a certain incomprehensible magnitude. This, he says, is the kingdom of heaven, the grain of mustard seed, the point which is indivisible in the body; and, he says, no one knows this [point] save the spiritual only."

CHAPTER IV.

CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA, ORIGEN, AND METHODIUS.

1. CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA. — The views of this church Father may be seen from the following quotations. "A stranger is permitted to enter the kingdom of heaven, when he is enrolled and made a citizen . . . . made an heir of God, to share God's kingdom with the Son. This is the first-born church . . . . these are the first-born enrolled in heaven, who hold high festival with angels" (*Exhortation to the Heathen*, chap. 9). He promises us the kingdom of heaven as a reward for learning (chap. 1). He is greatest in the kingdom who shall do and teach: imitating God in conferring like benefits (*Stromata*, 2. 19). It is to the violent that the kingdom of God belongs. The violent that storm the kingdom are not so in disputations; but by continuance in a right life and unceasing prayers are said to take it by force. For this alone is commendable violence, to take life from God by force (*Strom.* 4. 2: *Quis Dives*, 21). The least in the kingdom, *i. e.*, His own disciple, is greater than John. "Abandon the alien possessions that are in thy soul, that, becoming pure in heart, thou mayest see God, which is another way of saying: Enter into the kingdom of heaven" (*Quis Dives*, 31 and 19).

In these references the idea of the kingdom as the Christian community is conspicuous, while there is frequent quotation of Scripture which refers to the kingdom as an inheritance of the future, as 1 Cor. 6:9 and Matt. 25:34. He quotes the two references in chaps. 42 and 50 of Clement of Rome. The kingdom is a reward of the present as well as of the future. By metonymy there is a notable application of the spiritual qualities which characterize the kingdom: to take the kingdom by force is to take life from God; to be pure in heart is to enter the kingdom, which, accordingly, seems to be regarded as the state of salvation.

The relation of church to kingdom is suggestively referred to. "False teachers by a perverse use of the divine words neither

enter into the kingdom of heaven, nor permit those whom they have deluded to attain the truth. Not having the true key, they do not enter as we do, through the tradition of the Lord, but dig through the wall of the church, and step over the truth," etc. (*Stromata*, 7. 17). As Clement has just said that these do not enter into the kingdom, he seems to distinguish between the kingdom and the church, while implying that entrance through the door into the church would bring one also into the kingdom. The germ of the idea of the invisible church is evident. Connected with this is the statement in 4. 2: "The earthly church is the image of the heavenly," whose influence may be traced in Origen and others.

2. ORIGEN.—In his *First Principles*, 1. 3, 6, he holds "That all men have communion with God, Christ's words teach, Luke 17 : 20, 21 : 'The kingdom of God is within you.' And if Genesis 2 : 7 be understood as applying generally to all men, then all men have a share in God. The kingdom is in all men potentially" (see below). Here for the first time we meet with the abstract idea, very frequent in the subsequent Fathers, of the kingdom as God's reign in the soul. But the concrete idea is also clear in Origen: "Christ himself instructs his disciples, that when fully instructed he may form them into a kingdom worthy of God, and present them to God the Father. They do in a sense separate themselves . . . . that they may live as citizens of heaven, coming to the living God, and to the city of God, the heavenly Jerusalem," etc. (*Against Celsus*, 6. 17).

In his *Commentary on John* these two fundamental ideas are blended. "One is a scribe made a disciple to the kingdom of heaven in the simpler sense, when he comes from Judaism and receives the teaching of Jesus Christ according to the church, but he is a scribe in a deeper sense when, having received elementary knowledge through the letter of the Scriptures, he ascends to things spiritual, which are called the kingdom of the heavens. . . . . He who abounds in knowledge free from error is in this kingdom. . . . So far as Christ, God the Word, has not his home in the soul, the kingdom of heaven is not in it, but when any one becomes nigh to admission of the Word, to him the kingdom of

heaven is nigh (Book 10. 14). Of the kingdom of heaven there are as many keys as there are virtues. . . . And perhaps each virtue also is a kingdom of heaven, and all together are a kingdom of the heavens; so that according to this he is already in the kingdom of the heavens who lives according to the virtues. Then 'Repent' is to be referred not to the time, but to deeds and dispositions: for Christ, who is all virtue, has come, and speaks, and on account of this the kingdom of God is within the disciples" (Book 12. 14). He who beholds the excellency of the Word, sees the Son of man coming in his kingdom; if he beholds him also representing truth with perfect clearness, then he would behold his glory in addition to his kingdom: would see in him the kingdom of God come with power; would see this, no longer under the reign of sin, but of Christ, who is God of all, whose kingdom is indeed potentially "within us," but actually (as Mark expresses it, "with power") within the perfect alone (35). "The kingdom of heaven (in that very mystical parable Matt. 18:23) is likened to a certain king. Who but the Son of God? For he is the King of the heavens, and as he is absolute Wisdom and absolute Righteousness and absolute Truth, is he not also absolute Kingdom? . . . . 'Theirs is the kingdom of heaven'; you may say that Christ is theirs in so far as he is absolute Kingdom, reigning in every thought of the man who is no longer under the reign of sin" (Book 14. 7, 14).

The kingdom of the future will be celestial. In *First Prins.*, 3. 6, secs. 8 and 9: "There will be another earth, which receives into it all the saints, where they may be prepared for those better institutions to which no addition can be made. For after his agents and servants, the Lord Christ, who is King of all, will himself assume the kingdom; *i. e.*, after instruction in the holy virtues, he will himself instruct those who are capable of receiving him in respect of his being Wisdom, reigning in them until he has subjected them to the Father," etc. In his *Com. on John*, Book 10. 11, 28, he speaks of what will take place "in the coming age and in heaven when the kingdom of God appears; . . . . in the kingdom of heaven, the Father's house, in which are many mansions." In *First Prins.*, 2. 11 and 3. 7: "The pure in heart,

by more rapid progress, will quickly ascend to a place in the air, and reach the kingdom of heaven, through those mansions, following him who hath passed through the heavens," etc.

The equality of the members of the kingdom is emphasized. "Every one who confesses Christ, the judgments of that man abide sure; he has the keys of the kingdom of heaven for binding and loosing; for upon such the church of Christ is built" (*On John*, Book 12. 14). In *First Prins.*, 1. 3: "We are even in the present life placed in the church, in which is the form of that kingdom which is to come" (*cf.* Clement of Alex.).

Origen's tendency to allegorize is given free play, as above in his use of the Hebraistic plural "the kingdom of the heavens," and as when he says that Peter received the keys not of one heaven, but of more (*On John*, Book 10. 14). The difficulty in understanding certain of his expressions is increased by the doubt as to the original reading. An instance may be cited from his *Com. on Matthew*, Book 11. 16: "The righteous indeed are prepared for the kingdom of heaven and for the exaltation in the kingdom of God;" yet he says (*On John*, 10. 14) that the kingdom of God and the kingdom of heaven are the same. Origen's regard for knowledge, while profound, is ever subservient to the ethical aim, as in his work *Against Celsus*, 8. 11: "We desire not only to understand the nature of the divine kingdom of which we are continually speaking and writing, but to be of those who are under the rule of God alone, that the kingdom of God may be ours."

3. Methodius.—This writer defines the kingdom as eternal life. "When Paul says that flesh and blood shall not inherit the kingdom of God, he does not give a disparaging opinion of the resurrection of the flesh, but would teach that the kingdom of God, which is eternal life, is not possessed by the body, but the body by the life. . . . . The kingdom of God, which is life," etc. (*On the Resurrection*, 13). He does not expressly say whether he regards eternal life as a present possession, but there can be little question that his prevailing conception is eschatological.

The idea of the kingdom as a reward is prominent, as where

he distinguishes the church from the kingdom in his *Oration on Simeon and Anna*, 13: "Hail to thee, Catholic Church, which hast been planted in all the earth; . . . . fear not, little flock, for it is your Father's good pleasure to give you the kingdom." In the *Banquet*, Discourse 7. 3, referring to the Beatitudes: "The Lord promises different honors; to some, that they shall be numbered in the kingdom of Heaven; to others, the inheritance of the earth, and to others to see the Father." The language of these last two quotations does not forbid the kingdom being thought of as a spiritual reward to be realized in the present life; the eschatological idea, however, is evident in such passages as the following: "That which is perfect has not yet come to us, namely, the kingdom of heaven and the resurrection; . . . . let us strive for a life of blessedness and the kingdom of heaven . . . . . come into the temple and city of God." (*Banquet*, Disc. 9. 2, 5; 8. 4.)

We meet first in Methodius with the definite statement that "The kingdom of the Father, of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost is one, even as their substance is one and their dominion one." (*Oration on Psalms*, 5.)

CHAPTER V.

THE APOCRYPHAL WRITINGS, THE APOSTOLIC CONSTITUTIONS, AND THE CLEMENTINES.

1. *The Apocryphal Writings* contain about thirty references to the kingdom, distributed among three gospels, eleven books of Acts, and three revelations, or visions. They are frequently indefinite; their general tone is millennial. "When Christ shall come to reign with his saints a thousand years the first earth will be dissolved, and this land of promise then revealed" (*Vision of Paul*). The *History of Joseph the Carpenter* speaks of the banquet of the thousand years; and the *Vision of John* contains the unique declaration that "the whole world and Paradise shall be made one, and the righteous shall be on the face of all the earth with my angels, Ps. 37:29." The prayer of the thief on the cross is several times given in the form, "When Thou shalt reign," or "become king."

In the *Martyrdom of Bartholomew* God's kingdom is said to exist in heaven. In one MS. of the *Acts of Thomas* occur these sentences: "I rejoice with you, that you are made partakers of His kingdom. . . . . Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, to whom is due all glory and kingdom without end." The *Gospel of Nicodemus* says: "Of those who have believed on Him, their kingdom shall endure forever." The two following references are peculiar: Jesus says in the *Acts and Martyrdom of Matthew:* "I am Paradise, I am the Comforter, ... I the foundation of the church, I the kingdom of the bishops," etc., and in the *Revelation of Moses* God says to Adam, who is lying on the ground in Paradise: "I will set thee in thy kingdom, on the throne of him that deceived thee."

2. *The Apostolic Constitutions.*—In these there is about the same number of references to the kingdom as in the apocryphal writings, mostly eschatological, as "That ye may become partakers of immortality and partners of the kingdom of God," in Book 6. 30; and "Preserve us unto His heavenly kingdom," 8. 10, per-

haps celestial. The kingdom is also intimately connected with Christ, as in Book 7. 32: "They shall rejoice in the kingdom of God, which is in Jesus Christ." It seems to be viewed as a present possession in Book 5. 16: "The kingdom of God shall be taken from them; . . . . having given the kingdom to you, he expects the fruits of your gratitude and piety." In 7. 25 and 26 the prayer "Gather together thy church from the ends of the earth" twice occurs as in the *Didaché* followed by, "Let this thy kingdom come," which may signify God's universal reign on earth, but in any case is eschatological. The baptismal confession is given in 7. 41: "I am baptized into the resurrection of the flesh, and into the remission of sins, and into the kingdom of heaven, and into the life of the world to come." In 8. 7: "Pray that, ... being initiated into the death of Christ, they may rise with him, and become partakers of his kingdom, and may be admitted to the communion of his mysteries: unite them to, number them among, those that are saved in his holy church." While the reader is, on the whole, strongly reminded in the *Constitutions* of the tone of the apostles, there seems to be an advance toward a closer relation between the church and the kingdom.

3. *The Clementines.*—About eighty-five references to the kingdom occur in these writings, with only two Scriptural quotations, which fact may indicate a comparatively early date.

A. *The Homilies.*—"The whole business of the church is like unto a ship bearing through a violent storm men of many places who desire to inhabit the city of the good kingdom" (the so-called *Epistle of Clement to James*, 14). In *Homily* 3. 18, 19: "The key of the kingdom, which is knowledge, which alone can open the gate of life. . . . . If anyone end this life in real ignorance he is rejected from the kingdom of God."

"God gave two kingdoms to two (beings), good and evil; to the evil, . . . the present world along with law, to punish, etc.; to the good, the eternal age to come. The boundary line of the two kings is the having or not having possessions" (*Hom.*, 15.7, 9). Here the ascetic tone is noticeable, as also in the following: "Christ, being thought worthy to be king of the world to

come, (fights against) him who by predestination has usurped the kingdom that now is. . . . . But those who have determined to accept the blessings of the future reign have no right to regard as their own the things that are here, except such as necessary food, since they belong to a foreign king. . . . . Two kingdoms have been established; the kingdom of heaven and the kingdom of the present kings of the earth. . . . . The evil king rejoices in the destruction of the wicked. But the good one, the king of the age to come, loves the whole nature of man; but not being able to have boldness in the present world he counsels what is advantageous, like one who tries to conceal what he really is" (*Hom.*, 3. 19; 15. 7; 20. 2). This peculiar ethical view of expediency is not found elsewhere in the doctrine of the kingdom. In the *Homilies* the kingdom is always eschatological.

B. *The Recognitions* also have much to say about the "two kingdoms," the one evil and present, the other good and of the future. The latter seems to be regarded as the kingdom of God, but the idea is not clear and consistent. In 1.24 there seems to be at first sight a recognition of the social idea: "From the multitude came the election of the beloved, from whose oneness of mind the peaceful kingdom of God is constructed." But this composition of the kingdom is evidently not thought of as now in progress on earth, for a little farther on we read: "He established two kingdoms, that of the present time and that of the future, and appointed times to each, ... and a day of judgment, in which is to be made a severance of things and of souls; so that the wicked shall be consigned to eternal fire, ... but those who have lived according to the will of God, introduced into an eternal abode, shall receive eternal gifts" etc. Again in 5:9: "From the beginning, as we have said, God instituted two kingdoms, and has given to each man the power of becoming a portion of that kingdom to which he shall yield himself to obey. And since it is decreed by God that no one man can be a servant of both kingdoms, ... be earnest to betake yourself to the covenant and laws of the good King." The kingdom is eschatological and celestial: "The condition of this world shall pass away that the sublime condition of the

heavenly kingdom may shine forth" (3.28, 29). "The city is the kingdom in which dwells the Almighty Father" (2.22). "If the soul at death is ignorant of God, it is driven forth from the light of his kingdom" (5.18). "At his second coming he shall take the pious into a share and association with himself in his kingdom" (1.49).

But are the righteous while on earth in no sense in God's kingdom? There seems to be a wavering on this point, as if the *Recognitions* were reluctant to let this idea merge wholly in the eschatological. In 1.51, 52, as to those who die before Christ's coming: "Know then that Christ was ever present with the pious, though secretly, ... especially those who waited for him, to whom he frequently appeared. . . . . Others, translated to Paradise, should be kept for the kingdom. . . . . Blessed are all who shall attain to the kingdom." In 8.55: "God, foreseeing that some men would incline to good, ... assigned those who would choose the good to his own government and his own care, and called them his peculiar inheritance; but the evil to certain angels," etc. In 9.3: "God by his Son created the world as a double house, separated by this firmament which is called heaven; and appointed angelic powers to dwell in the higher, and a multitude of men to be born in this visible world, from among whom he might choose friends for his Son, prepared for him as a bride. . . . . But even till the time of the marriage, which is the manifestation of the world to come, he has appointed a certain power, to choose out and watch over the good ones of those who are born in this world, and to preserve them for his Son, set apart in a certain place of the world, which is without sin; in which there are already some, who are there being prepared, as I said, as a bride," etc. These references suggest the idea of a sort of intermediate state, as it were a transitional form of the kingdom, perhaps blended with a vague notion akin to that of the invisible church. Certain of Hilary's ideas have here a point of contact.

In 1.45 occurs a curious blending of the figurative and the literal, referring evidently to the future kingdom: "Christ anoints with oil every one of the pious when they come to his

kingdom, for their refreshment after their labors, as having got over the difficulties of the way; so that their light may shine, and being filled with the Holy Spirit, they may be endowed with immortality."

The kingdom is thought of as a reward or treasure, rather than the Christian society, in the following: "The first duty of all is to inquire into the righteousness of God and his kingdom; his righteousness, that we may be taught to act rightly; his kingdom, that we may know what is the reward appointed for labor and patience" (2.20). In 3.41 the exhortation is given to "seek first his righteousness," omitting "kingdom." God has concealed the kingdom of heaven, that which is profitable to men, as a secret treasure, reporting it under various names throughout the ages, that all lovers of good might seek and find it in him. He who truly loves this possession of the kingdom of heaven will cast away evil practices, or fail to possess the heavenly kingdom; for it is foolish to love anything more than God, neglecting one's own salvation (3.53). Here the kingdom is the supreme good, the way of salvation, with the emphasis more upon the individual than the social side.

CHAPTER VI.

THE LITURGIES AND MINOR GREEK FATHERS.

1. *The Liturgies.*—In the *Liturgies of James, of Mark,* and *of the Apostles,* the kingdom in the twenty references is usually equivalent to heaven. Three or four are general, as in the expression "preaching the gospel of the kingdom," and in the Lord's Prayer. In the *Liturgy of James,* 44, the Prayer of Incense at the Last Entrance: "Keep us under the shadow of thy wings, and count us worthy till our last breath to partake of thy holy rites for the sanctification of our souls and bodies, for the inheritance of the kingdom of heaven," etc. The *Liturgy of the Holy Apostles,* 13: "Bless this oblation, ... and may it be unto us . . . . for propitiation and forgiveness, ... and for a grand hope of resurrection from the dead, and for a new life in the kingdom of heaven." In 20, the Obsignation or Final Benediction: "May Christ himself render us worthy of the splendid glory of his kingdom," etc. In the prayer of the same section (20) said on the Lord's Day and on feast days, the kingdom is probably also celestial, though ambiguous: "May he himself who blessed us with all spiritual blessings in the heavens, through Jesus Christ our Lord, and prepared us for his kingdom, and called us to the desirable good things which neither cease nor perish, as he promised, ... bless this congregation," etc. The same may be observed of the two following: In 18, the priest begins to break the bread and says: "O Lord, sanctify our lips through thy grace, that we may give the fruits of glory and praise to thy divinity, with all thy saints in thy kingdom;" and in 15: "Drink ye his chalice with faith in the house of his kingdom."

The idea of an intermediate state has a certain bearing upon the thought of the kingdom, as in the two following: In the Prayer for the Dead, the *Liturgy of Mark,* 15: "Give peace to the souls of all who dwell in the tabernacles of thy saints. Graciously bestow upon them in thy kingdom thy promised blessing,

which eye hath not seen . . . . Give peace to their souls, and deem them worthy of the kingdom of heaven," etc. In the *Liturgy of James*, 36: "Remember, O Lord, the spirits . . . . from righteous Abel unto this day: unto them do thou give rest there in the land of the living, in thy kingdom, in the joy of Paradise, in the bosom of Abraham," etc. These prayers for the dead seem to regard them as not yet in the celestial kingdom. But they are apparently even now, at least some of them, "in thy kingdom," "in Paradise," "in the tabernacles of thy saints." It seems probable that this ambiguity is in part owing to the uncertainty as to the state of the departed, and that the righteous dead are vaguely thought of, even before reaching heaven, or at least the highest heaven, as "in thy kingdom."

Thus the *Liturgies*, expressing the general thought and feeling in worship, indicate that the kingdom is still conceived of eschatologically.

2. *The minor Greek Fathers of this period.*—Hegesippus in *The Relatives of Christ* (Euseb. *Ch. Hist.* 3. 20) understands the kingdom as celestial: "Being then asked concerning Christ and his kingdom, what was its nature, and when and where it was to appear, they answered that it was not of this world, nor of the earth, but belonged to the sphere of heaven and angels, and would make its appearance at the end of the world (or age) when he shall come in glory to judge living and dead, and render to every one according to his course of life." Peter of Alexandria, *Canon* 5, thinks of the kingdom as the new life in the soul: "They preached not only repentance, but the kingdom of heaven, which, as we have learned, is within us: for the word which we believe is near us, in our mouth and in our heart. Dionysius of Alexandria is celebrated for his doubts concerning the authorship of the Apocalypse, which are candidly and forcibly expressed, and for his opposition to millennarianism in its crude form. He says in his work *On the Promises*, 3: "Cerinthus teaches an earthly reign of Christ; . . . . he fancied that the kingdom would consist of sensuous pleasures," etc. Caius also combated Cerinthus in similar terms. Of Gregory Thaumaturgus only the disputed writings refer to the kingdom; in the

First Homily occurs one of the rare personifications of the kingdom: "Today, God invites, ... and the heavenly kingdom is urgent to summon those who mind celestial things," etc. In *Hom.* 2, *On the Annunciation:* "By her (the Virgin's) means are we called sons and heirs of the kingdom of Christ." In *Hom.* 4, *On the Holy Theophany*, Christ says: "When thou seest me cast out demons, then hail my kingdom with adoration." These last two references have the evangelical tone. ARCHELAUS, in his *Disputation with Manes*, speaks often of "the kingdom of the good God," and of "the kingdom of light," and has among other curious conceits a reference to the time when the devil's father fell from the kingdom of heaven (33). THEOPHILUS has an obscure reference in his work *On the Nature of God*, which reference may have given a suggestion to Origen: "If I call him Power, I mention his activity; if Providence, his goodness; if I call him Kingdom, I but mention his glory; if Lord, I mention his being Judge," etc. MELITO, in a *Fragment on Faith*, has a general reference, beginning: "He who preached the kingdom." ATHENAGORAS, in his *Plea for the Christians*, 18, says: "May you, by considering yourselves, be able to discover the heavenly kingdom also!" JULIUS AFRICANUS, in his *Chronology*, *On Events in Persia*, says: "The Sages said, 'But of Judah has arisen a kingdom which shall subvert all the memorials of the Jews.'" In the anonymous *Selections from the Prophetic Scriptures*, 12: "We have received, as it were, an earnest of the eternal blessings and of the ancestral riches. For he said: 'Seek the kingdom of God,'" etc. In the *Syriac Documents* the references are as a rule to the celestial kingdom.

There are thus in the fragments of these minor Greek Fathers several conceptions of the kingdom, but the prevailing sense makes it a kingdom in heaven.

B.—LATIN.

CHAPTER VII.

TERTULLIAN AND CYPRIAN.

1. TERTULLIAN'S 161 references have as a whole the eschatological tone. The references in his Catholic, or pre-Montanistic writings, before 202 A. D., are comparatively few and unimportant, and indicate an intermingling of the ideas of the kingdom as terrestrial and celestial. In the *Prescription against Heresies*, chap. 13: "He preached the new law and the new promise of the kingdom of heaven." In the work on *Spectacular Shows*, sec. 30, he refers to the "fast-approaching advent of our Lord, the rising of the saints, the kingdom of the just thereafter." *On Prayer*, 5: "'Thy kingdom come' has reference to that whereto 'Thy will be done' refers—in us, that is. And if the manifestation of the Lord's kingdom pertains unto the will of God and unto our anxious expectation, how do some pray for a protraction of the age, when the kingdom of God, which we pray may arrive, tends to the consummation of the age?" In the treatise *On Baptism*, chap. 13, John 3:5 is quoted, possibly with the social conception of the kingdom; and in chap. 20 he says: "No one untempted should attain the celestial kingdoms." In the treatise addressed *To his Wife*, 6, occurs the phrase, "the celestial kingdom," which is, in a parallel passage in *Woman's Dress*, 9, "the kingdom of God." *On Idolatry*, 9: He cannot hope for the kingdom of heaven who abuses the heaven (as in astrology).

The Montanistic writings are in general millennial and materialistic. *Against Marcion*, Book 3, chap. 24: "We confess that a kingdom is promised us upon the earth, although before heaven, only in another state of existence; . . . . it will be after the resurrection for one thousand years, in the divinely-built city of Jerusalem, let down from heaven; . . . . this Ezekiel knew of, and John beheld. . . . . It is suitable that the saints be rewarded on earth, the scene of their suffering for Christ. . . . . Of the heavenly kingdom this is the process: after its thousand years

are over, within which period is completed the resurrection of the saints, will ensue the destruction of the world at the judgment; we shall be changed into the substance of angels, ... and so removed to that kingdom in heaven whereof we treat. . . . . There is thus an earthly and a heavenly dispensation." In Book 4, chap. 33, Christ is identified with the kingdom: "A certain limit is placed between the old dispensation and the new, at which Judaism ceased and Christianity began, a cessation (which was fulfilment, not extinction) of the law and the prophets and the commencement of that gospel in which is the kingdom of God, Christ himself." In chap. 35, on Luke 17:20, 21: Who will not interpret "within you" to mean "in your hand," "within your power," if you do the commandment of God? If, however, the kingdom of God lies in his commandment, ... Moses gives the same view in Deut. 30:11–13. This means, Neither in this place nor in that is the kingdom of God; for behold, it is within you. This concerns the Lord's own kingdom, for he says that the Son of man must suffer many things and be rejected, before his coming, at which time his kingdom will be really (*substantialiter*) revealed. In Book 5, chap. 10: The substance of the flesh is to be changed at the resurrection, which is the gate through which the kingdom is entered. *On the Resurrection of the Flesh*, 50 and 51: Flesh and blood are excluded from the kingdom of God in respect of their sin, not of their substance. In Christ flesh and blood obtain both heaven and the kingdom of God. But sin shall be "excluded from the kingdom and indeed from the court of heaven itself."

The millennium is thus the prelude of the true kingdom of God, for "when the world shall pass away, then the kingdom of heaven shall be opened" (*On the Soul*, 55). In two passages the kingdom is equivalent to heaven in a way that reminds us of Chrysostom. *On the Scorpion's Bite*, 10: "For though you think heaven still shut, remember that the Lord left here to Peter, and through him to the church, the keys of it, which every one . . . . having confessed . . . . will carry with him." And *On Modesty*, 1: "Apprehension or desire of the eternal fire or kingdom." The church is here distinguished from the kingdom, but in his work

Against Marcion, Book 3, chap. 23, he says: "His Holy Spirit, who builds the church, which is indeed the temple, and household, and city of God," which not only reflects a thought of Hermas, like him leaving the relation between church and kingdom indefinite, but is clearly a seed-thought for Augustine's *De Civitate Dei*.

Besides holding to the view of Luke 17:21, already given above, he quotes 1 Cor. 4:20, "not in speech but in power," in the same vein (*On Modesty*, 14); and in his treatise *On the Soul*, 39, in commenting on John 3:5, says: "cannot enter into the kingdom of God: in other words, he cannot be holy." The kingdom is, however, at least in words, distinguished from eternal life: "To them from whom the kingdom is taken away, of course the life which exists in the kingdom is not permitted either" (*On Modesty*, 16). The social conception of the kingdom seems to be in mind when he quotes Rev. 1:6 in his *Exhortation to Chastity*, 7: "It is written, 'A kingdom also and priests to his God and Father hath he made us,'" but in view of his general usage, the expression must be taken in a proleptic sense. Also in his work *Against Praxeas*, 26, he refers to Luke 22:29: "He awards the kingdom to his disciples as he says it had been appointed to himself by the Father."

2. Cyprian is a true connecting link between "the master" Tertullian and the great Augustine. Even more ardently than Tertullian he looks toward the manifestation of the kingdom in the time of the Last Things, but not in the millennial form. Like him also he dwells upon its ethical nature, emphasizing still further its spiritual elements as the substance of character. Like him he declares that Christ himself is the kingdom of God, as the impersonation of that which we pray may come, and in whom we shall reign; and advances toward a closer conception of the relation between the church and the kingdom. In all these points we may trace his influence on Augustine, who recognized his indebtedness to Cyprian in many germinal thoughts, as is evident from his tribute to Cyprian in chap. 26 of his work on *Grace and Free-Will*: "I strongly advise you to read attentively the book of the blessed Cyprian on *The Lord's*

Prayer. So far as the Lord shall assist you, understand it, and commit it to memory." In no less than eleven other places in Vol. V of his works, does Augustine refer to this treatise of Cyprian.

"'Thy kingdom come.' We ask that the kingdom of God may be set forth to us, even as also that his name may be sanctified in us. For where does God not reign? We pray that our kingdom, which has been promised us by God, may come, which was acquired by the blood and passion of Christ; that we who first are his subjects in the world, may hereafter reign with Christ when he reigns, as in Matt. 25:34. Christ himself, however, may be the kingdom of God, whom we day by day desire to come; whose advent we crave to be quickly manifested to us. For since he is Himself the resurrection, since in him we rise again, so also the kingdom of God may be understood to be Himself, since in him we shall reign. But we do well in seeking the kingdom of God, *i. e.*, the heavenly kingdom, because there is also an earthly kingdom. There is need of prayer, that we fall not away from the heavenly kingdom, as the Jews fell. The Jews were previously children of the kingdom, so long as they continued to be also children of God; but after the name of father ceased to be recognized among them, the kingdom also ceased; and therefore we Christians, who in our prayer begin to call God our Father, pray also that God's kingdom may come to us" (*On the Lord's Prayer*, 13). In *Epistle* 72.2: "From this earth and from these sufferings you shall speedily come to the kingdom of heaven." *On Mortality*, 2: "The kingdom of God is now beginning to be at hand; the reward of life, . . . the possession lately lost of Paradise, are now coming with the passing away of the world."

"The kingdom of God is not in the wisdom of the world, nor in eloquence, but in the faith of the cross and in virtue of conversation" (*Against the Jews*, 3.69). In 4.52, in illustrating the theme that "the liberty of believing or of not believing is placed in free choice," he quotes Luke 17:21, "the kingdom of God is within you," with Deut. 13:18, and Isa. 1:19. *On the Unity of the Church*, 14: "Charity will ever be in the kingdom, will endure

forever in the unity of a brotherhood linked to herself. Discord cannot attain to the kingdom of heaven," etc. Here there may be the thought of charity as being always in the kingdom on its progress from earth to heaven.

The church is to reign in the kingdom. "He cannot be a martyr who is not in the church; he cannot attain unto the kingdom who forsakes that which shall reign there" (*Unity of the Church*, 14). In 6: "The bride of Christ keeps us for God. She appoints the sons whom she has borne for the kingdom." In *Works and Alms*, 9: "The Lord says that in the judgment, those who have labored in his church are admitted to receive the kingdom." These references distinguish between the church and the kingdom; but a statement in *Epistle* 72. 11 makes the keys of Matt. 16:19 refer to the church: "The church is founded upon one who received the keys of it by the Lord's voice."

CHAPTER VIII.

LACTANTIUS AND THE MINOR LATIN FATHERS.

1. LACTANTIUS is the only Father who identifies the kingdom of God with the "golden age" of the poets, as something lost in the past but to be restored. He distinguishes this kingdom from the universal reign of God. He is a millennarian, but with a marked ethical tone, and repeatedly speaks of immortality, or the inheritance of the heavenly kingdom, the final state of the kingdom of God, as the highest good. He apparently has a vivid sense of the eschatological view of the kingdom.

"It is possible that Mt. Olympus may have supplied the poets with the hint for saying that Jupiter obtained the kingdom of heaven, because Olympus is the common name both of the mountain and of heaven" (*Divine Institutes*, 1. 11). "Jupiter changed the golden age by taking away justice. This is . . . . the laying aside of divine religion, which alone effects that man should esteem man dear, and should know that he is bound to him by the tie of brotherhood — since God is alike a Father to all — so as to share the bounties of the common God and Father with those who do not possess them; to injure no one, to oppress no one, not to close his door against a stranger, nor his ear against a suppliant, but to be bountiful, beneficent, and liberal; which Tullius thought to be praises suitable to a king. This truly is justice, and this is the golden age" (which Jupiter and his offspring took away).

"But God, when the last time appeared, sent a messenger to bring back that former age. . . . . The appearance, therefore, of the golden time returned, and justice was restored to the earth, but was assigned to a few only; and this justice is nothing else than the pious and religious worship of the one God. . . . . In order that the nature of virtue might be evident, he did not exclude evil; . . . . so the golden age is not truly here" (Book 5, chaps. 6 and 7). It is at this point that all hope for the

kingdom as the Christian community, destined to win and possess the earth, seems to be given up.

The return of the golden age is still future, and it will come as the prelude of the kingdom of God — as the millennium. In Book 4, chaps. 7 and 12: "The time for Christ's receiving this earthly kingdom has not yet come, but he sways a heavenly and eternal kingdom. . . . For since God decreed that Christ should twice come to earth, once to announce to the nations the one God, then again to reign, why do the Jews who did not believe in his first advent believe in his second? . . . . Even now, in one sense, he has (on earth) an everlasting dominion. And when he shall come again in glory, to judge every soul, and to restore the righteous to life, then he shall truly have the government of the whole earth; then, every evil having been removed from the affairs of men, the golden age, as the poets call it, *i. e.*, a time of righteousness and peace, will arise." In the *Epitome*, 72: Christ shall reign with the saints on earth, and the kingdom of the righteous shall be for one thousand years. After the destruction of the nations . . . . at the end of the one thousand years, God will renew the world, and transform the righteous into the forms of angels, that, being presented with the garb of immortality, they may serve God forever; and this will be the kingdom of God, which shall have no end. Then shall the wicked rise to punishment, etc.

The righteous become a kingdom. In the *Institutes*, Book 7, chap. 6: "We are rewarded with immortality, that being made like to the angels we may serve the Lord for ever, and be to all eternity a kingdom to God." Although, as remarked above, he seems to have lost the conception that the righteous even now are such a kingdom, still in Book 5, chap. 8, he says: "Lay aside every evil thought from your hearts, and the golden age will at once return to you." This is the root of the matter. If this fine sentiment is individual in application, it recognizes the kingdom of God "within;" if collective, it points the way to the social millennium; and in either case it is an assurance that the prayer "Thy kingdom come" may be granted.

2. *The minor Latin Fathers.*—VICTORINUS, in his *Commentary on*

the Apocalypse, has several important references to the kingdom. JEROME is in error when in his *Illustrious Men*, 18, he classes Victorinus as a follower of the millennial doctrine, for the latter in his comments on Rev. 21:16 f. says: "Christ is the rock by which and on which the church is founded. . . . . The church is invincible. . . . . Therefore they are not to be heard who assure themselves that there is to be an earthly reign of a thousand years, who think with the heretic Cerinthus. For the kingdom of Christ is now eternal in the saints, although the glory of the saints shall be manifested after the resurrection." On Rev. 1:6: "And he made us a kingdom. That is to say, a church of all believers; as also the Apostle Peter says, a holy nation, a royal priesthood." On Rev. 14:15, he speaks of "the consummation of the world, and the kingdom of Christ, and the future appearance of the kingdom of the blessed," apparently with the thought that Christ's kingdom is now preparing in the church. Here is a manifest approach toward the idea of the church as representing the kingdom on earth, which culminates in Augustine.

COMMODIANUS, in his *Instruction in favor of Christian Discipline*, thinks of the kingdom in connection with the resurrection of the just, but without indication as to whether it shall be terrestrial or celestial. No references of importance are made in the writings of the Pseudo-Isidorus under the names of PONTIAIUS, ANTERUS, and FABIAN, or in MINUCIUS FELIX and the anonymous treatise on *Rebaptism*. It is notable that in the work of ARNOBIUS *Against the Nations*,[1] there is no reference to the kingdom.

Thus in the ante-Nicene period while the Fathers exhibit a considerable divergence of views concerning the kingdom, representing all phases of the New Testament usage, still the eschatological conception is the most common.

[1] Which is Vol. XIX of the *Ante-Nicene Fathers* in the Clark series.

PERIOD III. THE NICENE AND POST-NICENE FATHERS.

A.—GREEK.

CHAPTER IX.

THE HISTORIANS—EUSEBIUS, SOCRATES, SOZOMEN, AND THEODORET.

THE writings of EUSEBIUS under consideration contain his *Church History* and certain compositions relative to Constantine. He speaks of history as "a narrative of the government of God." He tells of "soldiers of Christ's kingdom," meaning Christians, confessing their faith; and in 8.13 relates how the first martyr of the kingdom of Christ proclaimed the heavenly kingdom of Christ, first by words, then by deeds.

But the kingdom in heaven, equivalent to heaven, is his prevailing thought.[1] "A ready way of entrance into the kingdom of heaven was given Pamphilus," on the day of his martyrdom (*Martyrs of Palestine*, 11.23). In the *Oration on the Thirtieth Anniversary of Constantine's Accession*, 2.4: "Christ opens the gates of his Father's kingdom to those whose course is thitherward from this world." In 4.1 occurs the statement: "No one has seen the unseen kingdom, which governs all things." In this *Oration* the terms "celestial" and "heavenly" are constantly applied to the kingdom. In his *Life of Constantine*, describing the banquet scene after the Council of Nicæa, he says: "One might have thought that a picture of Christ's kingdom was thus shadowed forth, and a dream rather than a reality." This amiable picture must also be referred to the celestial arena, for Eusebius is an opponent of millennarianism, and to him we owe the record of nearly all the early writings in opposition to that doctrine.

SOCRATES has no original references to the kingdom, but reports in his *History* several forms of creed or confession which

[1] *Cf.* the *Catena*, Vol. VI, p. 631, where this saying is ascribed to Eusebius: "Some thought that our Savior's kingdom would commence at his first coming; he therefore informs them that he should not receive the kingdom before returning to his Father," etc.

occasionally refer to the kingdom. In Book 1, chap. 26, ARIUS and EUZOIUS in their confession to Constantine say: "We believe also in the Holy Ghost, and in the resurrection of the flesh, and in the life of the coming age, and in the kingdom of heaven (or, of the heavens), and in one Catholic church of God, extending from one end of the earth to the other." About the middle of the fourth century there was a considerable controversy as to the duration of Christ's kingdom, to which reference is made by the oriental bishops at Sardica in their *Synodical Letter*, 347 A. D.: "A certain Marcellus of Galatia, who will set bounds to the perpetual, eternal, and timeless kingdom of our Lord Christ, saying that he began to reign four hundred years since, and shall end at the dissolution of the present world" (note, p. 45 of Vol. II, Ser. 2). About that time four bishops having been sent for to give account of the deposition of Athanasius and Paul, presented to Constans a declaration of faith, composed by themselves, suppressing the creed which had been promulgated at Antioch, and therein confessed their belief that Christ's kingdom "being perpetual, shall continue to infinite ages," etc. (Book 2, 18). The *Makrostich*, or Lengthy Creed, sent three years later by the eastern bishops to those in Italy, has the same declaration set forth at length, among its statements being the following: "Christ has not attained any new dignity, but we believe that he was perfect from the beginning. . . . . Asserting that the Father is God, and that the Son also is God, we do not acknowledge two Gods, but one only, on account of the majesty of the Deity, and the perfect blending and union of the kingdoms; the Father ruling over all things universally, and even over the Son himself: the Son being subject to the Father, but except him, ruling over all things which were made after him and by him," etc. (2:19). In the creed set forth by Mark at Sirmium, in presence of Constantius, the same thought of Christ's kingdom being everlasting is made prominent (30). The prevailing thought of his kingdom in these confessions seems to be that of his reign with the Father.

SOZOMEN, the contemporary of Socrates, has two references to the same controversy, and in addition the following indefinite

reference in 3.14: "Some of the disciples of Eustathius of Sebaste denounced the rich as altogether without part in the kingdom of God."—See the reference to Marcellus in Athanasius, below, also Theodoret, *History* (2.6).

In THEODORET the kingdom is generally equivalent to heaven. In his *History*, 2. 2: "When Constantine was about to be translated to an eternal kingdom," etc. He also refers to Christ's relation to the kingdom, and in 5. 11 quotes the *Confession of Faith* from Pope Damasus to Bishop Paulinus when in Thessalonica: "If any one deny one Godhead and power, one sovereignty and glory, one lordship, one kingdom, will and truth of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Ghost, let him be anathema." In the *Dialogues*, p. 173, Orthodoxus says: "Though the general resurrection has not yet taken place, though the kingdom of heaven has not yet been bestowed upon the faithful, the Apostle says: 'Hath raised us up,' Eph. 2: 6, to teach that we too shall attain the resurrection," etc. On p. 224: "Consider what belongs to Adam as compared with what belongs to Christ, the disease with the remedy, hell with the kingdom." In *Epistle* 120, to Lupicius: "To receive from our Master alike his kindly care in this present life and in the life to come the kingdom of heaven." In the list of 182 *Questions on Genesis and Exodus*, Question 24 reads: "Why did God plant Paradise, when he intended straightway to drive out Adam thence?" The answer is: "God condemns none of foreknowledge. And besides, he wished to show the saints the kingdom prepared for them from the foundation of the world." (*Cf.* Athanasius below.)

There is in the *Dialogues*, p. 224, one reference which recalls the Pauline view of the relation of the earthly life to that of the kingdom: "In this human nature they who have exercised themselves beforehand in the citizenship of the kingdom shall reign with him."[1]

[1] *Cf.* CLEMENT OF ROME, 54, quoted above.

CHAPTER X.

ATHANASIUS.

This great thinker has two distinct conceptions of the kingdom; the one abstract or subjective, God's reign, especially in the individual soul; the other the concrete reward of heaven. He seems never to think of the kingdom as a society on earth, either present or future. His celebrated view of the goodness inherent in human nature appears forcibly in his thought of the kingdom, which he even declares we have within ourselves and from ourselves. Having in this view a strong affinity with Origen, he lays less stress than Origen upon the discipline required, in knowledge and virtue, to make the "potential" kingdom within us a reality. While in Origen the kingdom becomes real in us, a part of our character, only by strenuous effort, to Athanasius it seems more like a part of ourselves at the outset. In this Origen clearly stands on firmer ground, but Athanasius by no means overlooks the ethical demands.

"The way to God is not afar off or outside ourselves, but it is in us, and it is possible to find it from ourselves in the first instance, as Moses also taught when he said, 'The word of faith is within thy heart.' Which very thing the Savior declared and confirmed, when he said, 'The kingdom of God is within you.' For having in ourselves faith, and the kingdom of God, we shall be able quickly to perceive the King of the universe, the saving word of the Father" (*Against the Heathen*, Part 2. 30). "We need not depart from home for the sake of the kingdom of heaven, nor cross the sea for the sake of virtue. For the Lord said, 'The kingdom of heaven is within you.' Therefore virtue needs only willingness, since it is in us and is formed from us. For when the soul has its spiritual faculty in a natural state virtue is formed" (*Life of Antony*, 20). And yet we need divine help, for "The Lord in the flesh becomes our guide to the kingdom of heaven and to his own Father, saying: 'I am the way, and the door,'" etc. (*Discourses Against the Arians*, 2. 61).

The kingdom is of the Trinity: "To him the kingdom belongs, even to the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, now and for ever" (*On Luke 10 : 22*, sec. 6). In the *First Discourse Against the Arians*, 46, on Ps. 45:6: "Christ had the kingdom eternally, ever ruling in the Father's kingdom." The Nicene Creed, and several other symbols, contain no reference to the kingdom. But after a time, owing to the misinterpretation of such passages as Ps. 110:1 and 1 Cor. 15:24 by the school of Marcellus, the eternity of Christ's kingdom was introduced into the creeds; we find it, for example, in the creed propounded by Cyril of Jerusalem in his *Catechetical Lectures*. Athanasius defends Marcellus himself from error on that point in these words: "Marcellus had never pretended that the Word of God had his beginning from Mary, nor that his kingdom had an end; on the contrary, he had written that his kingdom was both without beginning and without end" (*Defense against the Arians*, 3. 47).

The kingdom is the reward in heaven. "If we exercise virtue we shall conquer death, and receive an earnest of the kingdom of heaven" (*Epistle for Easter*, 342 A. D., 14. 5). "Strangers to difficulties become aliens from the kingdom of heaven. All present matters are trifling compared with those which are future. . . . . For what can be compared with the kingdom? or with life eternal?" (341 A. D., 13. 4). "At the day of judgment . . . . shall be received what is laid up for the saints in the kingdom of heaven, which eye hath not seen," etc. (*On the Incarnation of the Word*, 57. 3). The church is distinguished from the kingdom: "The heresy of Arius is excluded from the communion of the church, and alien from the kingdom of heaven" (*Epistle* 54, *to Serapion*). "Baptized into the Trinity and united to God, we believe that we have also inherited the kingdom of heaven, in Christ Jesus," etc. (*To the Bishops of Africa*, 11). In his *Statement of Faith*, 1, on Luke 23:43, he says: "An entrance to Paradise was regained, from which Adam was cast out, into which Paul also entered." In *Epistle* 43, for Easter of 371 A. D., on Matt. 25:34: "The door was shut from the time that Adam was cast out of Paradise; Christ led into Paradise the thief, and having entered heaven as forerunner opened the gates to all." This expresses a belief com-

mon in the patristic age, that the abode of the first human pair in Eden was not on earth.

It is a fine sentiment of Athanasius that "Paul wished all men should be as he was. For virtue is philanthropic (and sin misanthropic, *Easter* of 338 : 10. 4), and great is the company of the kingdom of heaven, for thousands there serve the Lord." (*Easter* of 339 : 11 : 1). Here the kingdom stands for a social order, but apparently in the heavenly rather than in the earthly state.

CHAPTER XI.

EPHRAEM SYRUS AND APHRAHAT.

1. Most of the references to the kingdom by Ephraem the Syrian are in his *Hymns*, as a rule poetical and indefinite. The prevailing sense is celestial, there being no millennial idea. "Save by the door of resurrection none can enter into the kingdom" (*Hymns for the Feast of Epiphany*, 10. 10). His birth, baptism, death, and resurrection form a fourfold bridge unto his kingdom; and his sheep pass over in his steps (10. 9). Prayer is able to bring a man to the house of the kingdom (*On Admonition and Repentance*, 7). In the *First Homily on Our Lord*, 1: "He departed from Sheol and took up his abode in the kingdom, that he might seek out a path from Sheol which oppresses all, to the kingdom which requites all. For our Lord gave his resurrection as a pledge to mortals, that he would remove them from Sheol which receives the departed without distinction to the kingdom which admits the invited with distinction." In these references the kingdom seems to mean heaven; perhaps in the reference to prayer the idea of salvation may be in mind.

There is also, however, a clear recognition of Christ's kingdom on earth, as in *Hymns for Epiphany*, 15. 52, Mary says to the magi: "May Persia . . . . and Assyria rejoice: when my Son's kingdom shall arise, may he plant his standard in your country." His kingdom is conceived of as universal reign or dominion, as when the magi say to Mary in 15. 11: "To his kingdom shall all be obedient." In the *First Homily*, 54: "He received the kingdom from the house of David, even though Herod held the place." *On the Nativity*, 2, on John 10:9: "The Door for them that go in, by which they go into the kingdom." In sec. 4: "Herod heard the roaring of the Lion, who came to sit in the kingdom according to the Scriptures." In 7: "Thou who pavest the way into the kingdom." Here the way "into the kingdom" may be either of present salvation or of the heavenly reward.

The kingdom spoken of in connection with Herod is a poetic conception for dominion in general.

2. APHRAHAT, the Persian sage, was a contemporary of Ephraem, and in some of his views resembles him. The kingdom is to him the Messiah's reign and realm, especially as portrayed in Daniel, with its realization still in the future. His thought therefore centers chiefly on the Last Things, with frankly expressed doubt whether the kingdom is to be terrestrial or celestial. There is no trace of the social conception of the kingdom, nor of the inner view of its existence in the soul.

"Jesus received the kingdom from Israel, and handed over the keys to Simon, and ascended and returned to him who sent him" (*Demonstration on Persecution*, 21. 13). "The righteous have not inherited the kingdom, nor have the wicked gone into torment. The King has gone to receive the kingdom, but as yet he has not returned the second time" (*Dem. on the Resurrection*, 8. 22). "The saints shall inherit the kingdom that is beneath the heaven, Dan. 7:27. And if they say that it has not taken place as yet, then (we ask) is the kingdom that shall be given to the Son of man to be heavenly or earthly?" What answer is expected here is not stated. He proceeds: "And lo! the children of the kingdom are sealed, and they have received their emancipation from this world. . . . . First, he gave the kingdom to the sons of Jacob; . . . . and when they did not prosper in the kingdom, he took it away and gave it to the children of Esau (the Romans) until he should come whose it is. And they will deliver up the deposit to its Giver, and will not deal fraudulently with it" (*Dem. of Wars*, 5. 23 and 24).

The thought here seems to be that his kingdom which he entrusted to Simon was within the Roman Empire, an *imperium in imperio;* but it is evidently not entirely clear or consistent in the sage's mind. His doubt also as to the future place of the kingdom is expressed in the *Dem. on the Last Things*, 22. 24: "God has power, if he chooses, to give inheritance of life in heaven, and if it please him, in the earth. Jesus said, 'Blessed are the poor, for theirs is the kingdom of heaven'; and to the

thief: 'Thou shalt be with me today in the Garden of Eden.' The earth, and the firmament which is set to divide the upper heavens from the earth and this life, shall pass away. And God will make a new thing for the children of Adam, and they shall have inheritances in the kingdom of heaven. If he shall give them inheritance in the earth, it shall be called the kingdom of heaven. And if in heaven, this is easy for him to do. For with the kings of the earth also, although each one of them abides in his own place, yet every place to which their authority extends is called their kingdom," etc. In the *Dem. of Monks*, 6. 18: "The spiritual shall inherit the kingdom that was prepared for them from the beginning. The others shall remain on the earth and turn back to Sheol."

To these *Demonstrations*, whose date is 337–344 A. D., Aphrahat appends the following statement: "These things I have written, not according to the thought of one man, but of all the church, and for the persuasion of all faith. . . . . I will receive instruction without contention from any man who will speak and demonstrate about any matter." So far as his views represent those of the church of his time, they indicate a wide degree of uncertainty as to chiliasm and freedom of speculation about the locality of the kingdom when finally established.

CHAPTER XII.

BASIL, CYRIL OF JERUSALEM, GREGORY NAZIANZEN, AND GREGORY OF NYSSA.

1. In Basil the two chief conceptions of the kingdom, apart from certain indefinite references, are the celestial, and the inner or subjective. He speaks frequently of "the gospel of the kingdom," and in *Epistle* 44, *To a Lapsed Monk*, he says: "You were proclaiming to all the power of the kingdom, and you fell from it," making the kingdom substantially equivalent to Christianity. The Trinity share in the kingdom, *Epistle* 105, *To the Deaconesses.*

"Through the Holy Spirit comes our restoration to Paradise, our ascension into the kingdom of heaven, our return to the adoption of sons, ... in a word into all blessings of this world and the world to come" (*On the Spirit*, 15. 36). "Nothing can destroy the labors of holiness and truth, for the kingdom of heaven that awaits them is firm and sure" (*Ep.* 18, *To Macarius and John*).

Two mystical passages in his *Eighth Epistle*, *To the Cæsareans*, treat of the subjective view of the kingdom. In sec. 12: "It is said, 'Blessed are the pure in heart, for they shall see God.'" And, my brethren, entertain no other conception of the kingdom of heaven than that it is the very contemplation of realities. This the divine Scripture calls blessedness. For, the kingdom of heaven is within you, Luke 17:21. The inner man consists of nothing but contemplation. The kingdom of heaven, then, must be contemplation. Now we behold shadows as in a glass; thereafter, their archetypes," etc. In sec. 7: "All material knowledge is said to be the kingdom of Christ: while immaterial knowledge, and so to say the knowledge of actual Godhead, is that of God the Father. But our Lord himself is the ultimate blessedness. . . . . He calls the transition from material knowledge to immaterial contemplation a resurrection. . . . .

Little by little our intelligence becomes strong enough to approach Deity unveiled. . . . . This is what is meant by delivering up the kingdom, 1 Cor. 15:24, as Christ is the first-fruits, not the end, of this deeper doctrine. So when the disciples asked him, 'When wilt thou restore the kingdom?' Acts 1 : 6, he replied, 'It is not for you to know,' etc. That is, the knowledge of such a kingdom is not for them that are bound in flesh and blood. This contemplation the Father hath put away in his own power."

We find a certain affinity to this peculiar conception of the kingdom in GREGORY OF NAZIANZEN, Basil's friend; and the thought of both may possibly have been influenced by Philo the Jew.[1]

2. CYRIL OF JERUSALEM, who has been termed "the orthodox Arian," in his *Catechetical Lectures* dwells constantly upon Christ's kingdom as the reward in heaven of the faithful, and as being endless in duration.

In *Lecture* 3. 10 it is parallel with salvation: "If any man receive not baptism, he hath not salvation; except only martyrs who, even without the water, receive the kingdom." In 4. 15: "Christ is coming to reign in a heavenly, eternal kingdom; . . . . be sure on this point, for many say Christ's kingdom hath an end." "Now is the falling away. . . . . This created world is to be made anew. . . . . How escape the fire? How enter into the kingdom?" (15. 2, 8, 26). "In this holy Catholic church receiving instruction and behaving ourselves virtuously, we shall attain the kingdom of heaven, and inherit eternal life" (18. 28). "A pure soul that has cleansed itself from sin can say with boldness, 'Thy

[1] SCHÜRER, in his *History of the Jewish People*, Div. II, Vol. III, p. 380, in summarizing Philo's ethical teaching, says: "As it was by falling away from God that man was entangled in the life of sense, so must he struggle up from it to the direct vision of God. This object is attainable even in this earthly life. For the truly wise and virtuous man is lifted above and out of himself, and in such ecstasy beholds and recognizes Deity itself. His own consciousness sinks and disappears in the divine light; and the Spirit of God dwells in him and stirs him like the strings of a musical instrument. He who has in his way attained to the vision of the Divine, has reached the highest degree of earthly happiness. Beyond it lies only complete deliverance from this body, that return of the soul to its original incorporeal condition, which is bestowed on those who have kept themselves free from attachment to this sensuous body."

kingdom come'" (23.13). In *Procatachesis*, 16, the rhetorical reference to the kingdom has probably the usual meaning in Cyril; "Great is the baptism, ... a ransom to captives, ... a new birth of the soul, ... the delight of Paradise, a welcome into the kingdom, the gift of adoption." Likewise the reference in *Lecture* 17, 15: "as the rushing of a mighty wind, signifying the presence of him who was to grant power unto men to seize with violence the kingdom of heaven." Possibly, however, by "the kingdom" in these two references he has the present Christian community in mind. Otherwise the eschatological views of the kingdom are found in Cyril.

3. Gregory Nazianzen. — In this versatile and talented Father, surnamed the Theologian, the view of the kingdom as the community of saints or Christian society seems dominant, while it is also viewed as the reign of Christ over all mankind, and as the heavenly reward, the latter being emphasized on its individual and subjective side.

In the *Oration on Holy Baptism*, 3, "Baptism is, ... dying with Christ, ... the bulwark of faith, the key of the kingdom of heaven, the change of life, ... the loosing of chains, the remodeling of the whole man." In 22: "Will he not (you say) take the desire of baptism instead of baptism? You speak in riddles, if you mean that the unenlightened is enlightened in his sight, and that he is within the kingdom of heaven who merely desires to attain to it, but refrains from doing that which pertains to the kingdom." In 24: "Do not delay in coming to grace, but hasten, lest the robber outstrip you, the publican, ... or any of these violent ones who take the kingdom of heaven by force. For it suffers violence willingly, and is tyrannized over through goodness."

In the *Second Discourse on the Son*, 4: "As Almighty King of both willing and unwilling he reigns; in another sense as producing in us submission, and placing us under his kingship as willingly acknowledging his sovereignty. Of his kingdom in the former sense there will be no end. In the second sense the end will be his taking us as his servants, on our entrance into a state of salvation. What need to work submission in us when

we have already submitted? . . . . Then he will judge the earth and make awards," etc. This seems to point to the expectation of Christ's earthly kingdom of the saints losing its identity, so to speak, at the end of the world, in the celestial kingdom. In *Epistle* 4, Div. 2, in answer to *Ep.* 14 of Basil: "I admire your strait and narrow way, leading, I know not whether to the kingdom or to Hades, but for your sake I hope it is the kingdom." In the *Panegyric on Basil*, 76, he uses the expression "intrusted with the keys of heaven," so characteristic of Chrysostom.

"The heavenly reward to those whose mind is purified, will be Light, God seen and known, in proportion to their degree of purity, which we call the kingdom of heaven; but to those who suffer from blindness of their ruling faculty, darkness, estrangement from God, in proportion to their blindness here" (*Oration on Holy Baptism*, 45). "Some will be welcomed by the unspeakable light and the vision of the holy and royal Trinity, which now shines upon them with greater brilliancy and purity, and unites itself wholly to the whole soul, in which alone and beyond all else I take it that the kingdom of heaven consists" (*On His Father's Silence*, 9). According to this, the kingdom is that light wherein is the vision of God uniting himself with the soul; this heavenly vision apparently shines with greater brilliancy, with ever-increasing appropriation of the kingdom of God in the soul, from the beginning of the Christian life.

4. Gregory of Nyssa, in his thought of the kingdom, bears little resemblance to his brother Basil, but has notable affinity with Origen and Athanasius. He is a brilliant defender of Nicene orthodoxy, and his conception of the kingdom is many-sided. He thinks of the universal reign of Christ, which, of course, included mankind. But through sin the right of citizenship was lost. This was restored to men by the entering of Christ into human life, so that they are no longer outcasts from the kingdom, but by their own efforts may regain their lost estate. Again, he regards the kingdom of the future as the reward in heaven, a restoration to Paradise.

A fundamental difference between the typical Greek theology and the Augustinian may be illustrated in Gregory: "These

glad tidings he proclaims to all who, up to the present day, become disciples of the Word—that man is no longer outlawed, nor cast out of the kingdom of God, but is once more a son, once more in the station assigned to him by his God, inasmuch as along with the first fruits of humanity the whole lump is hallowed" (*Against Eunomius*, Book 12. 1). "The earthly envelopment once removed, the soul's beauty will again appear, becoming again that which in the beginning we were created. This likeness to the divine is not our work at all; it is the great gift of God bestowed upon our nature at the very moment of our birth; human efforts can go only so far as to clear away the filth of sin, and so cause the buried beauty of the soul to shine forth again. . . . . This truth is, I think, taught in the gospel, when our Lord says, to those who can hear what Wisdom speaks beneath the mystery, 'The kingdom of God is within you.' The Scripture points out that the divine good is not something apart from our nature, and is not removed far away from those who have the will to seek it; it is, in fact, within each one of us, ignored indeed and unnoticed while it is stifled beneath the cares and pleasures of life, but found again whenever we turn our thoughts toward it. . . . . This is confirmed by the parable of the lost drachma" (*On Virginity*, 12).

"Christ showed his universal sovereignty by saying to the thief, 'Today thou shalt be with me in Paradise'" (*Against Eunomius*, Book 2. 11). "Lordship is not a name of his being, but of his being in authority, and the appellation of Christ indicates his kingdom, while the idea of his kingdom is one, and that of his nature another. The establishment of his kingdom does not signify the formation of his essence, but the advance to his dignity" (Book 6. 4). "It is with an eye to Christ's humanity, I suppose, that David describes the establishment of His kingdom, not as though He were not a king, but in the view that the humiliation was taken up and absorbed into the majesty of His kingdom" (Book 11. 3).

The kingdom as celestial may be seen in the following passages: "Paradise will be restored. We hope not for those things which now pertain to the necessary uses of life, but for another

kingdom, of a description that belongs to unspeakable mysteries" (*On the Making of Man*, 21. 4). "Now the resurrection promises us nothing else than the restoration of the fallen to their ancient state; for the grace we look for is a certain return to the first life, bringing back again to Paradise him who was cast out from it" (17. 2). "Christ teaches in the gospels that the acquisition of the kingdom comes to those who are deemed worthy of it, as a matter of exchange. When ye have done such and such things, then it is right that ye get the kingdom as a reward." From the *Catena* two references may be added: "Perhaps the kingdom of God being within us, means that joy which is implanted in our hearts by the Holy Spirit." And, "'Thy kingdom come' according to some means 'May thy Holy Spirit come upon us to purify us.'"

CHAPTER XIII.

CHRYSOSTOM.

THE great preacher usually makes the kingdom a synonym of heaven. This is clear from his constant antithesis of "hell" and "the kingdom," occurring about sixty-three times, including the use of the phrase "kingdom of heaven" in such connection six times; the antithesis "heaven and hell" is rare. This usage is also evident in his quoting Matt. 16:19 nine times, uniformly as "the keys of heaven." Remarkable also is his preference for the phrase "kingdom of heaven," which he uses about two hundred times; while "the kingdom of God" occurs only about sixty times, and of these sixty passages all but two are Scriptural quotations.

But in his thought of the kingdom he is profoundly evangelical, and the burden of his splendid eloquence from first to last is, "Realize the kingdom here! Make the earth a heaven!" He has reached the social view of the kingdom, as the redeemed society on earth, as it were by way of heaven, where Christ dwells and reigns. He thinks but little of the return of Christ to earth, the primitive eschatological view of the kingdom having almost faded from sight. Placing the essence of the kingdom in character, in a life well-pleasing to God, his strenuous ethical tone almost obliterates the boundary between things present and future.

"Let us show forth a new kind of life. Let us make earth, heaven; let us hereby show the Greeks of how great blessings they are deprived. For, when they behold in us good conversation, they will look upon the very face of the kingdom of heaven. . . . . They will say: 'If the Christians are become angels here, what will they be after their departure hence?' Thus they too will be reformed" (*On Matthew*, 43.7). "Let us love God as we ought. This divine and pure love is indeed the kingdom of heaven; this is fruition, this is blessedness. . . . . For thus

we shall see his kingdom even from out of this life, and shall be living the life of angels, and while we abide on earth we shall be in as goodly a condition as they that dwell in heaven" (*On Romans*, 23). "To live according to his will, this is the principal thing. So that by this thou hast the kingdom already in possession without a probation" (*On 2 Cor.*, 10.4). In 11.6: "Let us above all things be afraid of sin: for this is punishment, this is hell, this is ten thousand ills. And let us not only be afraid of, but also flee from it, and strive to please God continually; for this is the kingdom, this is life, this is ten thousand goods. So shall we even here obtain the kingdom and the good things to come; whereunto may we all attain," etc.

In his comments upon 1 Cor. 15:24 f.: "He refers to Christ the perfecting of his kingdom,—I mean the salvation of the faithful, the peace of the world, the taking away of evils; for this is to perfect the kingdom. But what is this: 'When he shall deliver up the kingdom'? The Scripture acknowledges two kingdoms of God, the one by appropriation,[1] the other by creation. Thus he is King over all in respect of his creation; but he is King of the faithful and willing and subject, in respect of his making them his own. This is the kingdom which is said also to have a beginning. To this he refers in Ps. 2:8 and Matt. 28:18. This kingdom then doth he deliver up, *i. e.*, bring to a right end. . . . . But some say that he spake this to declare the removal of wickedness, as though all would yield thenceforth and none would resist nor do iniquity. For, when there is no sin, it is evident that God shall be all in all." *On Matthew*, 19.7: "He hath enjoined each one of us, who pray, to take upon himself the care of the whole world. 'Thy will be done,' . . . . everywhere upon earth; so that error may be destroyed, and truth implanted, and all wickedness cast out, and virtue return, and there be no difference henceforth in this respect between heaven and earth."

In his celebrated *Sermons on the Statues*, 16.17, he gives a social program which reminds us of the "golden age" of Lactantius. "Exercise tender care toward thy neighbor. For we are

[1] οἰκείωσιν.

placed with one another, inhabit cities, and meet in churches, in order that we may bear one another's burdens, that we may correct one another's sins. And just as persons in the same shop carry on a separate traffic, yet put all afterwards into a common fund, so also let us act. Whatever advantages each man is able to confer upon his neighbor, let him not grudge, nor shrink from doing it, but let there be a kind of spiritual commerce and reciprocity: in order that having deposited everything in a common store, and procured a large treasure, we may be altogether partakers of the kingdom of heaven; through the grace of our Lord," etc. The immediate reference of the closing words is probably to the kingdom above, yet the shading of the present kingdom into that of the future is obvious.

"While the kingdom is synonymous with salvation and the sum of all good, still it is a greater thing than the kingdom itself to receive it from such a Giver" (*Homily* 6, *on Acts*). Hence the kingdom is frequently spoken of as one among many good things. *On* 1 *Cor.* 43.6: "We ought not to do anything good for the hope of the kingdom, but because it pleases God, which is more than any kingdom." *On Romans*, 15, as often: "Paul would prefer to fall into hell and be banished from the kingdom, to losing Christ." *On Matthew*, 24: 5 and 6: "The centurion went away having received a kingdom. . . . . Judas, too, was a child of the kingdom, and yet he became a child of hell." *On John*, 24. 2: "It is impossible, Christ says, for one not born from above to see the kingdom of God; in this pointing to himself, and declaring that there is another besides the natural sight, and that we have need of other eyes to behold Christ." So in *Homily* 2, *on Colossians:* "No one by his own achievements obtains the kingdom." Of the young man in Mark 12:34, who was 'not far from the kingdom,' he says that it was because he overlooked low things and embraced the first principle of virtue (*On Matt.*, 71. 1). This passage of Mark is treated at length in Hilary.

Chrysostom evidently thinks of the church as the kingdom of Christ in some instances, but without expressly identifying them. *To Catechumens*, 1. 4, on Ps. 2:8: "Dost thou see how

he has made mention of the church of the gentiles, and has spoken of the kingdom of Christ extended on all sides?" In 1. 1: "Ye are not about to be led to an empty dignity, but to an actual kingdom: and not simply to a kingdom, but to the kingdom of heaven itself. . . . . Yet thirty days, and the King of heaven shall restore you to the country which is on high, Jerusalem, which is free — to the city which is in heaven. Remember me, when you come into that kingdom, when you receive the royal robe," etc. *On Matt.* 8. 6: Now in Egypt Christ's kingdom shines forth in its brightness. . . . . Everywhere in that land the camp of Christ, and the royal flock, and the polity of the powers above. In 88. 1: "There ought to be choirs of angels here, and we ought to make the earth a heaven." In *Homily* 15. 11, *on* 1 *Cor.*, the church is distinguished from the kingdom when he speaks of "the priests not purging out from their borders, that is, out of the church, the covetous and whatsoever would exclude from the kingdom of heaven." On the parable of the tares, *On Matthew*, 47. 1: "Whereas Christ is the sower, and of his own field and out of his own kingdom he gathers, it is clear that the present world also is his."[1] The conclusion which Augustine draws from this parable is that the church is the kingdom of God on earth.

Chrysostom's thought of the kingdom as spiritual and requiring the guidance of the Spirit, is manifest in two comments in his *Discourses on the Acts*. On 1:6: "It appears to

[1] In his famous passage on the community of goods, *Homily* 11 *on Acts*, he draws this enthusiastic picture: "Let us now depict this state of things in words, and let all sell their possessions, and bring them into the common stock — in words, I mean: let none be excited, rich or poor! How much gold think you would be collected? . . . . Perhaps one million pounds' weight of gold, ... nay, twice or thrice as much. Shall we say there are in the city a hundred thousand Christians, and the rest Greeks and Jews? Of the poor I think not more than 50,000; . . . . Then to feed that number daily, what abundance would there be! And yet if the food were received in common, all taking their meals together, it would require no such great outlay after all. But, you will ask, what should we do after the money was spent? And do you think it ever could be spent? Would not the grace of God be ten thousand fold greater? Would it not be richly poured out? Nay, should we not make a heaven upon earth? If, where the numbers were 3,000 and 5,000, the doing of this thing had such splendid success, and none of them complained of poverty, how much more glorious would this be in so vast a multitude?"

me that they had not any clear notion of the nature of that kingdom; for the Spirit had not yet instructed them." On 28 : 31 : "The things concerning the kingdom of God. Nothing of the things of sense, nothing of things present." His spirit is finely summarized in a remark in *Homily* 6, *on Philippians*: "I could wish the things concerning the kingdom to be ever my discourse, of the rest, of the green pastures, ... of the pleasure of being with Christ."

CHAPTER XIV.

JOHN OF DAMASCUS.

It is a long leap in more than one respect from Chrysostom to John of Damascus. Chrysostom died in 407, and John in or near the year 757, as "the last of the Fathers." Between them there are in the Eastern church only a few names of any importance, and none whose works are considered in the present investigation. In the Western church the succession extends to Gregory the Great (d. 604).

The work of John selected as representive in the list is that *On the Orthodox Faith*, which is the third Division of his *Fountain of Knowledge*. In this work there are six references to the kingdom, all general and indefinite, as follows: "We believe in one God, ... holding a perpetual and immortal kingdom over all things" (Book 1. chap. 8). Also, "one lordship, one kingdom," which the English version renders "sovereignty." In 2. 11 Matt. 6:33 is quoted. In 2. 29: "God's original wish was that all should be saved and come to his kingdom. For it was not for punishment that he formed us, but to share in his goodness, inasmuch as he is a good God." In 4. 15: "John the Baptist was the first herald of the kingdom." In 4. 25: "From the time when he was baptized, and the Holy Spirit appeared to men, the spiritual worship and polity (or mode of life) and the kingdom of heaven have been preached."

This extreme meagerness of reference to the kingdom by the "engrosser of Greek theology" at the close of the patristic age, is significant chiefly as showing that John wholly failed to appreciate the importance of the kingdom. Not less striking is the evidence from his *Sacred Parallels*, a collection of opinions of the early Fathers upon various points of morality and religion, alphabetically arranged under Scriptural quotations. Under the title of "The Kingdom of Heaven," he first quotes fourteen representative New Testament passages in which the

kingdom is mentioned; then follow eleven quotations or sentiments, to illustrate the subject, of which seven do not mention the kingdom at all. Four Fathers are mentioned as quoted from (Basil, the Gregorys, Clement of Alexandria), but several of the quotations are of doubtful source. Of the four references to the kingdom by name, two are indefinite: "It is the dignity of the kingdom that it has no tyranny over it;" and, "That incorruptible kingdom has no desire, but has the presence of all good things, whence there is no place for desire." Another is from Clement's *Quis Dives:* "The kingdom of God does not belong to sleepers and sluggards, but the violent take it by force; . . . . for this is commendable, to take life from God by force," etc. The fourth is important, and of doubtful origin: "The state of those who live according to the divine laws is to be declared the kingdom of God." This saying, and the quotation from Clement, seem to retain something at least of the social idea of the kingdom.

The tenor of the other seven quotations, supposed to illustrate the kingdom without mentioning it, is of the reward of virtue, the good things waited for. The first given reads: "When man is made perfect, he is borne up to the dignity of angels." As a rule, however, these quotations are sententious and obscure: "I must be buried together with Christ, with Christ rise again, be an heir with Christ, become a son of God, God himself." And, "Tribulation is the flower of good things which we wait for. Let us therefore pluck the flower on account of the fruit."

As the Eastern church had already long been dead intellectually when John of Damascus wrote, we may be grateful that in this final flickering of the flame we see even the few references to the kingdom which he gives.

B.—LATIN.

CHAPTER XV.

HILARY.

THE "Athanasius of the West" has many suggestive thoughts about the kingdom, even though his views are not always clear or consistent. He is represented in the present discussion of patristic literature by his treatises *On the Trinity*, and *On the Synods, or the Faith of the Orientals*. Having at hand the Benedictine edition of his works, and certain important references being found apart from the two treatises mentioned, I treat as a whole his views of the kingdom.

His most distinctive view is indicated by the title of an essay *De regno Christi a regno Dei Patris distincto*, eight pages folio, by the Benedictine editors in the preface. This essay is of rare interest and value; according to its own showing, however, the somewhat uncertain use of terms by HILARY leaves the distinction between God's kingdom and Christ's vague and shadowy.

At the transfiguration the glory of his body coming into the kingdom was shown the disciples. The Lord shall reign in his glorified body until the offenses shall be removed from his kingdom at the consummation of the age. Then he will deliver up the kingdom. He says not "his kingdom," but "a kingdom," namely, ourselves made conformable to his glorious body, whom he will deliver up as a kingdom to God, as in Matt. 25 : 34. For the Son will deliver up to God as a kingdom those whom he called into a kingdom, promising them that the pure in heart should see God. Reigning thus he will remove offenses, and then shall the righteous shine as the sun in the kingdom of their Father. And what kingdom, he himself testified, saying to the apostles: "The kingdom of God is in you"[1] (*On the Trinity*, Book 11. 37–9).[2]

[1] *In vobis.* [2] *Cf.* the "earthly kingdom" of Irenæus, 5. 32.

Christ's kingdom is thus a sort of intermediate state, in his glorified body, in which he keeps the righteous after death until they enter the kingdom of God at the judgment. On Paul's saying, "I follow on, if I may apprehend," Hilary seems to think that the saints, their flesh being laid aside, are joined to the flesh which Christ assumed for us, to rest in it until they receive a body of their own; and this resting of the saints in Christ's body he calls the kingdom of Christ. But the church is Christ's body: "For Christ himself is the church, *per sacramentum corporis sui in se universam eam continens*" (*On Ps.* 125; *cf. On Matt.* 5:34). Is, then, Christ's body, the church, different from his glorified body, in which the righteous dead are waiting? So it seems from Hilary's comments on the words in Ps. 15, "Who shall dwell in his holy mountain?" "The mountain," he says, "is the body which Christ took from us. We climb this mountain after we have dwelt in the church. There is rest in the Lord's exaltation; there we shall be associated with choirs of angels, since we also are a city of God" (*Dei civitas*). Here is evidently a mystical blending of ideas; the primary idea of Christ's kingdom on earth seems to be lost in the shadows of the spirit-world. In his comment on Matt. 12:32 he identifies Christ with the kingdom: he perfects all work by the Spirit of God, and is himself the kingdom of heaven, and in him is God reconciling the world unto himself.

And yet, in the exposition of Mark 12:34, of the young man who was not far from the kingdom, there is apparently a recognition of the kingdom as the present company of the saints. "Why does he say that, although such faith makes a man perfect for the kingdom of heaven, this scribe was not in the kingdom, but only not far from it? In Matt. 25:34 and 5:3, it is given in absolute possession. Did this young man, whose love to God and man was apparently perfect, confess something less than these confessed? . . . . The Lord, praising his confession of faith, still says he is not far from the kingdom, and did not place him in the very possession of the blessed hope. He was on the right way, and not far from the gospel sacrament, though still ignorant that the one thing lacking was to confess Christ as

Lord." If he had also done this, Hilary would probably have considered him as in the kingdom.

The kingdom within the soul is also emphasized. "To rule the body, subduing the sin reigning there and all incentives to vice, is the kingdom of God in us. Let Christ reign in us, since through him we may reign over ourselves, according to Luke 17:20, 21, The kingdom of God is within you. The kingdom of God is where sin is vanquished, death done away, and no enemy reigns. . . . . This will be to us the kingdom of God, when all the stings of our vices being broken, the blemish of bodily infirmity will be removed" (*On Ps.* 2, sec. 42). Here also there seems to be a blending of present and future.

The church is distinguished from the kingdom in a passage of *The Trinity*, Book 6. 37: "This faith [of Peter] is the foundation of the church; this faith has the keys of the celestial kingdom."[1] But in other passages the two ideas are intermingled somewhat in the manner of the *Shepherd of Hermas*, as *On Ps.* 147:15: "By this swift running of the word the building of this blessed city has been begun, which, as the abundance of its resources becomes known, is daily everywhere built up with the living stones of the faithful, to the increase of the city of the blessed kingdom." We have noted above how he makes Christ both church and kingdom. Jerome says that Hilary drew largely upon Origen in his treatise on the Psalms; we may trace such influence in his comment *On Ps.* 51, sec. 17; the Jews being said to be torn away from Christ's body and kingdom, an assertion hardly consonant with his peculiar views, he explains the kingdom as something promised, offered freely to all, but not yet realized; recalling Origen's thought of the kingdom being potentially in all men.

[1] The English translation (which appeared in May, 1899) of a passage *On the Trinity*, Book 6. 38, runs: "You may have a change of faith if the keys of heaven are changed. That faith holds not the keys of the church," etc. In both cases the original text in the Benedictine edition reads: "the keys of the kingdom of heaven."

CHAPTER XVI.

AMBROSE.

THIS beautiful and knightly soul, under whose preaching Augustine was converted, has a thoroughly evangelical view of the kingdom. He thinks of it as the community of those who have the divine life in the soul. He lays great stress upon the unity of the kingdom of the Trinity, his treatise *On the Christian Faith* being in large part a sustained proof, fortified by Scripture, that the kingdom of the Son is one with that of the Father; thus taking the opposite point of view from Hilary. But these two Fathers are in striking agreement in their insistence upon the spiritual and ethical content of the kingdom. In the *Catena on Luke* there are several valuable additions to the teaching of Ambrose concerning the kingdom, which will be given with the other references.

"Christ came into this world to prepare for himself a kingdom from among us, ... to receive a kingdom from us, to whom he says: 'The kingdom of God is within you.' This is the kingdom which Christ has received, this the kingdom which he has delivered to the Father. . . . . He who came will deliver up the kingdom to the Father. Each gives the other unity of honor. The kingdom which he delivers up is not lost, but grows. We are the kingdom, for it was said to us, The kingdom of God is within you. And we are the kingdom, first of Christ, then of the Father, John 14:6. When I am on the way, I am Christ's; when I have passed through, I am the Father's; but everywhere through Christ, and everywhere under him. It is a good thing to be in the kingdom of Christ, that Christ may be in us. We are now under Christ's rule in the form of servants; but when we shall see his glory we shall be in the kingdom of God, in which are the patriarchs and prophets. . . . . But in the kingdom of the Son the Father also reigns; and in the kingdom of the Father the Son also reigns" (*On the Faith*, 5. 12).

"To be with Christ is life, and where Christ is, there is his kingdom" (*Catena on Luke*, 23 : 43). Christ is our Way, which hath opened the kingdom of heaven to believers (*On the Faith*, 3. 7). This is evidently the source of the line in the *Te Deum* of the later liturgy : "Thou didst open the kingdom of heaven to all believers." In *Duties of the Clergy*, 1. 49 : Cast out of the kingdom of thy soul the likeness of the devil, and let the likeness of Christ glow brightly in thy kingdom, that is, thy soul.

"The kingdom of God itself is the work of the Holy Spirit, as it is written in Rom. 14 : 17 : 'Righteousness and joy and peace,' etc. . . . . The Holy Spirit takes us into his kingdom by the adoption of holy regeneration. He has made us heirs of the new birth from above" (*On the Spirit*, Book 2, chaps. 20 and 7). We are all anointed with spiritual grace for a share in the kingdom of God and in the priesthood (*On the Mysteries*, 6). "He shows that it is a regal power which the Holy Spirit possesses, in whom is the kingdom of God, and that we in whom the Spirit dwells are a royal house. . . . . If, then, the mustard seed is the kingdom of God, and faith is as the grain of mustard seed, faith is truly the kingdom of heaven, which is within us" (*Catena*). "The kingdom of God consists in simplicity of faith, not in persuasive words, but in power plainly shown forth. But faith alone is not sufficient to enter (*On Matt.* 7 : 21. So also Chrysostom). . . . . What, indeed, do we understand by being in the kingdom of God, if not the having escaped eternal death ? But they who have escaped eternal death see the Son of man coming into his kingdom" (*On the Faith*, 2. 5, 9 ; 3. 12). He does not say whether this takes place before the Last Things. He occasionally speaks of the kingdom as celestial (as in *Epistle* 63, on Prov. 10 : 15 *a*) : "And what is that city but Jerusalem which is in heaven, in which is the kingdom of God ?" In sec. 97 of the same: "How much ought we to raise our hopes to the kingdom of God, where will be newness of life ?"

The relation of the church to the kingdom is touched upon in a few places : To Peter he gave the kingdom, calling him the rock, thereby declaring him to be the foundation of the church (*On the Faith*, 4. 5). "The comparison of the leaven is suitable,

for the kingdom of heaven is redemption from sin, and therefore we all, both bad and good, are mingled with the meal of the church, that we all may be a new lump, not harmed by the sins of the evil" (*On Repentance*, 1.15). Here the phrase "the meal of the church" is obscure, but the question is suggested: To enter the kingdom must one first enter the church, as the apostles at first supposed that the gentiles must come to Christianity through Judaism? The Fathers undoubtedly hold the affirmative: that the church is not a temporary institution such as Judaism was. But when the consequences of this view became gradually more apparent, the resulting tendency was inevitable to distinguish the ideal from the actual church, and to identify the ideal with the kingdom. One of the most striking evidences of this transition is the expression "the kingdom of the church," occurring in the *Catena on Luke* from Ambrose: "He shows his own kingdom to be undivided and everlasting. . . . . And therefore the kingdom of the church shall remain for ever, because its faith is undivided in one body."

CHAPTER XVII.

JEROME, RUFINUS, SULPITIUS, AND VINCENT.

1. JEROME usually thinks of the kingdom as the celestial abode, frequently also as God's reign in the world or in the soul. He does not seem to connect the kingdom in thought with the church. He regards rather the form than the rich spiritual content of the kingdom as the principle of the Christian life. That he holds the conception somewhat loosely, retaining little trace of the primitive meanings, is evident from the various definitions of the kingdom which he sets forth, in one passage giving three alternative meanings. The *Catena* supplies a few references.

Stephen the deacon, the first to wear the martyr's crown, would be less in the kingdom of heaven than many bishops, if rank determined the reward (*Against Jovianus*, 1.35). The sheep which stand on the right hand will be brought into the kingdom of heaven; the goats will be thrust down to hell (2.25). The place and the mansions are of course in the Father's house, that is, in the kingdom of heaven, not on earth, etc. (28). No man is happier than the Christian, for to him is promised the kingdom of heaven (*Epistle* 125.1). Abraham and other rich men in the Old Testament, though rich, entered the kingdom of heaven, for they were rich for others (*Against the Pelagians*, 1.10). He apparently thinks of Paradise in two senses, for in *Epistle* 51.5 he says: "Paradise was on earth, for Adam and Eve were made to dwell over against Paradise;" and in *Epistle* 60.3: "Even if Lazarus is seen in Abraham's bosom, still the lower regions cannot be compared with the kingdom of heaven. Before Christ's coming Abraham is in the lower regions; after Christ's coming the robber is in Paradise. . . . . This [reward] is promised us in the resurrection, for as many of us as do not live after the flesh have our citizenship in heaven, and while still here on earth we are told that the kingdom of heaven is within us." In *Epistle* 51.5 he has a characteristic reference to Origen: "He teaches that

the devil will return to his former dignity and rise again to the kingdom of heaven. Apostles and prophets co-heirs of the devil in the kingdom of heaven!"

"Thy kingdom come" is either a general prayer for the kingdom of the whole world that the reign of the devil may cease, or for the kingdom in each of us that God may reign there, and that sin may not reign in our mortal body (*Catena*). In *Epistle* 46. 10, in speaking of the advantage of pilgrimages to Jerusalem: We do not mean to deny that the kingdom of God is within us, or to say that there are no holy men elsewhere. In 58. 3: Access to the courts of heaven is as easy from Britain as it is from Jerusalem, for the kingdom of God is within you. In 118. 4 occurs one of the rare instances in which the kingdom is personified: "The rich find it hard to enter the kingdom of heaven, a kingdom which desires for its citizens souls that soar aloft free from all ties and hindrances." In this quotation, and in the two following, is the nearest approach to the idea of the kingdom as the Christian society: *Against the Luciferians*, 4, he quotes Rev. 1:6: "Made us to be a kingdom," etc.; and in *Epistle* 22. 40, on Matt. 11:12, "The kingdom suffereth violence," he says: "Still, unless you use violence you will never seize the kingdom of heaven."

The following quotations indicate the wide range of ideas which he groups under the kingdom: "The kingdom of God denotes either Himself, of whom it is written in another place, 'The kingdom of God is within you,'[1] and, 'There standeth one in the midst of you whom ye know not;' or surely that kingdom which both John and the Lord himself had preached, 'Repent, for the kingdom of heaven is at hand.' There is also a third kingdom, of holy Scripture, which shall be taken from the Jews," etc. (*Catena on Matt.* 12. 28). Again, from the *Catena:* "The kingdom of heaven is the preaching of the gospel, and the knowledge of the Scriptures which leads to life, concerning which it is said to the Jews, 'The kingdom of God shall be taken from you.' . . . .

[1] In this passage the *Catena* is erroneously translated, "The kingdom of God is among you;" the original reads *intra vos* as usual, with the meaning "within you," as in all the Fathers who quote the verse.

'His Father's kingdom,' Matt. 26:29, I suppose to mean the faith of believers. When the Jews shall receive his Father's kingdom, then the Lord will drink of their vine."

2. RUFINUS seems to regard the kingdom as eschatological, celestial, and eternal. In his *Preface to the Translation of Origen's First Principles:* "By our belief in the coming kingdom, by the assurance of the resurrection from the dead," etc. *On the Apostles' Creed*, 14: Christ when he came brought three kingdoms at once into subjection under his sway, referred to in Phil. 2:10, and conquered all of them by his death. In 34 and 39 he discusses the clause, "Of his kingdom there shall be no end." He has an interesting comment in sec. 7 on Matt. 13:33, 47, where the kingdom is likened to leaven and to a net: "Are we to imagine that the kingdom of heaven is in all respects like leaven? Obviously the illustration was employed simply for this: to show how, through the preaching of God's Word, which seems so small a thing, men's minds could be imbued with the leaven of faith. So likewise in 13:47—are we to suppose that the substance of the kingdom of heaven is like twine? The sole object of the comparison is to show that, as a net brings fishes to the shore from the depths of the sea, so by the preaching of the kingdom of heaven men's souls are liberated from the depth of the error of this world." In sec. 6: "Jesus conducted the people, who had been brought forth from the darkness of ignorance, and recalled from the errors of the world, into the kingdom of heaven." Here the lack of a note of time makes the reference indefinite.

3. To SULPITIUS SEVERUS the kingdom is ordinarily the celestial reward. In *Epistle* 1. 6 (a doubtful letter): The Son of God will say in the judgment, "I promised you the kingdom of heaven; I also placed in Paradise the robber as an example of escape from punishment," etc. In *Epistle* 2. 4 he speaks of the reward and glory to be obtained in the kingdom of heaven, which no one can obtain who does not deserve eternal life by keeping the commandments. In the *Sacred History*, Book 2, chap. 3: The Messiah promised by Daniel will reduce to nothing that world in which exist earthly kingdoms, and will establish another

kingdom, incorruptible and everlasting, that is, the future world, which is prepared for the saints. The faith of some still hesitates about this point only, while they do not believe about things yet to come, though they are convinced of the things that are past. In the preface to Desiderius in his *Life of St. Martin;* "The kingdom of God consists, not of eloquence, but faith," — evidently in the sense of the gospel or the Christian life.

4. In VINCENTIUS OF LERINS the "children of the kingdom" are contrasted with those who "will have their portion in hell" (*A Comminitory*, 6), and in 26 the expression "the inheritance of the kingdom of heaven" occurs, both indicating the celestial conception.

CHAPTER XVIII.

AUGUSTINE.

THE chief works of AUGUSTINE have about 1,300 references to the kingdom, nearly one-third of the whole number in the patristic writings under consideration. In the vast range of his works nearly every phase of the kingdom may be repeatedly met with; but the evangelical view, of the kingdom as the community of souls born anew through the gospel, is ever dominant. In Augustine this view takes its most characteristic form, however, in his explicit, though carefully modified, identification of the kingdom with the church, which is found in several of his treatises, but most fully expressed in *De Civitate Dei* and in his *Tractates on the Gospel of John.* This view, occasionally traceable in patristic thought from the time of Hermas, is nevertheless found even in Augustine in close connection with a clear distinction between the church and the kingdom; showing that the kingdom is generic and the church only its distinctive organized form. He thinks also of the kingdom as the celestial abode; but time and place are incidental and uncertain; to be in a state of salvation is to be in the kingdom of God. The reign of God in the soul is always assumed of the members of the kingdom, but the social idea receives the greater emphasis. A certain progress of his thought of the kingdom may be traced in his writings, and these have therefore been arranged in seven groups, as far as possible with reference to the chronological order of composition of each treatise.

1. *Early general writings.*— In his earliest Christian composition, the *Soliloquies*, the single reference he makes to the kingdom is prophetic of the sweep of his vision: "God, whose kingdom is that whole world of which sense has no ken; God, from whose kingdom a law is even derived down upon these lower realms" (1. 3). In the *Confessions*, Book 11. 2: Let me confess unto thee whatsoever I shall find in thy books, ...

even from the beginning, wherein thou madest the heaven and the earth, unto the everlasting kingdom [or reign] of thy holy city with thee.

"They are peacemakers who, by controlling all the motions of the soul, become a kingdom of God, ... subject to Christ. From a kingdom of this sort brought to peace, the prince of this world is cast out" (*Sermon on the Mount*, Book 1. 2). In the kingdom of him who came to fulfil the law, one will bring benevolence to perfection when he loves an enemy (21). "Thy kingdom come," that is, be manifested to men. As a light which is present is absent to the blind, or to those that close their eyes, so the kingdom of God, though it never departs from the earth, is yet absent to those who are ignorant of it. But no one will be allowed to be ignorant of the kingdom of God, when the Son shall come from heaven visibly to judgment. The coming of his kingdom will be manifested, not after, but in the end of the world. Let us ask that his kingdom may come, whether it be over ourselves, that we may become meek, or from heaven to earth in the splendor of the Lord's advent (Book 2. 6, 10, 11). It is evident that in saying above that the kingdom is invisible to some, although never departing from the earth, he did not have the visible church in mind.

In a notable passage in his treatise *On Holy Virginity*, 24, he speaks thus of the present and future of the kingdom: "What else remains for these [who misinterpret Matt. 19 : 12] save to assert that the kingdom of heaven itself pertains unto this temporal life, in which we now are? For why should not blind presumption advance even to this madness? And what more full of frenzy than this assertion? For although at times the church, even that which now is, is called the kingdom of heaven, certainly it is so called for this end, because it is being gathered together for a future and eternal life. Although, therefore, it has the promise of the present and of a future life, yet in all its good works it looks not to the things that are seen, etc. (2 Cor. 4 : 18; 1 Tim. 4 : 8)." "Why contend you that the kingdom of heaven is to be understood in this life only?" (25). In chap. 9 of the same work occurs a unique designation of the church: "Now, out

of every race and nation, members of Christ may be gathered unto the people of God, and city of the kingdom of heaven." In this first group, generally, the church is distinguished from the kingdom, and the latter is often future or celestial. *On the Faith of Things Not Seen*, 9: The church, which we discern from the toilsome beginning of faith even unto the eternal blessedness of the kingdom. In *Christian Doctrine*, 37: Christ is the head of the church, which is his body, destined to be with him in his eternal kingdom and glory. *On the Work of Monks*, 8: Working only spiritual works in the preaching of the kingdom of heaven and edifying of the peace of the church. In the *Sermon on the Mount*, 1. 15: In that eternal kingdom there are no temporal relationships (as of father and mother). In 1. 8: He that is called least in Matt. 5:19 will perhaps not be in the kingdom at all; the one called great is also in the kingdom. In 1. 4 is another conception of the kingdom: "In the beatitudes the one reward, which is the kingdom of heaven, is variously named. In the first . . . . it is the perfect wisdom of the soul," etc.

2. *Against the Manichæans.*—In this group the kingdom has two distinct meanings, corresponding to present and future time: "For you are not instructed in the kingdom of heaven, that is, in the true catholic church of Christ, as the Lord said, Matt. 13:52. . . . . In the kingdom of heaven there are those who, that they may be perfect, sell or leave all, and follow Christ," etc. (*Reply to Faustus*, 4. 1; 5. 9). On the other hand, in 19. 30: I do not find in the Old Testament the expression "the kingdom of heaven." This expression belongs properly to the revelation of the New Testament, because in the resurrection our bodies shall be spiritual bodies, and so heavenly, that thus we may possess the kingdom of heaven. In 11. 8: We no longer in New Testament times expect a temporal or carnal kingdom of God; and all things are become new, making the promise of the kingdom of heaven, where there shall be no death or corruption, the ground of our confidence. . . . In the hope of spiritual things, that is, of the kingdom of heaven, where the body itself will be, by the change in the resurrection, a spiritual body. In 22. 76: The

doctrine of the New Testament is that we must serve God, not for temporal happiness in this life, but for eternal felicity hereafter.

The church and the kingdom are distinguished from each other in the work *On the Nature of Good*, 48: The keys of the kingdom of heaven in thy holy church. In the *Reply to Faustus*, 22. 67, occurs one of the rare instances in Augustine of the kingdom in the soul: "The kingdom of heaven is within us, Luke 17:21; and we must worship God from our inmost feelings instead of honoring him with our lips." With this may be placed his comment on Rom. 14:17 from the *Catena:* Wisdom is justified of her children, for the holy apostles understood that the kingdom of God was not in meat and drink, but in patient enduring.

3. *Against the Donatists.*—The Catholics, says Neander, in their controversy with the Donatists, distinguished the church on earth, in which genuine and spurious members are mixed together, from the purified church of heaven; but, failing to distinguish the conceptions of the visible and the invisible church, they gave occasion to the Donatists of charging them with supposing the existence of two churches; but they were extremely uneasy under this accusation, and would allow of no other distinction than that of two different conditions, mortal and immortal, of one and the same church[1]. Thus, although the idea of the invisible church is at the center of this controversy, it was neither fully grasped nor consistently carried out, and it was only by Zwingli in 1531 that the phrase "the invisible church" was first used.

In the writings of this group the kingdom is regarded as the inheritance in heaven, of which only those are heirs who are really members of the church. In the *Correction of the Donatists*, 2, he speaks of "the heavenly Jerusalem, that is to say, the true church of God." From this expression it is evident how easy is the transition from the conception of the kingdom to that of the church, whether on earth or in heaven. In similar vein, apparently, is the remark *Against the Epistles of Petilianus*, Book 2.

[1] See NEANDER, *History of the Church*, Vol. II, pp. 246 ff.

55: "Many belong to the kingdom of God who do not cast out devils." Also in 2. 85: The words of Christ, "Beginning at Jerusalem," etc., Luke 24 : 47, show forth the glory which he received from his Father in the wideness of his kingdom. The trend of the argument may be seen in the following quotations: "Bad men may have baptism but do not belong to the holy church of God, though they seem to be within it. Neither does the avaricious man, baptized within the church, become the temple of God, unless he depart from his avarice; for they who become the temple of God certainly inherit the kingdom of God" (*On Baptism, against the Donatists*, 6. 3; 4. 4). "The sacrament of chrism can exist even among the worst of men, wasting their life in the works of the flesh, and destined never to possess the kingdom of heaven. Such men are not in the body of Christ, which is the church, nor within the constitution of the church, which increases in the increase of God in its members through connection and contact with Christ" (*Against the Epp. of Petil.* 2. 105, 109).

4. *Against the Pelagians.*— In this group, which contains his chief controversial writings, his strenuous contention is that only through the new birth by water and Spirit can any soul, infant or adult, enter the kingdom of God, that is, be saved. He constantly quotes John 3 : 3 and 5, referring to the latter verse as "*sententia illa principalis*," meaning perhaps the chief Scriptural utterance concerning the kingdom. The kingdom is therefore the state of salvation, and time and place are secondary, although the references are usually cast in the celestial form. But in this group the present existence of the kingdom is made especially prominent by the repeated quotation of Col. 1 : 13 : "Who delivered us . . . . and translated us into the kingdom of his Son." We are therefore already in the kingdom, even if this obvious result is not always consistently adhered to. The church, now in process of cleansing, is to remain in purity for ever in the kingdom; Augustine does not say in this connection whether it is already in the kingdom, nor further define its relation to the kingdom. The Pelagians held that infants were baptized, not for sin, but in order to enter the kingdom of heaven, which was

either "Paradise" or some of the mansions of the Father's house, not strictly within the kingdom of God. Augustine insists that the Father's house must not be thus divided; that outside the kingdom of God there is no place of salvation.

In the prayer, "Thy kingdom come," that is called the kingdom of God in which his whole family shall reign with him in happiness and forever. He now reigns over all. Therefore, what is in "Thy kingdom come" but that we may deserve to reign with him? The lost will be under his power, but will they be in the kingdom of God? It is one thing to be honored with the gifts and privileges of the kingdom of God, and another thing to be restrained and punished by the laws of the same. It is not necessary now to raise and discuss the question whether the kingdom of God and the kingdom of heaven have the same meaning. It is enough to find (John 3:3, 5) that no one can enter into the kingdom of God except he be washed in the laver of regeneration. Separate not then from the kingdom of God any mansions that are placed in the house of God (*On the Soul and its Origin*, 3. 17). The kingdom of the Most High in Daniel is, of course, none other than the kingdom of God; otherwise anyone might boldly contend that the kingdom of God is one thing and the kingdom of heaven another (*Acts of Pelagius*, 15). In 28: Between the laver and the kingdom, where the church will remain forever without any spot or wrinkle, there is this intermediate time of prayer, during which her cry must of necessity be, "Forgive us our debts." The church, now in process of cleaning, shall continue in the kingdom of heaven forever in a sinless state.

Exsufflation (at baptism) is intended to show that souls were not removed into the kingdom of Christ without first being delivered from the power of darkness (*On Marriage and Concupiscence*, 2. 50). There is a curious circling of ideas in the work *On Forgiveness of Sins and Baptism*, 1. 15, where he says that original sin "not only excludes from the kingdom of God, but also alienates from salvation and everlasting life, which cannot be anything else than the kingdom of God." In the *Gift of Perseverance*, 5: "'Thy kingdom come,' that is, to us, which will

come to all saints. The kingdom of God will come only to those who persevere to the end." In chap. 6 occurs a thought common in Chrysostom: "'Thy will be done on earth,'" may be for a beginning, that is, that earth may imitate heaven, man the angel, the disbeliever the believer. Or, it may be a prayer for perseverance."

5. *The City of God.*—As noted in the Introduction, this work, sometimes reckoned the greatest monument of the patristic age, is a philosophy of history, a treatise on the divine government, with the church as the central fact of both. It treats of God's kingdom in its distinctive form of organization. The *civitas* is two-sided, the two sides being the *regnum* and the *ecclesia*. The church is called the kingdom, not merely in anticipation, but because it is already, on earth and in heaven, an important, if not the essential, part of the kingdom of God. The church is the embodiment of the coming kingdom. In *De Civitate Dei* the great thoughts of the patristic age concerning the kingdom are focalized. To live after the Spirit, to love God rather than self and one's neighbor as himself, is the character of the citizen of the kingdom; "for the life of the *civitas* is a social life." Nowhere is the social element of the kingdom more eloquently urged, and the effect is not weakened, even though the writer's vision is broad and clear enough to compass both the present life and the life beyond.

We may cite first a sentiment which reminds of Hermas; "A house is being built to the Lord in all the earth, even the city of God, which is the holy church. Men through faith are living stones in the house" (8. 24). It is good to draw near to God. And those who have this good in common have, both with him to whom they draw near, and with one another, a holy fellowship, and form one city of God: his living sacrifice, and his living temple. There are no more than two kinds of human society, which we may justly call two cities: the one of those who wish to live after the flesh, the other of those who wish to live after the spirit. This is the great difference which distinguishes the two cities: the one is the society of the godly, the other of the ungodly; each associated with the angels that

adhere to their party; and the one guided and fashioned by love of self, the other by love of God (12. 9; 14. 1, 13). The life of the wise man must be social. For how could the city of God either take a beginning or be developed or attain its proper destiny, if the life of the saints were not a social life? But who can enumerate all the great grievances with which human society abounds in the misery of this mortal state? Who can weigh them? The heavenly city, or rather the part of it which sojourns on earth and lives by faith, makes use of peace. It lives like a captive and a stranger in the earthly city, obeying the laws, calling citizens out of all nations. It avails itself of the peace of earth and makes it bear upon the peace of heaven. In its pilgrim state it possesses this peace by faith, and by this faith it lives righteously when it refers to the attainment of the peace of heaven every good action toward God and man; for the life of the city is a social life (19. 5, 17).

The ninth chapter of Book 31 contains some of his most significant utterances on the subject. While the devil is bound, the saints reign with Christ during the thousand years, which is the time between his first and second coming. They shall gather out of his kingdom all offenses (Matt. 13:41). Can he mean out of that kingdom in which are no offenses? Then it must be out of his present kingdom, the church, that they are gathered. In Matt. 5:19 he speaks of both great and least as being in the kingdom of heaven, and immediately adds, "Except your righteousness exceed, ye shall not enter." We must understand in one sense the kingdom of heaven in which the least and the great exist together, and in another sense the kingdom of heaven into which shall enter he who does what he teaches. Consequently, where both classes exist it is the church as it now is, but where only the one shall exist it is the church as it is destined to be when no wicked person shall be therein. Therefore the church even now is the kingdom of Christ and the kingdom of heaven. His saints, but not "the tares," reign with him in a sense even now, who are in his kingdom in such a way that they are themselves his kingdom.

The following points are important as bearing upon his view

of the future life: The souls of the pious dead reign with Christ and are not separated from the church, though not as yet restored to their bodies (31. 9). The thousand years is the whole interval during which the first resurrection is going on. He that heareth hath everlasting life; that is, by having part in the first resurrection, by which a transition from death to life is made in this present time (31. 9; 20. 6). The city of Rev. 21 : 2 is said to come down out of heaven, because the grace with which God formed it is of heaven. There are many obscure passages in the Apocalypse, but that he shall wipe away all tears is plain and refers to the future world (31. 17). This world shall pass away by transmutation, not by absolute destruction; the fashion of this world passeth away (1 Cor. 7 : 31) (14). In the great conflagration the world is renewed to some better thing, as we ourselves also (16).

6. *On the Psalms.*— It is significant of the way in which the kingdom entered into the fiber of his thought that even his voluminous discourses on the Psalms abound in references to it, containing indeed a larger proportion of references to the kingdom than his other writings. In this work the kingdom has usually the meaning of the future celestial reward; but nearly all the other conceptions occur along with it. The kingdom in the soul is thus beautifully described in 78. 29: "Translated into the kingdom, Col. 1 : 13. This cometh to pass to so much the greater good, as it is a more inward thing, wherein being delivered from the power of darkness, we are in mind translated into the kingdom of God, as God's sheep in spiritual pastures, our faith observable to none, our life hid with Christ in God." Here it is evident that to have the kingdom within is to be within the kingdom. In 149. 3: True Zion or Jerusalem is the church of the saints, in part a pilgrim, in part abiding in the heavens. In 126. 2: Man was a citizen of Jerusalem, but sold under sin he became a pilgrim. This whole life of human affairs is confusion, which belongeth not unto God. In 129. 3: How great evils do we endure, how great are the scandals that every day thicken, as the wicked enter into the church and we have to endure them!

But the kingdom is coming. In 145. 11: "Thy kingdom come. For that kingdom which we desire may come, that kingdom the saints proclaim to be coming." Thus the kingdom is a coming kingdom,

> " . . . . till one greater Man
> Restore us, and regain the blissful seat."

In 72. 17 occurs a thought from Cyprian: "Thy kingdom come. That for which we pray is perhaps concerning Christ himself. For Christ's coming shall make present to believers the kingdom of God." We are again reminded of Hermas, and perhaps in turn of Zech. 9: 12, "Turn ye to the stronghold, ye prisoners of hope!" in 61. 4: "Christ himself is the tower, ... also the rock whereon hath been builded the church. Before thee is the tower: call to mind and go into the tower." A reference to the intermediate state is found in 37. 10: Come, inherit the kingdom. Thou shalt not be there at once, but laid in that place of rest (as Lazarus in Luke 16) thou waitest in security for the day of judgment, when thou art to receive again a body and be made equal to an angel.

The following illustrate the use of the kingdom in the sense of heaven. In 69. 2: The passing both of Christ and of ourselves is hence to the Father, from this world to the kingdom of heaven. In 78. 3: The land of promise is nothing in comparison with the kingdom of heaven, whereunto the Christian people is being led. In 104. 36: If thou fearest hell, and lovest the kingdom of God, watch. In 147. 8: Within these walls are more than will be in the kingdom of God, in the heavenly Jerusalem. The kingdom is used for the state of salvation in 112. 3: Zaccheus bought the kingdom of heaven for half his goods and the widow for two mites, each possessing an equal share. The same kingdom is worth treasures to the rich man and a cup of cold water to the poor.

The church is probably the same as the kingdom in the two following: In 57. 12: The kingdom of Christ we see: where is the kingdom of the Jews? In 45. 12: The martyrs have suffered; and the kingdom of God has made much progress from thence, and advanced throughout all nations. The two

are distinguished in 109. 1: To the church as a whole he gave the keys of the kingdom. On Ps. 110:2: "The Lord shall send the rod of thy power out of Zion," he says: "The prophet is not speaking of that kingdom of Christ in which he reigneth for ever with his Father, for when doth not God the Word reign, who is in the beginning with God? But that reign of temporal government, by which, through the mediation of his flesh, he called us into eternity, beginneth with Christians; of his reign there shall be no end."

7. *Later miscellaneous writings.*— As already stated, the most important of these as bearing on the kingdom is the commentary on the gospel of John, in a series of *Tractates*. Of the more than four hundred references to the kingdom in this last group of Augustine's works, about two-thirds are in Scriptural quotations. The general tenor of the group is similar to that of his other writings, with many supplementary thoughts rather than essentially different ideas. He frequently recognizes two or more interpretations of a passage of Scripture, notably of "Thy kingdom come."

"He is in a certain sense preparing the dwellings by preparing for them the dwellers. Ye are God's temple. This is also the kingdom of God which the Son is to deliver up to the Father. The kingdom will shine forth in the kingdom when the kingdom shall have reached the kingdom. But the realm is not yet reigning. Accordingly it is already so far a kingdom that when all offenses shall have been gathered out of it, it shall then attain to sovereignty, so as to possess, not merely the name of kingdom, but also the power of government. For it is to this kingdom, standing then at the right hand, that it shall be said in the end, 'Come, receive the kingdom;' that is, ye who were a kingdom, but without the power to rule, come and reign; that what you formerly were only in hope, you may now have the power to be in reality. This house of God, therefore, this temple of God, this kingdom of God and kingdom of heaven, is as yet in the process of building, of construction, of preparation, of assembling" (*Tractate on John*, 68. 2).

If this brilliant passage, with its thoroughly evangelical tone,

and the many similar utterances of Augustine, were not overlooked, it is probable that the modern vogue of belittling the Fathers' view of the kingdom would have less currency. It may readily be granted that Augustine was unduly influenced both by his view of the visible church and by the somewhat disheartening spectacle of an empire falling to pieces; but to blame him too severely for his characteristic views of the kingdom, to charge him with despairing of the renewal of society, and with "turning away from the task of elaborating an ideal of a social state influenced by Christian principles," is not only to do him injustice, but to direct attention to the feebleness of the attempts to improve upon him. To say that "the great Fathers at the end of the fourth century had little influence on society" is to run serious risk of being challenged to produce three men of any age whose social influence was more direct and pungent than that of Ambrose, Chrysostom, and Augustine.

"What is his kingdom save those who believe in him, to whom he says, 'Ye are not of this world'? . . . . Of the world are all mankind, created indeed by the true God, but generated from Adam as a vitiated and condemned stock; the regenerated in Christ are made into a kingdom no longer of the world" (115. 1, 2). He ever reigns, indeed, with the Father. But the prophets[2] foretold his kingdom according to that wherein he is Christ made man, and has made his faithful ones Christians. As if he had answered the question in Acts 1:6: "You wish that I should manifest the kingdom now: let me first gather what I may manifest" (25, 2). The first three petitions in the Lord's Prayer ask for blessings that are to be enjoyed for ever; which are indeed begun in the world, and grow in us as we grow in grace (*Enchiridion*, 115). We pray that his kingdom may come in us; that we may be found in it. We ought to be in his kingdom always, to do his will always (*Sermons on New Testament Lessons*, 6. 7, 19). In 81. 6: The church at present is an inn; it will be a home whence we shall never remove, when in

[1] See FREMANTLE, pp. 146 f., 329 f.

[2] This indicates that Augustine regarded their prophecies of the kingdom as spiritual rather than external and eschatological.

perfect health we shall have reached the kingdom of heaven. *On John*, 7. 21: Christ perceived Nathaniel to belong to His church. In *Epistle* 130. 2: While he was still on earth he brought Zaccheus, though rich, into His kingdom.

He deplores the corruption in the church: "For whence exist in the church the great evils under which we groan, save for the impossibility of withstanding the enormous multitude which, almost to the entire subversion of discipline, gain an entrance, with their morals so utterly at variance with the pathway of the saints? . . . . He that is least in the kingdom of heaven, as the church now exists, shall not enter into the kingdom of heaven, as the church shall be hereafter, Matt. 5: 19, 20" (*On John*, 122. 7, 9). But the church itself is not corrupted. In *Epistle* 91. 3: Now the churches which are multiplying throughout the world are, as it were, seminaries of public instruction for morality and above all for the worship of God, who commands, and gives grace to perform, all those things by which the soul of man is furnished and fitted for fellowship with God, and for dwelling in the eternal heavenly kingdom. In *Sermons on New Testament Lessons*, 30. 8: Troublous times! such as we are, such are the times. But what can we do? We cannot, it may be, convert the mass of men to a good life. But let the few who do give ear live well, and endure the many who live ill. The corn in the floor has the chaff, but will not have it in the barn. Evils abound in the world, in order that the world may not engage our love. The world itself is good: evil men make it evil. When the Winnower comes, there will be a bodily separation, which a spiritual separation now precedes. In 7. 6: "'Thy will be done' may be understood in many ways. We wish well for our enemies, that they, too, may believe and become Christians." It is sometimes forgotten that this last is a sentiment of Augustine.

In regard to some of the Last Things, he says: All the dead are sleeping; but the good, in joy; the evil, in torments. The church possesses the faithful dead in peaceful sleep (*On John*, 49. 122). The saints shall succeed to the place of the fallen angels, and shall dwell forever in that peaceful abode from which

they fell. After the resurrection and final judgment there will be two kingdoms, Christ's and the devil's, each with its own distinct boundaries, both consisting of angels and of men (*Enchiridion*, 30. 111.) Here Origen's speculation as to universal restoration is excluded.

With all his learning, Augustine remained a learner. In the *Sermons on New Testament Lessons*, 35. 9, he says: An end there will be to all earthly kingdoms. If the end be now, God knoweth. In the *Epistle to Optatus*, 8: "I would rather know when the desire of all nations shall come and when the kingdom of the saints will be, than how my soul came to its earthly abode, much as I desire to know this."

CHAPTER XIX.

CASSIAN.

In this monk of Bethlehem and of Marseilles we meet with some of the most definite statements concerning the spiritual nature of the kingdom. He was also a leader of the Semi-Pelagians, holding that "the good that we do depends partly on grace and partly on free-will." In a tour of seven years with a friend, Germanus, among the monasteries of Egypt he diligently conferred with their abbots, and many years later wrote his book of twenty-four *Conferences*, which may be in part ideal compositions of Cassian himself. These display an exceptional insight into the kingdom regarded as God's rule in men's souls. While the stress is laid upon the individual side, the primary view of the kingdom as the company of those who have this divine life within them is recognized. His concrete view, usually, however, takes the kingdom as the reward in heaven. In his *Institutes of Monks*, Book 12. 15: "Fixing their gaze on those whom they knew to be really free from sin and already in the enjoyment of eternal bliss in the kingdom of heaven." *On the Incarnation, against Nestorius*, Book 1. 3: "The Pelagians say that men can reach the heavenly kingdom by their own exertions." In Book 3. 12: "It is clear that none can enter the gate of the kingdom save one to whom the key bestowed on the churches is revealed by you (Peter)." In comparison with the church the monastery and convent have naturally a high estimate in Cassian. As generally in the Fathers whose spiritual view of the kingdom is conspicuous, regarding it as an ethical fact and force of eternal validity, there is an almost imperceptible transition to and from the idea of reward in a state of bliss. Alternative meanings are often recognized. The following references are from the *Conferences*.

In the *First Conference of the Abbot Moses*, 3: "The end of our profession is the kingdom of God or the kingdom of heaven; but the immediate aim or goal is purity of heart." In chap. 5:

"The end indeed is eternal life as the apostle declares, Rom. 6. 22: but the immediate goal is purity of heart, which he calls sanctification," etc. In chap. 9 certain notes of a true Christian society are well indicated: "The Lord promises the reward of the kingdom of heaven to these works of mercy, etc., when he says, 'Come, ye blessed,' in Matt. 25: 34. How, then, shall these works be taken away, which admit the doers of them into the kingdom of heaven?" The abbot answers: "Not the reward, but the doing of these things will come to an end. For what you call works of religion and mercy are needful in this life, while these inequalities and differences of condition still prevail; but even here we should not look for them to be performed, unless such a large proportion of poor, needy, and sick folk abounded, which is brought about by the wickedness of men, viz.: of those who have grasped and kept for their own use, without however using them, those things which were granted to all by the Creator of all alike. . . . . In the life to come this will give way to the love of God and contemplation, where equality will reign," etc. And that such a "life to come" is conceivable on earth seems to follow from such passages as the following, from chap. 13, on *The Kingdom of God and the Kingdom of the Devil:* "For everything depends on the inward frame of mind, and when the devil has been expelled from this, and sins no longer reign in it, it follows that the kingdom of God is founded in us, as the evangelist says, Luke 17: 20, 21. But nothing else can be 'within you' but knowledge or ignorance of truth, and delight either in vice or in virtue, through which we prepare a kingdom for the devil or for Christ in our heart; and of this the apostle describes the character, when he says, Rom. 14: 17, 'The kingdom of God is not meat and drink,' etc. And so, if the kingdom is within us, and the actual kingdom of God is righteousness and peace and joy, then the man who abides in these is most certainly in the kingdom of God, and, on the contrary, those who live in unrighteousness have their place in the kingdom of the devil, and in hell and death. For by these tokens the kingdom of God and the kingdom of the devil are distinguished."

There follows in the same chapter a shading off of the thought of the kingdom from this vivid sense of it as a present reality, first to the celestial view, then to a threefold aspect of the kingdom in the abstract or formal sense of dominion. "The apostle does not say that every joy is the kingdom of God, but that joy alone which is in the Holy Ghost. . . . . The heavenly powers on high, who are truly in the kingdom of God, are in perpetual joy. . . . . In fact the kingdom of heaven must be taken in a threefold sense: either that the heavens shall reign, that is, the saints over other things subdued, according to Luke 19:17 and Matt. 19:28; or the heavens themselves shall begin to be reigned over by Christ, when all things are subdued unto him and God begins to be all in all; or else that the saints shall reign in heaven with the Lord."

"Thy kingdom come." The pure heart desires that the kingdom of its Father may come at once, namely: either that whereby Christ reigns day by day in the saints, which comes to pass when the devil's rule is cast out of our hearts and God begins to hold sway by virtues; or else that which is promised in due time to all who are perfect, when Christ will say, "Come, ye blessed of my Father" (*First Conf. of Isaac*, 9. 19). Those cannot see Christ coming in his kingdom who are still in a state of Jewish weakness, not able to say, "Now we know him" (2 Cor. 5:16), but only those who are able to look on him with pure eyes of the soul (*Second Conf. of Isaac*, 6. 10). Those who show a splendid violence, not to others, but to their own soul, by a laudable violence seize upon the kingdom of heaven (*of Abraham* 26. 24). In the *First of Chæremon*, 6. 11, the kingdom is regarded as the reward of virtue, and thus naturally placed lower than virtue itself, God's kingdom in the soul. "Three things enable men to control their faults: (1), a fear of hell or of the laws; (2), the hope and desire of the kingdom of heaven; (3), a liking for goodness itself and the love of virtue."

A passage of singular beauty and significance, recognizing the inherent weakness of the monastic idea, is found in *Piamun*, 16. 18: "Unless our mind is strengthened by the power of his protection who says in the gospel, 'The kingdom of God is

within you,' in vain do we fancy that we can defeat the plots of our airy foe by the aid of men who are living with us, or that we can avoid them by distance of place, or exclude them by the protection of walls. . . . . For just as 'The kingdom of God is within you,' so 'A man's foes are they of his own household.' For no one is more my enemy than my own heart, which is truly the one of my household closest to me. Where those of our own household are not opposed to us, there also the kingdom of God is secured in peace of heart."

CHAPTER XX.

LEO THE GREAT AND GREGORY THE GREAT

1. The references of Leo to the kingdom, in the selection of letters and sermons here considered, are for the most part celestial. He does not apparently think of the church as the kingdom. In *Epistle* 162: "The Catholic faith, that solid rock on which the city of God is built." In *Sermon* 3. 3: Peter is the doorkeeper of the kingdom of heaven. In 73. 2: To Peter beyond the rest the care of the Lord's flock is intrusted, in addition to the keys of the kingdom. In 33. 5: Whoso lives religiously in the church is like the heavenly light. Help one another, that in the kingdom of God, which is reached by right faith and good works, you may shine as the sons of light. In 54. 7: He opens the way to heaven, and by the punishment of the cross prepares for you the steps of ascent to the kingdom. In 95. 5: "They shall inherit the earth." This is not distinct from our heavenly dwelling, since it is no other than these who are understood to enter the kingdom of heaven. The "earth" is the flesh of the saints, which will be changed in the resurrection, so as to be in complete harmony with the soul, etc.

In certain passages the kingdom of Christ and of God is regarded as a present reality, but evidently more in the sense of dominion than of the subjects who compose the realm. In *Sermon* 21. 3: "Thou wert rescued from the power of darkness and brought out into God's light and kingdom. Do not again subject thyself to the devil's thraldom." In 66. 7: "Christ, the true light, rescues from the power of darkness and transfers us into the kingdom of the Son of God (Col. 1:13)." In 90. 3: "'Thy kingdom come:' *i. e.* that God may subdue those whom he has not subdued, and make men on earth ministers of his will. In seeking this we love God and also our neighbor: our love has but one object, that the servant may serve and the Lord have rule."

2. Generally reckoned as the last of the Latin Fathers, GREGORY is a century and a half later than Leo. With him the kingdom almost uniformly means heaven, the usual designation being "heavenly kingdom." In *Epistle* 5. 20, on Matt. 16:19: "He received the keys of the heavenly kingdom, and power to bind and loose is given him; the care and principality of the whole church is committed to him, and yet he is not called the universal apostle." In the *Epistle to Leander*, 1.43: "Keep watch over King Reccared (a Visigoth in Spain), that he may show by his works that he is a citizen of the eternal kingdom, to the end that after a course of many years he may pass from kingdom to kingdom." A similar thought often recurs in the epistles. In the *Pastoral Rule*, Part 3. 15: "In the judgment those who have not wrought good works will sue in vain for entrance into the kingdom."

In the *Catena*, however, occur a number of references which show that he regarded the kingdom as the present church, usually in alternative interpretation, thus: "Or, by the kingdom of heaven is to be understood the present church." In another place: "Or otherwise, the holy church is likened to a net, by which each man is drawn into the heavenly kingdom out of the waves of this present world; the reprobate having lost the light of the inward kingdom are cast forth into the outer darkness. The shore signifies the end of the world; the shore shall discover what the net of the church has brought to land." Here his thought seems to be influenced by Augustine. Perhaps his "inward kingdom" points to God's reign within; but the meaning is somewhat uncertain, as also in *Epistle* 47, *to Dominicus:* "We look to the returning of the Master of the house, after receiving his kingdom, to take account of us."

CHAPTER XXI.

ADDITIONAL REFERENCES FROM THE *CATENA AUREA*.

A. PATRISTIC.

1. CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA (d. 444). "The kingdom of God is within you; that is, it rests with you and your own hearts to receive it."

2. VICTOR OF ANTIOCH (early in the fifth century). One evangelist simply says "to preach," the other added "the kingdom of God," which is Christ himself.

3. PSEUDO-CHRYSOSTOM. The floor is the church, the barn is the kingdom of heaven, the field is the world. "Thine is the kingdom" has reference to "Thy kingdom come;" that none should therefore say, "God has no kingdom on earth."

The kingdom of God is that in which God reigns; it is clear that the kingdom of God is confined neither by place nor by time.

4. PSEUDO-JEROME. "The kingdom of God is the church, which is ruled by God, and herself rules over men, and treads down the powers which are contrary to her," etc.

"For he must repent, who would keep close to eternal good, that is, to the kingdom of God."

5. PSEUDO-AUGUSTINE. "For then cometh the kingdom of God, when we have obtained his grace. For he himself says, 'The kingdom of God is within you.'"

B. POST-PATRISTIC, AS USUALLY RECKONED.

1. BEDE (d. 735). "Or else the present church is called the kingdom of God; and some of the disciples were to see the church built up," etc. (on Mark 9: 1).

"The kingdom of God, that is, the doctrine of the gospel."

"Or the kingdom of God means that he himself is placed in the midst of them, Luke 17: 21, that is, reigning in their hearts by faith." (In his *Church History* Bede constantly speaks of the kingdom in the sense of heaven.)

2. Rabanus Maurus (d. 856). On Matt. 21:43: "Yet the kingdom of God may be understood by the gentiles, or of the present church, in which the gentiles go before the Jews, because they are more ready to believe."

3. Remigius of Auxerre (fl. 880). On Matt. 3:2: The kingdom of heaven has a fourfold meaning: (1) It is said of Christ, as, "The kingdom of God is within you;" (2) of Holy Scripture, as, "The kingdom of heaven shall be taken from you, and given to a nation," etc.; (3) of the holy church, as, "The kingdom of heaven is likened unto ten virgins;" (4) of the abode above, as, "Many shall come . . . . and sit down in the kingdom of heaven." And all these significations may be here understood.

He calls the Son of God himself the kingdom of heaven, for he saith: "The kingdom of heaven is like unto a man that sowed good seed."

4. Theophylact (d. *cir.* 1107). "As if he said, Mark 1:15, 'From this time the kingdom of God will work,' that is, a conversation according to the gospel, which is with reason likened to the kingdom of heaven. For when you see a man living according to the gospel, do you not say that he has the kingdom of heaven, which is not meat and drink, but righteousness, etc. (Rom. 14:17)?"

"When they are healed in their soul, the kingdom of God comes nigh unto them."

Besides these there are many quotations in the *Catena* which give the celestial sense to the kingdom. Together they make it clear that in the transition period between the patristic and scholastic ages, while the general social force of the term is rare, the identification of the kingdom with the church is almost as much in evidence as the conception of it as something inner and spiritual.

CHAPTER XXII.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION.

In the preceding chapters the Fathers have told the story of their views of the kingdom of God. In the present chapter we may group around the leading conceptions the names of those who held them, and finally attempt to answer the questions with which we set out in the Introduction.

These conceptions may be considered in the following order:

I. The conception of the kingdom as the Christian society on earth.

II. The eschatological conception: the kingdom as future, to be set up at the second coming of Christ: (*a*) the millennium; (*b*) indefinite—without the millennial idea.

III. The kingdom as celestial.

IV. The kingdom as the church.

V. The kingdom as God's reign in the soul.

VI. The kingdom as the chief good, or some element of it.

I. THE KINGDOM AS THE CHRISTIAN SOCIETY ON EARTH.

Irenæus: Unbelievers are outside the kingdom of God. The heavenly kingdom is honorable to those who have known the earthly one.

Clement of Alexandria: The "violent" take the kingdom by prayer and a good life. The least in the kingdom, *i.e.*, Christ's disciple, is greater than John.

Origen: One is made a disciple to the kingdom of heaven when he becomes a Christian. Christ himself instructs his disciples, and forms them into a kingdom worthy to deliver up to God.

[The Apostolic Constitutions: Having given the kingdom to you, he expects the fruits of your gratitude and piety.]

The Clementine Recognitions: From the oneness of mind of the beloved the peaceful kingdom of God is constructed.[1]

[1] From the context in the *Recognitions* it is doubtful whether the social sense is in mind. See p. 32 above.

TERTULLIAN: It is written, "A kingdom also and priests to his God and Father hath he made us." He awards the kingdom to his disciples as he says it had been appointed to himself by the Father. There is an earthly and a heavenly dispensation.

VICTORINUS: He made us a kingdom, *i. e.*, a church of all believers. The kingdom of Christ is now eternal in the saints, although the glory of the saints shall be manifested after the resurrection.

EPHRAEM SYRUS: Mary says to the magi: "When my Son's kingdom shall arise, may he plant his standard in your country."

GREGORY NAZIANZEN: Baptism is the key of the kingdom of heaven. He is not within the kingdom who merely desires to attain to it (neglecting baptism, etc.).

GREGORY OF NYSSA: To disciples of the Word come the glad tidings that man is no longer outlawed, nor cast out of the kingdom of God, but is once more a son, etc.

CHRYSOSTOM: When the heathen behold in us a good life, they will look upon the very face of the kingdom of heaven, and they too will be reformed. Thus will the kingdom be perfected; earth being transformed into heaven, the kingdom may be already in possession here.

JOHN OF DAMASCUS: The state of those who live according to the divine laws is to be declared the kingdom of God.

HILARY: We are the kingdom which Christ is to deliver up to the Father. The young man was "not far from the kingdom," not yet within it, because he had not confessed Christ as Lord.

AMBROSE: Christ came to earth to prepare a kingdom from among us. We are the kingdom, first of Christ, then of the Father. But they reign together. Where Christ is, there is his kingdom.

AUGUSTINE: That kingdom which we desire may come, the saints proclaim to be coming. We ought to be in his kingdom always, to do his will always. While the devil is bound, the saints reign with Christ during the thousand years between

the first and second coming. What is his kingdom, save those who believe in him? The kingdom of God, though it never departs from the earth, is absent to those who are ignorant of it. The church even now is the kingdom of Christ and the kingdom of heaven, in process of being gathered together.

CASSIAN: That kingdom whereby Christ reigns day by day in the saints, when the devil is cast out and God reigns in our hearts. If the kingdom of God is within us, and the actual kingdom of God is righteousness and peace and joy, then the man who abides in these is most certainly in the kingdom of God, etc.

[LEO THE GREAT: Thou wert rescued from the power of darkness, and brought out into God's light and kingdom.]

II. THE KINGDOM TO BE SET UP OR INAUGURATED AT THE SECOND COMING OF CHRIST.

1. *The Millennium.*—Until the middle of the third century millennial views prevailed apparently unchallenged, while frequently, no doubt, existing side by side with the less definite views (see 2 below). The Apocalypse (see above, p. 12) gave a basis for this doctrine, which was first treated in detail by PAPIAS, only a few fragments of his writings having survived. He taught the Jewish tradition of a millennium, saying that after the resurrection Christ would set up a material kingdom on earth, and reign in the flesh with the saints. The pleasures of sense were to be enjoyed, as in the Moslem Paradise, with marvelous vines, each twig bearing ten thousand clusters, etc. This period was to be of long duration; Lightfoot, p. 529, reads ten thousand years. The heretic CERINTHUS, who left no writings, taught similar views earlier, perhaps, than Papias.

We find the millennial expectation in JUSTIN MARTYR, IRENÆUS, HIPPOLYTUS, the APOCRYPHAL WRITINGS, TERTULLIAN, in whom the doctrine is most fully given,[1] and in LACTANTIUS. The first opponent of the traditional view of the Apocalypse was DIONYSIUS OF ALEXANDRIA. He vigorously combated the millennial views as taught by Cerinthus, as did also CAIUS and VIC-

[1] Tertullian makes the millennium a prelude to heaven. See p. 38 f. above.

TORINUS. These views were gradually disavowed by the Fathers, and finally AUGUSTINE threw the case out of court by making the millennium the period between Christ's first and second coming.

2. *Indefinite — without the millennial idea.* — This general eschatological view, which we have seen to be the prevailing view of the apostles, was common among the Fathers. While the establishment or at least the consummation of the kingdom is looked for at the end of the present dispensation, it is often left an open question whether the kingdom will then continue on earth or be removed to another stage. This view is thus evidently transitional to that which makes the kingdom definitely celestial, or even now existent in heaven, whither the believer enters at death. A remarkable blending of the two is found in the apocryphal *Vision of John:* "The whole world and Paradise shall be made one, and the righteous shall be on the face of all the earth with my angels, as in Ps. 37 : 29."

Here we find certain utterances of CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA, METHODIUS, the APOSTOLIC CONSTITUTIONS, the CLEMENTINES, CYPRIAN, VICTORINUS, COMMODIANUS, APHRAHAT and AUGUSTINE.

Others of the Fathers without doubt held similar opinions; and, as usual, these views are frequently expressed with others more definite or even at variance with them.

III. THE KINGDOM AS CELESTIAL.

Where the kingdom of God is regarded simply as heaven, the present celestial world, it marks a departure from the New Testament conception, in both the social and eschatological forms, in that the kingdom is taken away from the earth. But the later epistles probably supply a point of departure even for this view, as 2 Pet. 1 : 11 ; 2 Tim. 4 : 18. Moreover, it is commonly the case that several distinct conceptions of the kingdom are held together, so that the view of it as celestial may be only additional or supplementary to the writer's prevailing view.

The thought of the kingdom as the state of bliss in heaven is much more general than any other single opinion about it in

the Fathers. It occurs with greater or less emphasis in all the important writers, and in some of them is conspicuous, as in several of the apostolic Fathers, the *Liturgies* as a whole, CYRIL, EUSEBIUS, and GREGORY THE GREAT. The scriptural reference most often quoted is Matt. 25 : 34,[1] being commonly understood as a summons to the righteous to enter and enjoy the felicity of heaven. As a rule, those who regard most highly the spiritual and ethical elements of the kingdom think the less about it as a celestial reward. This is noticeable in CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA, CYPRIAN, ATHANASIUS, GREGORY NAZIANZEN, AMBROSE, CHRYSOSTOM, AUGUSTINE, and others.

IV. THE KINGDOM AS THE CHURCH.

The *Shepherd of Hermas*, while not expressly identifying the kingdom of God with the church, seems in some instances to use the terms interchangeably. His influence can be traced in the patristic age through the *Clementine Recognitions*, HILARY, and perhaps others, to AUGUSTINE himself, by whom the identification of church and kingdom is elaborately wrought out. It is well known what a vast influence this conception has exerted, especially in the church of Rome. It has, no doubt, a point of attachment in the great commission to Peter (*cf.* Introduction, 11). The relation of the church to the kingdom is very differently expressed in different Fathers, and in the same writer the two are sometimes distinguished from each other in one passage and made substantially identical in another. There is no uniform usage.

A few citations will recall the various points of view. ORIGEN: We are even in the present life placed in the church, in which is the form of that kingdom which is to come. CYPRIAN: He cannot be a martyr who is not in the church; he cannot attain unto the kingdom who forsakes that which shall reign there. CHRYSOSTOM: In Egypt Christ's kingdom shines forth in its brightness. AMBROSE: The kingdom of the church shall remain forever, because its faith is undivided in one body. AUGUSTINE: Although at times the church, even that which now

[1] *Cf.* tables on p. 107.

is, is called the kingdom of heaven, it is because it is being gathered together for a future and eternal life.

V. THE KINGDOM AS GOD'S REIGN IN THE SOUL.

This important conception centers in Luke 17:21, "The kingdom of God is within you." It is thus uniformly rendered in the Fathers, and often associated with Deut. 30:11–13. In modern times it has occasionally been translated, "The kingdom of God is among you," partly on the ground that the words were addressed to the Pharisees; partly on the ground that the great thought involved is not definitely found elsewhere in Christ's teaching about the kingdom. But the reference of the words is general, not applied especially to the Pharisees: the Fathers seem rightly to understand them as addressed "to the apostles," "to us." Among the Fathers who quote and treat this passage are ORIGEN, TERTULLIAN, CYPRIAN, ATHANASIUS, BASIL, GREGORY OF NYSSA, HILARY, AMBROSE, JEROME, AUGUSTINE, and CASSIAN.

It is of great significance that such marked stress is laid upon this inner, spiritual phase of the kingdom. As the kingdom depends directly upon the divine life in renewed souls, it is hardly conceivable that a just, well-balanced idea of the kingdom could have existed without such a word of Christ. That it has prevented one-sided views of the kingdom as the church, or as heaven, from becoming too prevalent, seems evident.

VI. THE KINGDOM AS THE CHIEF GOOD, OR SOME ELEMENT OF IT.

Not only has the prayer "Thy kingdom come" been interpreted as a petition for all blessings and rewards, present and future, but there is hardly a good thing within the gift of God which has failed of being identified, or at least named, with the kingdom. Thus Christ himself is identified with the kingdom by TERTULLIAN, CYPRIAN, HILARY, JEROME, AUGUSTINE, VICTOR OF ANTIOCH, and essentially by several others. METHODIUS calls the kingdom eternal life; CHRYSOSTOM, love; AMBROSE, redemption; GREGORY NAZIANZEN, the vision of God uniting himself with the soul; the CLEMENTINES, "God has concealed the kingdom, as a hid treasure"; PSEUDO-JEROME, eternal good. The kingdom is thought of as in a sense the state of salvation,

by IRENÆUS, CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA, the *Clementine Recognitions*, and AUGUSTINE. *Cf.* also CYRIL. These definitions, it may be noted, are quite in the spirit of Rom. 14 : 17 and 1 Cor. 4 : 20, and are as a rule, with many others cited in the preceding pages, referable to a Scriptural source.

We may now recur to the questions at the beginning: To the first, What was understood by the "kingdom of God" in the early Christian centuries? the Fathers of the church have been summoned to give answer in their own words. The second, To what extent was the New Testament usage followed, and wherein was it departed from? may be partly answered by referring to the tables of Scriptural quotations at the end; partly by bearing in mind the general tenor of interpretation on the subject by the Fathers. Is there not, on the whole, considering the extreme complexity of the conception, the kingdom of God, a surprising conformity to the teaching of Scripture? There may be vagaries of a Tertullian, a Lactantius, an Origen, in their speculations; but it may be questioned whether any great Christian doctrine has suffered less in its transmission through the age of the Fathers. And the impression grows rather than lessens, that where the New Testament usage was departed from by the Fathers on this theme, it was more a development of doctrine, in the light of Providence and the Spirit's guidance, than a perversion of the truth.

This leads to the final question: Did the Fathers on the whole preserve the great idea and hand it down, or did they lose it? The former of these alternatives seems the correct one. When we remember that whether Christ himself changed his view of the kingdom during his ministry, in any case his teaching about it not only varied widely, but emphasized "the mysteries of the kingdom of heaven;" that the apostles' view already indicates that distinct progress in the conception had been made; that in the vicissitudes of the centuries following, the Fathers adhere, to an extent somewhat remarkable, to the language and spirit of the New Testament; we can hardly charge them with having lost the great idea of the kingdom of God.

SCRIPTURAL QUOTATIONS.

THE 1,410 Scriptural references to the kingdom which are made by the Fathers in their writings under consideration are distributed in 26 books, including three of the Apocrypha, 86 chapters, and 143 verses. Of the verses 118 are in the New Testament, 21 in the Old Testament, and 4 in the Apocrypha. Of the whole number of quotations, 745, or nearly 53 per cent. are from Matthew. Forty-two verses are quoted ten times or more each, as follows:

	Times		Times
Matt. 25:34	95	Dan. 7:14	23
John 3:5	68	Matt. 13:52	19
Matt. 6:10	54	1 Cor. 6:9	19
Matt. 6:33	49	Matt. 3:2	18
1 Cor. 15:50	46	Matt. 5:10	17
1 Cor. 6:10	41	Matt. 19:24	16
1 Cor. 15:24	39	Rom. 14:17	16
Matt. 5:3	38	Matt. 4:17	15
Matt. 19:12	38	Matt. 8:12	15
Gal. 5:21	32	Matt. 13:11	15
Col. 1:13	32	Eph. 5:5	15
Matt. 5:20	31	Luke 1:33	14
John 18:36	27	Luke 9:62	14
Matt. 8:11	26	Ps. 22:28	14
Matt. 16:19	25	Matt. 21:31	12
Matt. 5:19	24	Acts 1:6	12
Matt. 11:12	24	Matt. 11:11	11
Matt. 7:21	23	Matt. 12:25	11
Matt. 13:43	23	Matt. 16:28	11
Luke 17:21	23	Matt. 18:3	11
Ps. 45:6	23	John 3:3	11

The following twenty-six verses are quoted once each:

Numb. 24:7	Mark 1:15	Luke 19:11
Ps. 145:11	Mark 4:30	Luke 22:16
Dan. 4:3	Mark 10:24	Acts 8:12
Dan. 4:25	Mark 11:10	Acts 20:25
Dan. 6:26	Luke 8:1	Acts 28:23
1 Esdr. 4:40	Luke 9:11	2 Pet. 1:11
Wisd. 5:17	Luke 10:9	Rev. 5:10
2 Macc. 7:9	Luke 10:11	Rev. 11:15
Matt. 4:23	Luke 18:17	

Ante-Nicene Fathers whose writings, largely fragmentary, contain no reference to the kingdom of God.

Alexander of Cappadocia
Alexander of Lycopolis
Anatolius
Apollonius
Aristo of Pella
Arnobius
Asterius Urbanus
Bardesan
Callistus
Claudius Apollinaris
Dionysius of Corinth
Malchion
Maximus of Jerusalem
Pamphilus
Pantænus
Phileas
Pierius
Polycrates of Ephesus
Quadratus of Athens
Rhodon
Serapion of Antioch
Theognostus
Theonas
Theophilus of Cæsarea
Urban I.
Zephyrinus

INDEX OF REFERENCES* TO THE KINGDOM IN THE WORKS OF THE FATHERS UNDER CONSIDERATION.

THE APOSTOLIC FATHERS.

(Total, 57.)

CLEMENT OF ROME: Ep. to the Corinthians, ch. 42, 50, (54)—3.

THE "SECOND EPISTLE OF CLEMENT," ch. 5, 6, 9, 11, 12,[2] (17)—7.

EPISTLE OF BARNABAS, ch. 4, 7, 8,[2] 21—5.

THE DIDACHÉ, ch. 8, 9, 10—3.

THE TESTAMENTS OF THE TWELVE PATRIARCHS: Judah, 22, 24; Joseph, 19; Benjamin, 9—4.

THE SHEPHERD OF HERMAS, Similitude, 9, ch. 12,[4] 13, 15,[5] 20,[2] 29, 31[2]—15.

IGNATIUS: Ep. to the Ephesians, 16; to the Philippians, 3; Martyrdom, 2; Spurious Ep. to the Tarsians, 7; to the Antiochians, 14: to Hero, Introd.—6.

POLYCARP: Ep. to the Philippians, 2, 5—2.

PAPIAS, Fragments: In Euseb., Ch. Hist., 3, 39, 12; in Irenæus, Heresies, B. 5, ch. 33; in Photius (Lightfoot, Apos. F., p. 534). *Cf.* Maximus the Confessor in Lightf., p. 534, and Jerome, Illus. Men, 18—3.

ARISTIDES: Apology, 16—1.

EPISTLE TO DIOGNETUS, ch. 9, 10—2.

MARTYRDOM OF POLYCARP (Ep. of the Smyrnæans), ch. 20, 22[2]—3.

RELIQUES OF THE ELDERS IN IRENÆUS: In B. 4, ch. 27, 1—28, 1.

THE ANTE-NICENE FATHERS AFTER THE APOSTOLIC.

GREEK.

JUSTIN MARTYR—Total, 36.

First Apology, ch. 11, 15,[3] 16, 32, 61. Dialogue with Trypho, ch. 31,[4] 32, 34, 38, 39, 45, 51,[2] 56, 63, 68, 76,[3] (79), 105, 116, 117, 118, 120,[3] 139, 140.[2] Fragment from Methodius on the Resurrection, in Photius.

IRENÆUS—Total, 106.

Against Heresies, B. 1, ch. 6, sec. 3; ch. 8, 3;[2] ch. 30, 13; B. 2, ch. 28, 3; ch. 32, 1; B. 3, ch. 6, 1; ch. 9, 2; ch. 11, 8; ch. 12, 13; ch. 16, 4; ch. 21, 4; ch. 21, 8; B. 4, ch. 8, 1;[4] ch. 9, 1; ch. 13, 1; ch. 16, 1; ch. 18, 6; ch. 20, 5, 10,[2] 11,[3] 12; ch. 21, 1; ch. 22, 2; ch. 24, 2; ch. 25, 3; ch. 27, 1, 2, 4;[3] ch. 28, 2; ch. 29, 1; ch. 33, 11; ch. 34, 3; ch. 38, 6;[2] ch. 37, 7;[2] ch. 40, 2;[4] B. 5, ch. 9, 1,[2] 3,[3] 4;[5] ch. 10, 1, 2;[2] ch. 11, 1,[5] 2; ch. 12, 3; ch. 13, 2, 5; ch. 14, 1, 4; ch. 25, 3; ch. 26, 1[2], 2; ch. 27, 1; ch. 28, 1; ch. 30, 4;[2] ch. 32, 1; ch. 33, 1, 2, 3;[2] ch. 34, 2,[2] 3; ch. 35, 1,[2] 2;[3] ch. 36, 2. 3.[3] Fragments: Frag. 9, 34, 36,[2] (42, repetition of 9), 50, 54, 55.[2]

CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA—Total, 78.

Exhortation to the Heathen, ch. 1, 9,[3] 10,[2] 11.[3] The Instructor, B. 1, ch. 5;[4] B. 2, ch. 1,[3] 2, 3, 11, 13; B. 3, ch. 4, 7,[2] 11,[4] 12. Miscellanies, B. 1, ch. 11; B. 2, ch. 19,[2] 20; B. 3, ch. 4,[2] 6,[3] 7, 18;[2] B. 4, ch. 2, 6, 8, 17, 18; B. 5, ch. 1, 3, 12;[2] B. 6, ch. 11, 15; B. 7, ch. 12, 14, 16, 17. Who is the Rich Man that is Saved? sec. 2, 3, 4,[3] 5, 16, 17, 18, 19, 21,[2] 24, 26, 29, 30, 31,[2] 32,[2] 42. Fragments, in Vol. 24, pp. 156, 169.

*When not otherwise described, references to pages are to the Clark and Christian Literature Company translations.

HIPPOLYTUS—Total, 51.

Refutation of All Heresies, B. 5, ch. 2, 3,[6] 4; B. 8, ch. 3; B. 9, ch. 4; B. 10, ch. 30. On Christ and Anti-Christ, 5, 22, 26, 44, 59, 65. Against the Jews, 7. Against the Greeks, 1, 3. Against Noetus, 6. Fragments: On Genesis, p. 415, 422,[2] Vol. 6 (in Jerome, Ep. 36). (On Song of Sol., 440.) On Daniel, 446, 447, 460, 461,[2] 467,[3] 468, 473, 474, 483, sec. 4.[3] From a Homily quoted in Theodoret, Vol. 9, Pt. 2, p. 90. Disputed Writings, p. 104, 116, 122, 125,[2] 126,[4] 127.[2]

ORIGEN—Total, 195.

On First Principles, B. 1, ch. 3, 6;[2] ch. 6, 2;[2] ch. 7, 5;[3] B. 2, ch. 3, 1, 3, 7;[3] ch. 10, 3;[2] ch. 11, 2, 6; B. 3 (ch. 1, 16, Lat.); ch. 6, 9; B. 4 (ch. 1, 2, Lat.), (3), 23 (25, Lat.). From the Commentary on John, B. 1, ch. 10, 23, 37,[2] 40,[2] 41; B. 10, ch. 1,[2] 8, 9, 10,[2] 11, 15, 16,[2] 28. From the Commentary on Matthew, B. 10, ch. 1,[4] 2,[4] 3,[3] 4,[4] 5,[2] 6,[4] 7, 8, 11,[3] 12,[4] 13, 14,[12] 15,[4] 16, 23; B. 11, ch. 4,[3] 16;[2] B. 12, ch. 11,[2] 14,[10] 31,[3] 32,[2] (33), 34,[4] 35;[6] B. 13, ch. 9, 14, 15,[8] 16, 17, 18,[3] 19,[4] 25, 31; B. 14, ch. 7,[7] 8, (12), 13,[4] 14. Against Celsus, B. 1, ch. 6, 39, 56,[3] (60), 66;[3] B. 2, ch. 5, 38, 63, 78;[2] B. 3, ch. 40, 47, 59; B. 4, ch. 3,[3] 10, 42;[2] B. 5, ch. 19, 58; B. 6, ch. 16,[2] 17, (31), 46; B. 7, ch. 23; B. 8, ch. 5, 11,[6] 13, 38, 41, (68).

METHODIUS—Total, 20.

Banquet of the Ten Virgins, Dis. 1, ch. 1; Dis. 2, ch. 7; Dis. 6, ch. 3; Dis. 7, ch. 3, 5, 8; Dis. 8, ch. 4; Dis. 9, ch. 2. On the Resurrection, (ch. 3[2]), 13.[3] In Summary by Photius, 5[2] (6[3] is repetition). Oration on Simeon and Anna, ch. 13.[2] Oration on the Palms, ch. 5.[3]

THE APOCRYPHAL WRITINGS—Total, 30.

Gospel of the Nativity of Mary, ch. 9. History of Joseph the Carpenter, ch. 8, 26. Gospel of Nicodemus, Pt. 1. The Acts of Pilate, first Gk. form, ch. 3, 10, 11 (the same three in Lat. form); second Gk. form, ch. 3,[2] (ch. 9,[2] 11, Cæsar's Kingdom); Lat. form, ch. 14, Pt. 2. The Descent of Christ into Hades, first Lat. form, ch. 10 (second Lat. form, ch. 4). Narrative of Joseph of Arimathea, ch. 3,[2] 5.

NOTE.—The remainder of the references in the Apocryphal Writings, being without sectional divisions, are given according to the pages in Vol. 16 of the Clark edition of the Fathers.

The Avenging of the Savior, 254; The Acts of Peter and Paul, (260), 272, 275; Acts of Philip, 313; Acts and Martyrdom of Andrew, 339;[2] Acts of Andrew and Matthias, 352; Acts of Peter and Andrew, 371; (Acts and Martyrdom of Matthew, 374); Acts of Thomas, 402,[2] 410; Martyrdom of Bartholomew, 434; Acts of Thaddeus, 442; Acts of John, (448), 449; (Revelation of Moses, 465); Revelation of Paul, 479, 492; Revelation of John, 496 (502).

THE APOSTOLIC CONSTITUTIONS—Total, 34.

B. 1, ch. 1; B. 2, ch. 6, 35, 55; B. 3, ch. 12,[2] 18;[2] B. 5, ch. 1, 4, 14, 16;[4] B. 6, ch. 12, 15, 30; B. 7, ch. 24, 25, 26,[2] 32,[2] 35, 38, 41,[2] 43; B. 8, ch. 7, 10, 12, 15.[2]

THE CLEMENTINES—Total, 86.

A.—The Homilies (in Vol. 17): Hom. 1, ch. 6; Hom. 2, ch. 19,[2] 40; Hom. 3, ch. 5, 8, 18,[2] 19, 26, 28, (62); Hom. 8, ch. 21, 23; Hom. 9, ch. 3, 4, 6;[2] Hom. 10, ch. 13, 25; Hom. 11, ch. 26; Hom. 13, ch. 8, 14, 20, 21;[2] Hom. 15, ch. 7; Hom. 18, ch. 15, 16, 17;[2] Hom. 19, ch. 20; Hom. 20, ch. 2.[3] The so-called Epistles: To James, ch. 11, (13), 14, 17; On Virginity (in Vol. 14), ch. 1, 2,[3] 3,[2] 4, 9.

B.—The Recognitions (in Vol. 3), B. 1, ch. 6, 11, 24,[2] 42, 45, 49, 51,[2] 52,[2] 54,[2] 63, 69;[2] B. 2, ch. 20,[3] 21,[2] 22, 28, 30, 46; B. 3, ch. 20, 28, 29, 38, 53, 54,[2] 67; B. 5, ch. 8, 9,[2] 10, 11, 12, 18; B. 6, ch. 9; B. 8, ch. 5; (B. 9, ch. 3); B. 10, ch. 2, 44, 45.

THE LITURGIES—Total, 20.

Of James, 36, 38, 43, 44, 49; of Mark, 4, 5,[2] 15,[2] 17, 18; of the Holy Apostles, 13, 16, 18,[2] 19, 20.[3]

MINOR ANTE-NICENE GREEK FATHERS.

(Total, 50.)

MELITO: Frag. on Faith, p. 127.

HEGESIPPUS (in Eusebius, Ch. Hist., 3, 20, 6): On the Relatives of Christ.

THEOPHILUS OF ANTIOCH (in Vol. 3): To Autolycus, 1, ch. 3.

CAIUS (in Eusebius, Ch. Hist., 3, 28, 2): Against Proclus.

DIONYSIUS OF ALEXANDRIA: On the Promises, 1, 3, 4; Ep. to Fabius, 5, 10.

JULIUS AFRICANUS: On Persian Chronology, p. 198.

GREGORY THAUMATURGUS: Among the dubious writings, Twelve Topics on the Faith, Topic 12;[2] First Homily, p. 118, 119; Hom. 2, p. 128; Hom. 4, p. 147, 148.

ARCHELAUS: Disputation with Manes, ch. 13,[2] 21, 23,[2] 24,[6] 25,[2] 33, 37, 40, 49.

PETER OF ALEXANDRIA: Canonical Epistle, Canon 5, 8,[2] 9.

ATHENAGORAS: Plea for the Christians, ch. 18.

"Selections from the Prophetic Scriptures" (Anon.). (In Vol. 24.) Sec. 12, p. 120.

Syriac Documents: Teaching of Addæus, p. 30. Epistle, 132. Hom. by Mar Jacob, pp. 116, 120, 125. Martyrdom of the Holy Confessors, p. 145.

LATIN.

TERTULLIAN—Total, 161.

A.—Catholic Writings (before 202 A. D.): A Prescription Against Heretics, 13, 22. On Prayer, 5,[4] 6,[2] 9. On Baptism, 13, 20. On Spectacular Shows, 30. On Patience, 11, 13. On Idolatry, 9, (12), 18. On Woman's Dress, 9.[2] To his Wife, 6, 8.

B.—Montanistic Writings: Against Marcion, B. 3, ch. 4, 7,[2] 20, 21,[2] 23, 24;[7] B. 4, ch. 8, 14,[5] 18[2] (*v.* footnote, p. 249 f.), 21, 23,[2] 24,[3] 25, 26,[3] 29,[3] 30,[8] 33,[6] 35,[7] 39[8] (*v.* footnote, p. 365). B. 5, ch. 9, 10,[15] 14. Against Praxeas, 4,[2] 13, 26. On the Scorpion's Bite, 6, 9, (10), 13. Exhortation to Chastity, 7. Answer to the Jews, 6,[2] 14.[2] On the Soul, 39, 55. On Flight in Persecution, 12. On the Flesh of Christ, 4. On the Resurrection of the Flesh, 26,[2] 27, 32, 33,[4] 36, 41, 48, 49,[7] 50,[9] 51.[3] On Fasting, 15.[2] On Monogamy, 3, 7, 8. On Modesty, 1, 14, 16,[3] 17,[2] 21.[2]

CYPRIAN—Total, 142.

(His Life and Passion, by Pontius the Deacon, p. xxiv, Vol. 8.)—Epistles: Ep. 6, 5; Ep. 7, 7; Ep. 25, 3, 4; Ep. 26, 1; Ep. 51, 27; Ep. 54, 4; Ep. 55, 10; Ep. 61, 5; Ep. 62, 9,[2] 14; Ep. 69, 7; Ep. 71, 1; Ep. 72, (11), 16, 21, 22; Ep. 73, 9; Ep. 76, 2, 6,[2] 7[2]; Ep. 78, 2; Ep. 80, 2, 4. On the Dress of Virgins, 4, 5, 21, 23. On the Lapsed, 12. On the Unity of the Church, 4, 6, 14,[3] 15, 19, 27. On the Lord's Prayer, 1, 7, 12, 13,[14] 16, 19, 21,[2] 24, 30, 36. To Demetrianus, 20, 25. On the Pestilence, 2,[2] 18,[2] 22,[2] 26.[2] On Works and Alms, 4, 7, 8, 9,[3] 13, 21, 22, 23, 26.

On the Advantage of Patience, 8, 15. On Jealousy and Envy, 12, 15, 18.[2] Exhortation to Martyrdom, 6, 7, 11, 12,[2] 13.[2] Testimony Against the Jews. Topic 23, B. 1, ch. 12, (15[2]), 23;[3] B. 2, ch. 6, 10, (11[2]), 15, 26, 29,[2] 30; B. 3, ch. 1,[2] 11,[2] 16,[2] 25, 69; B. 4, ch. 19,[2] 20, 25,[2] 32, 44, 52, 60, 64, 65, 69, 96.[2] On the Glory of Martyrdom, 16, 18, 22, 24. On Chastity, 1, 6. Exhortation to Repentance, p. 269. Seventh Council of Carthage, 256 A. D., pp. 202, 203, 206. Vol. 13.

VICTORINUS—Total, 10.

Commentary on the Apocalypse: (On 1:5.) On 1:6. On 1:16. On 5:8, 9. On 7:2. On 14:15. On 15:2. On 19:11. On 20:8–10. On 21:16 f. (*Cf.* "Kingdom of Anti-Christ" *passim.*)

LACTANTIUS—Total 28.

The Divine Institutes, B. 1, ch. 5, 7, 11; B. 2, ch. 11; B. 4, ch. 4, 7, 12,[4] 13,[3] 20;[3] B. 5, ch. 3, (6, 7, 8); B. 7, ch. 6, 19, 23, 26. Epitome, 42, 47,[2] 67, 72.[2] On the Way in which Persecutors Died, 16.

MINOR ANTE-NICENE LATIN FATHERS.

(Total, 12.)

MINUCIUS FELIX: Octavius, 18.

COMMODIANUS: Instructions in favor of Christian Discipline. To the Gentiles, 33. To the Jews, 38, 73.

NOVATIAN: On the Trinity, 10. On Jewish Meats, 5.

Treatise on Rebaptism (Anon.), 3, 9.[2]

By the Pseudo-Isodorus: Of Pontianus, p. 239. Of Anterus, 246. Of Fabian, 261.

THE NICENE AND POST-NICENE FATHERS.

GREEK.

EUSEBIUS—Total, 46.

(Prolog., p. 72.) Church History, B. 1, ch. 2, sec. 26;[2] ch. 3, 14; B. 2, ch. 14, 6; ch. 22, 5; B. 3, ch. 20, 6; ch. 24, 3; ch. 28, 2, 4, 5; ch. 37, 1; ch. 39, 12; B. 6, ch. 7, 2; ch. 41, 14; ch. 42, 5; B. 7, ch. 24, 5; ch. 25, 3,[2] 11; B. 8; ch. 4, 3; ch. 13, 1, 2. The Martyrs of Palestine, ch. 7, 1; ch. 11, 23. The Life of Constantine, ch. 3, sec. 15. (*Cf.* 4, 48.) (Oration of Constantine, ch. 19.) Oration of Eusebius on the Thirtieth Anniversary of Constantine's Reign, ch. 1, 6; ch. 2, 1,[3] 4;[2] ch. 3, 2;[2] ch. 4, 1;[4] ch. 5, 2, 5;[4] ch. 6, 18; ch. 12, 4; ch. 17, 13, 18.

ATHANASIUS—Total, 68.

(Prolog. 21, 33, 36, 44, 62, 69, 74.) Against the Heathen, Pt. 2, ch. 30, 1, 2; ch. 37, 4. On the Incarnation of the Word, ch. 56, 3; ch. 57, 3. (Statement of Faith, 1.) On Luke 10:22, sec. 6. Defense Against the Arians, ch. 3, 47.[2] Defense of the Nicene Definition, ch. 4, 17. On the Opinion of Dionysius, 10. Life of Antony, 17,[2] 20,[3] 45, 94. Defense of his Flight, 1. History of the Arians, 79. Four Discourses Against the Arians: Dis. 1, 12, 46,[3] 47,[2] 48, 49,[2] 61; Dis. 2, 13,[2] 18, 52,[2] 61, 70, 76. (Pref. to Dis. 4.)[2] On the Synods, 25, 26,[4] 49.[2] Letter to the Church at Antioch, 7. To the Bishops of Africa, 11. Letters, Easter of A. D. 330, 2, 7. (Of 332, 4, 3.) Of 333, 5, 3, 6. Of 334, 6, 1, 11, 12. Of 335, 7, 8,[3] 10. Of 338, 10, 4, 5. Of 339, 11, 1, 6. Of 341, 13, 4.[2] Of 342, 14, 5. Of 368 (Ep. 40).[2] Of 371 (Ep. 43). Second to Lucifer (Ep. 51). To Serapion (Ep. 54).

EPHRAEM SYRUS—Total, 21.

From his Testament, p. 134. Nisibene Hymns, 36, 15 and 58, 9. On the Nativity, 1, 2, 4,[2] 7; 13, 3; 17, 1, 14. Hymns for the Feast of Epiphany, sec. 1, 8; sec. 5, 8, 9; sec. 7, 25; sec. 10, 9, 10; sec. 15, 11, 42, 52. Hymn on the Pearl (of the Faith), sec. 1, 1; sec. 4, 4. Homilies: On our Lord, 1,[3] 51, 54. On Admonition and Repentance, 7. On the Sinful Woman, 5, 8, 15.

APHRAHAT—Total, 43.

Demonstrations: Of Faith, 20. Of Wars, 6,[2] 10, 14,[3] (16), 21,[3] 22,[2] 23,[8] 24.[9] Of Monks, 1,[2] 6, 18. On the Resurrection, 18, 21,[2] 22.[2] On Persecution, 21.[2] Of Death and the Latter Times, 24.[3]

BASIL—Total, 26.

Prolog. (26, 34), 51, 56, 57,[3] 64. On the Spirit, ch. 15, 36 (*v.* notes, pp. 22, 28), ch. 29, 72.[2] Letters: To the Cæsareans, sec. 7,[6] 8, 12[3] (*v.* note, p. 122). To Macarius and John, Ep. 18. To a Lapsed Monk, Ep. 44. To the Deaconesses, Ep. 105. To the Alexandrians, Ep. 139. To Bishops of the Sea Coast, Ep. 203. To Amphilochius, Ep. 226, 3. To Bishops of Italy and Gaul, Ep. 243, 3 (*v.* notes, pp. 195, 250).

CYRIL OF JERUSALEM—Total, 53.

(Prolog. 16, 22, 32, 33, 47, 48, 60.) Procatachesis, 16. Catechetical Lectures, 1, 2; 2, 19;[2] 3, 4,[2] 8,[2] 10 (*v.* note, p. 20); 4, 15;[2] 6, 7; 7, 16; 8, 5[2] (*v.* note, p. 58); 11, 16;[2] 12, 18,[2] (23), 24;[2] 13, 30, 31; 14, 26; 15, 1[2] (*v.* note, p. 104), 2, 8, 17, 23, 26,[2] 27,[5] 28, 31, 32,[2] 33;[2] 16, 20; 17, 11, 15, 27; 18, 28; 21, 2; 23, 13.[4]

GREGORY NAZIANZEN—Total, 17.

In Defense of his Flight to Pontus, 70. On his Father's Silence, 9, 19. On the Son, 17. Second on the Son, 4.[2] On the Holy Spirit, 28. On the Words of the Gospel, 20, 21 (*v.* note, p. 345). Oration on the Holy Lights, 16. On Holy Baptism, 3, 22,[2] 24, 45. The Last Farewell, 14. Epistle 4, Div. 2 (in answer to Ep. 14 of Basil).

GREGORY OF NYSSA—Total, 28.

Against Eunomius, B. 1, 42; B. 2, 11; B. 3, 2; B. 4, 2, 3, 9; B. 6, 4;[3] B. 9, 3; B. 11, 3,[2] 5; B. 12, 1. Answer to Eunomius, B. 2, p. 296[2] (*v.* note, p. 256). On the Holy Spirit, pp. 321, 329.[3] On Virginity, 12. On the Early Deaths of Infants, p. 374.[2] On Pilgrimages, p. 382.[2] On the Making of Man, (17, 2); 18, 9; 21, 4. On the Baptism of Christ, p. 519.

CHRYSOSTOM—Total, 694.

On the Priesthood, B. 3, 5. Letter to the Fallen Theodore, Ep. 1, 9,[4] 12,[2] 15, 16, 19 Letter to a Young Widow, 3, 7. Homily on Ignatius, 4. Instructions to Catechumens, 1, 1,[4] 3, 4; 2, 1. On Resisting the Temptations of the Devil, Hom. 3, 2, 3.[2] Against Marcionists and Manichæans, 2, 4.[2] On the Paralytic, 3. Second Homily on Eutropius, 6,[3] 12, 15,[2] 16.[3] Letter to Olympias, 3.[2] On the Statues, Hom. 2, 17, 24; 5, 3, 9, 12;[2] 6, 7; 7, (3), 4;[3] 9, 11; 12, 17; 15, 2, 16; 16, 13,[2] 17;[2] 17, 15; 19, 15; 20, 24; 21, 20.

On Matthew: Hom. 1, (8, 12); 3, 9; 4, 16, 17;[2] 6, 1, (2), 9; 8, 6; 9, 8,[2] 10; 10, 2,[2] 3,[2] 5,[2] 6; 11, 3, 7; 13, 6, 8; 14, 2,[2] 4; 15, 2, 5, 7,[3] 8; 16, 5,[5] 6,[3] 10,[3] 17;[2] 18, 9;[3] 19, 7, 10;[4] 22, 2, 4;[2] 23, 9; 24, 1, 3;[3] 26, 2,[4] 4,[2] 5,[5] 6;[3] 27, 6;[2] 28, 6; 30, 6; 32, 2, 3, 6;[3] 33, 7;[2] 35, 7; 37, 3,[2] 4, 5; 38, 1; 40, 3,[2] 4, 5; 41, (1[3]), 2,[4] 4, 6; 43, 3, 7; 45, 1,[2] 3;

46, 1, 2,[3] 3; 47, 1,[7] 2,[2] 3,[2] 5;[2] 48, 9; 54, 3,[2] 9; 55, 8; 56, 1,[3] 3, 9;[2] 57, 6;[3] 58, 3,[4] 4; 60, 2; 61, 1, 2;[2] 62, 3,[2] 4,[2] 6; 63, 2,[3] 4;[2] 64, 1,[2] 3, 4; 65, 1, 2,[2] (3), 5; 66, 3,[2] 5; 67, 3; 68, 1, 3,[2] 5; 69, 1, (2), 4; 70, 2; 71, 1;[3] 73, 1; 76, 5; 78, 1,[3] 4; 79, 1,[3] 2;[8] 82, 2,[2] (3); 86, 1; 87, 2; 88, 1,[2] 3; 90, 4. On John: Hom. 3, 3, 6; 7, 2; 13, 4; 21, 1; 23, 3; 24, 2,[4] 3;[2] 25, 1,[4] 3; 26, 1; 28, 2;[2] 31, 1; 33, 3; 36, 2; 38, 4, 5; 42, 3;[2] 43, 2; 44, 1, 2; 45, 2, 3;[2] 48, 3; 49,3; 51, 3;[3] 54, 2, 4;[2] 59, 3, 4; 60, 4, 6; 63, 3;[3] 64, 4; 65, 3; 66, 2;[2] 67, 1; 70,1; 77, 1; 78, 4; 79, 1, 2, 5;[2] 83, 4;[4] 84, 1,[3] 2, 3; 85, 1;[3] 87, 3;[2] 88, 3. On Acts: Hom. 1,[4] 2,[9] 4, 6,[7] (*v.* note, p. 46), 9, 13, 15, 16,[2] 17, 18,[2] 19, 23,[2] 24,[2] 29, 30, 31,[2] (*v.* note, p. 202), 36,[2] 40, 41,[7] 43, 44, 45,[3] 55,[4] (*v.* note, p. 326). On Romans: Hom, 1, 3,[4] 5,[2] 7, 9,[4] 11,[2] 12,[2] 14,[5] 15,[8] 16[3] (*v.* note, p. 478), 18,[2] 21, 23,[3] 25,[3] 26,[5] 29, 30, 31 (*v.* notes, pp. 539, 543, 549, 561). On 1 Cor.: Hom. 2, 9,[2] (*v.* note, p. 8); 2, 11; 3, 5,[3] 9; 4, 11; 5, 5, 6, 11; 7, 2; 9, 1, 10; 12, 5; 14, 3,[2] 5;[2] 15, 5, 6, 10, 11, 15;[2] 16, 8,[5] 11; 18, 1;[2] 19, 7; (21, 4); 23, 8; (*v.* notes, pp. 139, 140); 27, 6, 7; 30, 9, (*v.* note, p. 196); 35, 11; 37, 3, 6; 39, 5, 6,[3] 8,[3] 9,[2] 11;[5] 40, 1, 5;[3] 41, 4; 42, 2,[3] 3, 5; 43, 6;[2] 44, 7. On 2 Cor.: Hom. 3, 4, (5); 4, 7; 7, 8; 8, 4; 9, 2,[2] 4; 10, 2, 4, 5; 11, 4, 5, 6;[2] 13, 4;[3] 19, 4;[2] 23, 1, 8; 26, 2, 4; 5; 29, 6;[2] 30, 4. On Gal., ch. 2; ch. 5.[3] On Eph.: Hom. 1,[2] 3, 4,[11] 5, 8,[2] 13, 16,[2] 18,[2] 20, 21, 24. On Philip.: Introd., 4; Hom., 1, 2,[2] 3, 4,[3] 6,[5] 7, 9, 10, 12, 13, 15.[3] On Coloss.: Hom. 2,[13] 3, 8,[2] 10, 11.[5] On 1 Thess.: Hom. 1,[2] 2, 3,[5] 10, 11.[2] On 2 Thess.: Hom. 2,[7] 4. On 1 Tim.: Hom. 6, 10, 11, 13,[2] 15,[2] 17. On 2 Tim.: Hom. 3, 5, 6, 9,[3] 10.[10] On Titus: Hom. 2,[2] 5, 6. On Philemon: Hom. 1, 3. On Hebrews: Hom. 1, 4; 3, 2, 3, 6; 4, 6;[2] 6, 1, 2, 7, 8; 7, 11; 8, 10; 9, 7; 11, 9; 13, 10; 15, 9; 18, 5,[2] 6;[3] 19, 4;[2] 23, 3, 4; 24, 9; 25, 8; 28, 9; 30, 3; 31, 8; 32, 2, 6; 33, 1, 9.[2]

SOCRATES—Total, 7.

Church Hist. (Introd., p. 212), B. 1, ch. 26; B. 2, ch. 18, 19,[4] 30.

SOZOMEN—Total, 3.

Church Hist., B. 2, ch. 27, 33; B. 3, ch. 14.

THEODORET—Total, 26.

Prolog., p. 15, 17, (19), 30. Church Hist., B. 1, 32; B. 2, 2, 6;[2] B. 4, 8;[2] B. 5, 11. Dialogues, pp. 170, 171, 173, 179, 202, 224.[2] Letters, 14, 21,[2] 60, 74, 91, 120, (145), 146.[2]

JOHN OF DAMASCUS—Total, 24.

On the Orthodox Faith, which is Div. 3 of his Fountain of Knowledge. B. 1. On the Trinity, ch. 8[2] (*cf.* original); B. 2, ch. (11), 11, 29; B. 4, ch. 15, (20), 25. Additional, from the Sacred Parallels, under the title, The Kingdom of Heaven, 18 references. See original. Of these, 14 are verses cited which are not included in the list of Scriptural quotations from the Fathers given above.

LATIN.

HILARY—Total, 74.

On the Trinity, B. 2, 33; B. 4, 35;[2] B. 6, 20, 33, 37,[2] 38[2] (*v.* original); B. 7, 6; B. 8, 23, 25; B. 9, 25,[7] 26,[3] 75; B. 10, 33, 34,[5] 67; B. 11, 21,[3] 22, 25,[4] 29, 32,[3] 37,[2] 38,[5] 39;[17] B. 12, 47. On the Synods, or, On the Faith of the Orientals, 34, 38. On the Psalms, Ps. 1, sec. 14. Additional, see on Matt. 12, 32; on Ps. 2, note 42; on Ps. 147, 15; on Ps. 148; *cf.* also on Matt. 5, 34, and Ps. 125. See the article *De Regno Christi a Regno Dei Patris Distincto* in the Benedictine Preface, pp. lxi–lxviii, ed. Paris, 1693.

AMBROSE—Total, 124.

Duties of the Clergy, B. 1, 13, 15, 16,[2] 21, 26, 30, 48, (49), 49; B. 2, 4, 6,[2] 7. On the Holy Spirit, B. 1, 3, 11; B. 2, 2, 7; B. 3, 10,[2] 17,[3] 20,[7] 21. On the Decease of Satyrus, B. 1, 51; B. 2, 94, 101,[2] 105, 116. Of the Christian Faith, B. 1, 1,[3] 2, 4, 5; B. 2, 9, 12;[2] B. 3, 7, 11, 12[26] (*v.* note, p. 258); B. 4, 5;[2] B. 5, 5, 12,[25] 13, 17. On the Mysteries, 2, 4, 6. On Repentance, B. 1, 7,[2] 15; B. 2, 3, (4), 7, 11. Concerning Virgins, B. 1, sec. 6, 7, 11, 12. Concerning Widows, 8, 13.[2] Letters: Ep. 63, sec. 11, 93, 97,[2] 109.

JEROME—Total, 102.

Letters: Ep. 3, 5; 12;[2] 14, 1, 5, 6, 8; 16, 2; 22, 30, 32, 35, 40;[2] 43, 3; 45, 6; 46, 10; 48, 14; 51, 5;[2] 52, 12; 58, 3; 60, 3;[5] 66, 8; 69, 6;[2] 71, 3; 79, 3;[2] 80, 3; 92; 118, 4;[2] 122, 3; 123, 11, 14; 125; 133, 3; 144, 8. Against the Luciferians, 4. Perpetual Virginity of Mary, 6. Against Jovianus, B. 1, 3, 4, 12,[5] 26,[2] 35, 37[2], 40; B. 2, 16,[2] 18, 19, 25, 27,[4] 28,[2] 33, 37. To Pammachius against John of Jerusalem, 25, 34,[2] 36[4]. Against the Pelagians (Argument, p. 448), B. 1. 10,[4] 16, 31;[6] B. 2, 24, 25 (p. 471); B. 3, (6[2]), 15, 19[3] (*v.* note, p. 497). Illustrious Men, 5, (18). Apology, B. 1, 31; B. 2, 18.[6]

RUFINUS—Total, 23.

Epilogue to Pamphilus's Apology for Origen, pp. 423, 427. Pref. to Trans. of Origen's First Prins., 428. Apology (Introd., 434), B. 1, sec. 8, 16, 32, 34. On the Apos. Creed, 6, 7,[7] (14), 34[6] (*v.* note, p. 556), 39, 46.

SULPITIUS SEVERUS—Total, 12.

Life of St. Martin: Pref. to Desiderius, p. 3. Sacred Hist., B. 2, ch. 3. Letters: Ep. 1 (disputed), ch. 2, 6; Ep. 2, ch. 2, 4,[4] 5, 8.[2]

AUGUSTINE—Total, 1,310.

1. Early General Writings (174 references):

Soliloquies, B. 1, 3.[2] Confessions, B. 1, 16; B. 2, 2; B. 8, 1, 6; B. 11, 2;[2] B. 13, 12, 21. Christian Doctrine, B. 1, 19; B. 3, 3, 12, 17, 18, 25, 37; B. 4, 18. On the Catechising of the Uninstructed, 7, 17, 19, 20, 22, 24, 25. On the Creed, to Catechumens, 12.[2] On the Sermon on the Mount (in Vol. 6) (*v.* notes, pp. 3, 5, 6), B. 1, 1,[3] 2,[2] 3,[6] 4,[5] 6, 8,[13] 9,[6] 10, 12, 15,[6] 17, 18,[2] 19, 21, 23; B. 2, 4 (*v.* note, p. 38), 6,[5] 7,[2] 10,[2] 11,[3] 15,[4] 16,[18] 17,[5] 25.[8] On the Faith of Things not Seen, 5, 7, 9. On Lying, 36. On the Work of Monks, 2, 6,[3] 8,[2] 9, 13, 35, 36, 40. On Continence, 9, 20. On the Good of Marriage, 24,[2] 35. On Holy Virginity, 7, 9, 13, 14,[2] 19, 21, 22,[3] 23,[3] 24,[5] 25,[2] 26, 27, 29, 32,[2] 36,[2] 38, 47.

2. Anti-Manichæan (111 references):

On the Profit of Believing, 36. Morals of the Catholic Church, 17, 35. Morals of the Manichæans, (3), 5, 9, 12, 14. Faith and the Creed: In Retractations, ch. 10. On Two Souls, 12. Against Fortunatus, 1, 3,[3] 7, 17, 19, 21. Against the Ep. of Manichæus called Fundamental, 9,[2] 13, 24,[6] 25.[2] On the Nature of Good, 22, 48. Reply to Faustus, B. 2, 1, 6; B. 4, 1, 2,[4] 3;[5] B. 5, 9, 10; B. 6, 8;[2] B. 7, 2; B. 8, 2;[2] B. 10, 1, 3;[3] B. 11, 3, 7,[2] 8;[3] B. 12, (12[2]), 20, 32, 33, 42, 44;[3] B. 15, 2;[2] B. 16, 20, 22, 24,[3] 29; B. 17, 4;[4] B. 18, 7; B. 19, 8, 24, 27, 30;[4] (B. 20, 17;[2] B. 21, 14[2]); B. 22, 14, 17,[2] 41, 54,[2] 67, 76,[2] 80; B. 24, 1;[2] B. 28, 5; B. 30, 4; B. 33, 1,[6] 2.[2]

3. Anti-Donatist (79 references):

(Introd., pp. 383, 385, 392.) On Baptism, B. 2, 14;[2] B. 4, 4,[3] 5, 9,[2] 17,[2] 18,[7] 19,[9]

21,[8] 25; B. 5, 23; B. 6, 12,[8] 25, 43; B. 7, 54. Against the Letters of Petilian, B. 2, 8,[2] 23,[4] 43, 53, 55, 59, 61,[5] 63, 72, 73, 85[3] (*v.* note, p. 584), 97, 105,[3] 109; B. 3, 7, 56.[4] Correction of the Donatists, 1, (2).

4. Anti-Pelagian (243 references):
Introd., p. 61. On Forgiveness of Sins and Baptism, B. 1, 15,[2] 21,[2] 24,[3] 26,[4] 30,[5] 33,[2] 36,[2] 39, 42, 47, 55,[2] 58;[10] B. 2, 1,[2] 41,[6] 43, 57; B. 3, 6,[7] 21. On the Spirit and the Letter, 48. On Nature and Grace, 9,[2] 26. On Man's Perfection in Righteousness, 15. On the Proceedings of Pelagius, 11, 13,[3] 14,[7] 15,[7] 23,[2] 24,[2] 28,[3] 57,[2] 62,[3] 65.[2] On the Grace of Christ, B. 1, ch. 11, 32, 54. On Original Sin, B. 2, sec. 5, 12,[2] 19,[3] 20, 21,[2] 23, 29, 45. On Marriage and Concupiscence, B. 1, 22,[3] 38; B. 2, 5,[2] 8, 33,[2] 50, 51. On the Soul and its Origin, B. 1, 10,[6] 13, 33, 34; B. 2, 14,[8] 16,[5] 17,[4]18; B. 3, 15,[2] 16,[11] 17,[18] 19,[13] 22;[3] B. 4, 16, 38.[2] Against Two Letters of the Pelagians, B. 1, 11, 40;[2] B. 3, 14; B. 4, 21, 22,[2] 24, 28.[4] From Ep., 215, 1. On Rebuke and Grace, 5, 14, 18,[4] 34, 39, 40, 41, 42, 45. On the Predestination of the Saints, 17, 25, 34,[2] 40, 42.[4] On the Gift of Perseverance, 2, 5,[2] 6, 11, 27, 29,[4] 35, 37, 55, 58, 61.

5. The City of God (105 references):
(*V.* note, p. 1.) (*V.* B. 1, 36; B. 4, 2, *et saepe*). B. 4, 7, 28; B. 5, (16), 18, (19), 21, 24;[2] (B. 8, 24); B. 9, 21; B. 10, 32; (B. 11, 1; B. 12, 9); B. 13, 7; B. 14, (1), 2, (13, 28); B. 15, 1, (8, 18, 20, 26); B. 16, 24, 34; B. 17, 1,[2] 3, 4, 6,[2] 7,[2] 9,[3] 10, 12, 15, 16,[2] 17; B. 18, (1), 11, (29), 31,[4] 34,[2] (47), 49, 53; B. 19, (4, 5, 17); B. 20, 4, 7, 9,[21] 13,[2] (14, 16, 17), 23, 24; B. 21, 1,[2] 9,[2] 16, 23, 24,[2] 25,[10] 26,[2] 27;[4] B. 22, 1, 3,[3] (6), 12, 19,[3] 20, 23, 24,[3] 29, 30.

6. On the Psalms (169 references):
Ch. 2, 11; 7, 8, 14; 8, 2; 10, 3, 7; 11, 6; 12, 6; 14, 6, 8; 18, 16, 35; 22, 29;[2] 33, 10; 34, 1; 37, 10, Pt. 2, 13, Pt. 3, 5,[2] 10, 13; 38, 12; 39. 18; 40, 15; 41, 11; 43, 4; 44, 7, 13; 45, 12, 15,[2] 22; 47, 1, 10;[4] 49, 3, Pt. 2, 3; 50, 9,[2] 11, 13;[2] 51, 19; 52, 2,[3] 5,[2] 10,[6] 11; (53, 8); 54, 3; 55, 13; 57, 7, 12; 60, 2, 4; 61, (4), 7; 62, 4,[3] (9); 65, 1,[2] 9; 67, 8, 10;[5] 68, 4, 21, (37); 69, 2, 30; 72, 3, 11, 17,[2] (18); 63, 5, 26; 64, 6, 20, 21; 65, 11; 76, (1), 11; 77, 6; 78, 2, 3, 28, 29, 33, (37); 79, 2; 81, 19,[5] 20; 82, 4; 83, 2; 87, 4, 5;[2] 89, 35;[2] (91, 13); 92, 14; 94, 19, 23; 98, 8; (99, 11); 101, 2; 102, 2;[2] 103, 23;[2] 104, 20, 36; 105, 6; 106, 20, 32; 109, 1; 110, 5; 111, 5; 112, 3;[3] 113, 1; 119, 15, 75, 150, 159; (126, 2); 129, 6; 142, 5; 143, 8; 144, 9; 145, 1, 4, 10, 11,[12] 12,[5] 18; 146, 8;[2] 147, 8, 13, 21, 28; 149, 2, (3).

7. Later Miscellaneous Writings (429 references):
Letters, 29, 5;[3] 36,8; 43, 27; 44, 4, 10;[2] 76, 1; 78, 1; 91, 3; 93, 19, 22, 30, 48;[5] 102, 15, 19, 37; 130, 2,[3] 21,[2] 22; (137, 16); 148, 7; 164, 11; 166, 1; 167, 3; 189, 3, 5; 220, 8. Sermons on N. T. Lessons, 3, 1,[4] 6, 8,[3] 9, 10; 6, 6,[11] 7,[2] 9, 19;[2] 7, 5,[11] 6, 7, 12, 13;[2] 8, 3,[7] 5, 12;[2] 9, 4;[5] 10, 8, 9,[6] 10;[2] 12, 6,[5] 7; 16, 2;[5] 17, 7;[2] 21, (1), 2,[2] 4,[4] 19,[3] 20,[2] 25, (33), 36; 24, 1, 2,[2] 5;[3] 25, 9;[2] 27, 13,[4] 15; 28, 1,[5] 4; 30, 3, (8); 32, 5; 33, 1; 35, 2,[2] 5,[2] 7;[2] 36, 4, 10; 37, 4, 5; 38, 18, (19), 21; 40, 5; 50, 1,[2] 3; 53, 6; 55, 9,[2] (11), 13; 59, 1,[6] 2; 60, 1, 5;[4] 62, 5;[2] 63, 1; 64, 5; 75, 3; 76, 1; 77, 1, 13; 78, 11; 79, 5; 80, 4; 81, 6; 85, 8; 87, 2, 6, 7,[2] 9. On the Gospel of John: Tractate 3, 21; 4, 4, 13; (7, 21); 8, 12; 9, 15;[2] 11, 1,[2] 3, 5, 6, 12; 12, 5,[2] 8; 13, 2,[2] 11, 14; 14, 8; 16, 6;[2] 19, 18; 21, 7, 13, 25, 2,[9] 3, 19; 26, 7; 27, 12; 28, 9; 30, 7; 35, 7; 42, 10; 44, 6; 49, 12, 26; 50, 12; 51, 4; 52, 1; 55, 1;[3] 63, 2;[3] 64, 1; 67, 2,[2] 3;[7] 68, 2;[17] 73, 4;[2] 76, 3; 79, 2; 101, 4; 102, 3; 107, 2; 109, 4; 113, 2,[2]

5; 115, 1,[5] 2,[15] 3; 116, 1; 118, 4; 122, 2, 4, (7), 9;[11] 124, 5,[2] 7.[2] On the First Ep. of John, (1, 12); 2, 13; 3, 11; 4, 5; 6, 14[3] (*v.* note, p. 500); 9, 2,[2] 8; 10, 9, 10. On the Harmony of the Gospels, B. 1, 3, 35; B. 2, 4, 5,[2] 12,[4] 17, 19,[4] 30, (38), 41, 45, 56, 61,[2] 71, 73, 77; B. 3, 3,[2] 8, 22; B. 4, 10.[3] On the Trinity (in Vol. 3), B. 1, 8[9] (*v.* note, p. 26), 9, 10,[7] 11, 12, 13;[5] B. 2, 18;[5] B. 9, 10; B. 13, 15; B. 14, 19; B. 15, 18, 19. Enchiridion, (16), 21, 23, 30, 39,[2] 67,[2] 69,[2] 70, 80, 91,[2] 111, 112, 115,[2] 116. On the Good of Widowhood, 24. Against Lying, 24.[2] On Patience, 23, 24.

CASSIAN—Total, 71.

(*V.* note, p. 192.) Institutes, B. 4, 36, 38; B. 7, 15, 27; B. 12, 15. Conferences: First of Abbot Moses, 3, 4,[2] (5), 9,[3] 13,[14] 14,[2] 20. Second Conf., 2.[2] Of Paphnutius, 9; of Daniel, 10; of Serapion, 11.[2] First of Serenus, 5, 6. Second Conf., 14. First of Isaac, 19,[4] 29. Second Conf., 6, 11. First of Chæremon, 6, 12.[2] Third Conf., 11. First of Nesteros, 9,[2] (10). Second Conf., 3. Of Piamun, 16;[3] of Pinufius, 8,[2] 10. First of Theonas, 5,[2] 9. Third Conf., 15. Of Abraham, 26.[2] On the Incarnation, against Nestorius, B. 1, 3; B. 3, 12, 14;[2] B. 5, 7;[2] B. 7, 10, 23.

VINCENT—Total, 2.

A Comminitory, 6, 26.

LEO THE GREAT—Total, 29.

(*Cf.* Epp. 56 and 162.) Sermons, 3, 2, 3; 9, 2;[3] 10, 3; 19, 1; 21, 3; 22, 5;[2] 31, 2;[2] 33, 5;[2] 34, 2; 51, 2, 3; 54, 7; 61, 7; 66, 7; 70, 3; 73, 2; 82, 1; 90, 3; 95, 1, 2,[3] 5.

GREGORY THE GREAT—Total, 45.

Pastoral Rule, Pt. 1, 3, 9; Pt. 2, 3, 4; Pt. 3, 3, 15, 27,[2] 28. Letters: B. 1, 43,[2] 62, 77; B. 2, 27, 36, 47;[3] B. 3, 10, 65; B. 5, 18, 20,[2] 39; B. 6, 58; B. 7, 7, 26,[3] 30; B. 8, (2), 33; B. 9, 109, 120; B. 11, 29, 45, (46), 65,[2] 66; B. 13, 1, 6, 31,[2] 39,[2] 42.

(Total number of references, 3,974.)